THE JEWISH ANNOTATED NEW TESTAMENT
Second Edition
New Revised Standard Version Bible Translation
Amy-Jill Levine and Marc Zvi Brettler
Editors

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS
MESSIANIC JUDAISM

from the Father before all ages, light from light, true God from true God... one substance with the Father..."

The Council of Nicea in 325 did not end all debate concerning the nature of Jesus. In 451, the Council of Chalcedon confronted a new challenge presented by the Monophysites or Miaphysites, theologians who maintained that Jesus had an eternal "single nature"; they asserted that after his incarnation, no distinction could be made between his divinity and his humanity. The bishops at Chalcedon argued instead that Jesus had two natures which are both distinct and "without separation" in the "union" of the "one person" of Christ. Stated differently, if Christ is of one substance with the Father, and if he is one person, he is nonetheless a person whose nature consists in both his humanity and his divinity when these two natures work together to effect salvation.

THE TRINITY

Along with formalizing the relationship between Jesus' humanity and divinity, his postbiblical followers also required clarity on how the Logos or the Word of God (Jn 1:1; see "Logos," p. 688) is related to the Trinity, which includes God the Father, Christ the Son or Wor, and the Holy Spirit.

The Nicene Creed states:

We believe in one God, the Father, the Almighty, Maker of all that is, seen and unseen... We believe in one Lord, Jesus Christ, the only Son of God... We believe in the Holy Spirit, the Lord, the giver of life, who proceeds from the Father and the Son. With the Father and the Son he is worshipped and glorified. We believe in one Lord, Jesus Christ, the only Son of God, eternally begotten of the Father...[who] by the power of the Holy Spirit...was born of the Virgin Mary and became man.

The Hebrew word for "spirit" is ruah which also means breath. It comes into Greek, with the same connotations, as "pneuma" (Lat is "spiritus"). According to classical Christian thought, the Holy Spirit can be understood as the divine breath that animates God the Father who creates and God the Son who, made flesh, redeems persons from sin. The original form of the Nicene Creed states therefore, "we believe in the Holy Spirit...who proceeds from the Father." As the Nicene Creed also states that the Father and the Son and the Holy Spirit all share the same substance, some Christians claimed it would be more accurate to say that the Holy Spirit proceeds from both the Father and the Son. A number of Christian churches in the West, as early as the sixth century, therefore added the phrase "and the Son" (Lat fideique) to the creed. Eastern Orthodox Christians, opposing this addition, argued that the Father is the sole source of being in the Trinity. Disagreement over the fideique clause constituted one of several causes for what would be an eventual division in Christianity between the Eastern (Byzantine) and Western (Roman) churches, finalized in the Great Schism in 1054.

Throughout their history, Christians have disagreed on christological details, and these disagreements continue today. The Trinity, in its classical formulation of "essences" and "persons," remains difficult to comprehend, so alternative formulations have been offered. One modern way of thinking about Trinity is to describe its members as having different job descriptions: God the Father is the Creator; God the Son is the Redeemer, and God the Spirit is the Sustainer. In turn, the Church of the Latter-day Saints or Mormons categorically rejects the classical doctrine of the trinity. In Mormon teaching, the Trinity consists of three distinct beings, with the Father and the Son having separate, tangible bodies. Unitarians, on the other hand, traditionally regard Jesus as the "son" or "child" of God (like every other human being), but not as God.

For centuries, Christological questions surrounding Jesus' humanity, his divinity, the nature and meaning of his death and of eternal life, have drawn Christians into deep theological reflection. The great fourth-century Christian theologian St. Jerome said, "the springs that water the church are the mystery of the Trinity [and] the mystery of Christology" (sermon on Ps 41). The ongoing attempt to understand the meaning of these mysteries presents Christians the opportunity to continue to ponder the wisdom of God's ways.

MESSIANIC JUDAISM

Yaakov Ariel

Messianic Judaism is a new religious movement that combines faith in Jesus as Lord and Savior with Jewish identity and culture. There had been earlier attempts in

the late modern era at creating communities of Jewish Christians, such as the Hope of Israel in the Lower East Side of New York in the 1980s–1990s. But while cherishing such forerunners, today's Messianic Jews see them-
Messianic Jews generally promote the conservative lifestyle associated with Evangelical Christianity, including abstinence from drugs, alcohol, and premarital sex, and encouraging hard work and obeying the secular law. Perhaps the most well-known of the groups emerging in early 1970s is Jews for Jesus, another Evangelical-Jewish group that should not be confused with Messianic Judaism, despite some similarities between these groups. Both appeal to members of the counterculture and both have made extensive use of Jewish symbols and language. Jews for Jesus, however, has been a missionary organization whose founder, Moishe Rosen (1932–2010), related skeptically to the Messianic Jewish movement. He asked his missionaries to join non-Jewish churches and to direct inquirers and converts to such churches.

Another movement that carries resemblance to Messianic Judaism is that of the Hebrew Catholics. The movement, which operates within the confines of the Catholic Church, is much smaller; it does not operate parish churches outside of Israel, and the community makes itself known through publications, the internet, and periodical conferences. In Israel, Hebrew Catholic congregations include Jewish Israeli converts as well as non-Jews who have joined those congregations, at times as spouses of Jewish members. Hebrew Catholics follow Catholic liturgy, but they also have written their own prayers that bring Catholic elements of faith together with Israeli culture, such as Hebrew hymns for Miriam HaMevurahat, "the blessed Miriam [Mary]." Recognizing the movement, the Vatican created in 2011 the Vicariate of St. James to offer Hebrew congregations in Israel a friendly Catholic hierarchical presence.

The appearance of an energetic and fast-growing movement that promised to combine Judaism and Christianity stirred strong reactions from the mainstream Jewish and Christian establishments. Most Jews did not accept the claim that one could embrace Jesus as Lord and savior and still remain within Judaism. Some considered the new movement to be a missionary ploy intended to lure Jews away from their ancestral faith. Others looked upon Messianic Judaism as a harmful cult. On rare occasions Jews turned to violence against Messianic Jews by defacing their sanctuaries or by "rescuing" Torah scrolls from their congregations. At the turn of the twenty-first century, many Jews continue to feel negatively about Messianic Jews, with a small number of leaders and writers, such as the author and Reform Rabbi Dan Cohn-Sherbok, who call upon Jews to accept Messianic Jews as part of the larger Jewish community. The Israeli Ministry of the Interior has, at times, made it difficult for Messianic Jewish immigrants, or their spouses, to become residents or citizens of the state.

ESSAYS | 757
MESSIANIC JUDAISM

Liberal Protestants generally have also expressed reservations about Messianic Judaism. By the late twentieth century they had adopted a new agenda consisting of interfaith dialogue and of understanding Judaism as a sister faith; therefore, they did not promote the evangelization of Jews. Reflecting their dissatisfaction with certain conservative Evangelical tenets, they similarly objected to Messianic Judaism's theology, interpretation of Scripture, and support for right-wing politics.

For the most part, Evangelical Christians accept and support Messianic Jews. As a rule, Evangelicals do not promote interfaith dialogue, and their acceptance of Messianic Judaism points to an alternative measure of recognition of the Jewish tradition. Messianic Judaism turned, in effect, into a Jewish wing of Evangelical Christianity. Similarly, Evangelicals began to allow other hybrids in their midst, most notably Evangelical Greek Orthodoxy and an amalgamation of evangelicalism with Native American traditions. When the Evangelical group, the Promise Keepers, launched a major rally in Washington, D.C., in 1997, two groups of Evangelicals who participated in the rally were particularly visible: Messianic Jews dressed with tallit (prayer shawls) and holding shofarot (rams' horns), and a Native American group dressed in traditional attire decorated with Native American symbols.

Most Messianic Jews embrace the major premises of Evangelical theology, first and foremost the tenet that all people need to undergo a personal experience of conversion and accept Jesus as their personal Savior. Non-supersessionist and believing that the Jewish people can be redeemed as a nation, they generally see special merit in sharing the Gospel with fellow Jews, instructing them in how to read the Bible and decipher God's plans for Jews, including their coming to belief in Jesus. Messianic Jews study both the Old and New Testaments, which they regard as both historically accurate and prophetically revealing. Sharing the premillennialist-Evangelical view that prior to the return of Jesus to establish the kingdom of God on earth, the Jewish people (that is, the chosen people) are destined to play a dominant role in the events of the End Times, and that the country of Israel has a purpose in history, they have served within the large conservative Christian community as advocates of good will toward the Jews.

While the founders of Messianic Judaism adhered to Evangelical principles, it was also important for them to establish congregations independent of Christian denominations or missionary societies, such as the American Board of Missions to the Jews, aimed at converting Jews to Protestant denominations. Coming to appreciate the success of such communities in promoting conversions of Jews to Evangelical Christianity, missionary societies have helped, since the 1980s, to create self-standing Messianic Jewish congregations. Such congregations serve as natural centers of evangelism as members invite friends to attend services, and curious observers also come by. Ironically, Messianic congregations have served not only as centers of evangelism for Jews, but for non-Jews as well. For the non-Jews, the spiritual journey has been toward Judaism, or, as has also been the case for many of the Jews in Messianic communities, toward Judaism and Christianity at the same time. By the turn of the twenty-first century, the majority of Messianic Jews had not grown up in Jewish homes, even if many of them claim some Jewish ancestry or are married to persons of Jewish descent.

Opening their doors to inquirers of all backgrounds, the movement has grown significantly. The turn of the twenty-first century saw more than 400 Messianic communities in America and over 100 in Israel, with dozens more in Europe, Latin America, South Africa, and Australia. Tens of thousands of people are members of Messianic congregations, and tens of thousands more consider themselves Messianic Jews, or Jewish believers in Jesus, even if they are members of mainstream, non-Messianic churches. In contrast to the demographics of traditional Jewish synagogues, the Messianic communities have consisted mostly of persons of the Baby Boom generation and younger, who came of age in the 1960s and later. A second generation of Messianic Jews is beginning to make an impact in a growing number of congregations.

Despite common features, the movement is neither united nor uniform. As is the case among Evangelicals in general, one of the major divisions is between Charismatics, who advocate a direct personal encounter with the divine, and practice more expressive modes of worship (for instance, being “slain in the spirit,” and services for miraculous healing), and non-Charismatics. Most of the early congregations chose to become Charismatic, but many of the ones established by the primarily non-Charismatic missionary societies shy away from such practices. Messianic congregations also reflect a broad spectrum in terms of Jewish traditional observance. Different Messianic congregations have different amalgams of Jewish and Christian liturgical elements. Messianic Haqqadot (Passover services) and sidurim (prayer books) include some elements of the traditional Jewish liturgy, making up for omitted passages, such as the traditional haftarah (prophetic reading), or Mafas (the supplementary morning prayer), with prayers that give expression to faith in Jesus as the Redeemer. The Birchat ha-Minim (the twelfth benediction of the Amidah), which has often been interpreted as relating unfavorably to Christians (see "Birchat ha-Minim," p. 653), is also omitted.

The movement has increasingly incorporated Jewish rites, artifacts, and symbols. Messianic congregations
also expressed res-
ly the late twentieth-
ness Evangelical
\textit{mining Judaism as a slen-
tume the evangeliza-
tion with certainty
iely objected 
_Script-
1 Christians accept 
<ul>, Evangelicals do 
end their acceptance 
measure on. Messianic Juda-
king of Evangelical 
Evan
<\textit{gicalism with \textit{Evangelical group, 
}\textit{or rally in Washing-
\textit{Gallipoliicible: Messianic Jews 
holding \textit{shafarot 
group dressed in tra-
American symbols.
\textit{major premises of the tenet that all 
experience of conver-
\textit{nal Savior. Non-
people can be 
\textit{see special merit in 
\textit{structing them in 
God's plans for Jews, 
\textit{esus. Messianic Jews 
\textit{ents, which they re- 
\textit{prophetically reveal-
\textit{al view that pri-
\textit{kingdom of God 
\textit{chosen people) are 
\textit{he events of the End 
\textit{a purpose in history, 
\textit{onservative Christian 
\textit{oward the Jews.
\textit{ Judaism adhered to 
\textit{ontant for them to 
\textit{ of Christian denom-
\textit{ as the American 
\textit{erting Jews to 
\textit{ecrate the conver-
\textit{ion societies as 
\textit{self-standing Mes-

\textit{slanic Jewish congregations. Such congregations serve as 
\textit{centers of evangelism as members invite friends to 
\textit{end services, and curious observers also come by \textit{ron.
\textit{Messianic congregations have served not only as 
\textit{ters of evangelism for Jews, but for non-Jews as well.
\textit{For the non-Jews, the spiritual journey has been toward 
\textit{udaism, or, as has also been the case for many of the Jews 
\textit{Messianic communities, toward Judaism and Christian-
\textit{ony at the same time. By the turn of the twenty-first cen-
\textit{ury, the majority of Messianic Jews had not grown up in 
\textit{ewish homes, even if many of them claim some Jewish 
\textit{ehy ancestry or are married to persons of Jewish descent.

Opening their doors to inquirers of all backgrounds, the 
\textit{ovement has grown significantly. The turn of the 
\textit{entury saw more than 400 Messianic communities 
\textit{America and over 100 in Israel, with dozens 
\textit{Europe, Latin America, South Africa, and Australia.
\textit{Tens of thousands of people are members of Messian-
\textit{ic congregations, and tens of thousands more consider 
\textit{hemselves Messianic Jews, or Jewish believers in Jesus, 
\textit{en if they are members of mainstream, non-Messianic 
\textit{urches. In contrast to the demographics of traditional 
\textit{ewish synagogues, the Messianic communities have 
\textit{esisted mostly of persons of the Baby Boom gener-
\textit{on and younger, who came of age in the 1960s and later.
\textit{Second generation of Messianic Jews is beginning to 
\textit{ake an impact in a growing number of congregations.

Despite common features, the movement is neither 
\textit{e unied nor uniform. As is the case among Evangelicals in 
\textit{eneral, one of the major divisions is between Char-
\textit{ismatic, who advocate a direct personal encounter with the 
\textit{ivine, and practice more expressive modes of wor-
\textit{ship (for instance, being "slain in the spirit," and services for 
\textit{miraculous healing), and non-Charismatic. Most of 
\textit{he early congregations chose to become Charismatic, but 
\textit{any of the ones established by the primarily non-
\textit{hristian missionary societies shy away from such 
\textit{actices. Messianic congregations also reflect a broad 
\textit{pectrum in terms of Jewish traditional observance. Dif-
\textit{erent Messianic congregations have different 
\textit{lamas of Jewish and Christian liturgical elements. Messianic 
\textit{aggadot (Passover services) and 
\textit{ikkarim (prayer books) 
\textit{clude some elements of the traditional Jewish liturgy, 
\textit{aking up for omitted passages, such as the traditional 
\textit{azarah (prophetic reading), or Musaf (the 
\textit{plementary morning prayer), with prayers that give expression 
\textit{ faith in Jesus as the Redeemer. The 
\textit{rkha ha-Minim (the twelfth benediction of the Amidah), which has often 
\textit{een interpreted as relating unfavorably to Christians 
(see "\textit{rkha ha-Minim," p. 623), is also omitted.

The movement has increasingly incorporated Jewish 
\textit{rites, artifacts, and symbols. Messianic congregations 
\textit{onduct their weekly prayer meetings on Friday nights or 
\textit{aturday mornings, and they often ask their male mem-
\textit{ers and guests to wear yarmulkes during the services.
\textit{ore and more congregations have installed Arks with 
\textit{or Schiffs, and they read each week a passage from the 
\textit{ara, the Jewish lectionary. Messianic Jews have also 
\textit{orporated Israeli motifs into their services, including 
\textit{raeli songs and the usage of Modern Hebrew. Their 
\textit{tachment to Israel indicates both their devotion to Jewish 
\textit{auses and the premillenial-Evangelical understanding 
of the role of that country and land in God's plans.

While struggling to be accepted as both genuinely 
\textit{ewish and Christian, Messianic Judaism built its own 
\textit{ubricate, complete with national organizations, youth 
\textit{ovements, conferences and retreats, prayer books and 
\textit{ymals, publications and periodicals, including Messian-
\textit{ic Jewish theological, apologetic and evangelistic treatises. 
\textit{ay Messianic hymns resemble contemporary Evangelical 
oes, and the music is unmistakably rock-influenced 
\textit{ew Christian music; most hymns written and composed 
\textit{y Messianic Jews refer to Jesus as the Savior of Israel. 
\textit{ll but significant changes differentiate Messianic 
\textit{yns from contemporary Evangelical hymns, such as the 
\textit{use of Yeshua (the Heb name for Jesus) instead of "Jesus."

Messianic Bar Miztvahs have become very popular. Em-
\textit{acing this major Jewish social institution has served as a 
\textit{atement that Messianic Jews practice Jewish culture. The 
\textit{eremonies follow traditional Jewish rites such as chanting 
\textit{ara according to traditional melodies, but instead of 
\textit{he conventional haftarah (prophetic reading), the 
\textit{ar Miztvah boys often read from the New Testament. The 
\textit{ara, the customary sermon, is turned into a public declara-
\textit{on that affirms Messianic Jewish faith and identity.

Messianic Jewish thinkers have produced a series of 
\textit{eological tracts that define the movement's path. In 
\textit{accordance with the plurality of communal and liturgical 
\textit{ptions within the movement, their work has given voice 
\textit{ a large spectrum of opinions. Most writers are unified 
\textit{aiming the antiquity of their movement, and they 
\textit{ote that the earliest Christians were Jews; thus, in their 
\textit{iew Messianic Judaism is the more authentic form of 
\textit{ristianity. David Stern, a leader in the Messianic Jewish 
\textit{ovement in America and Israel, edited a Messianic Jew-
\textit{ New Testament. He charged the title of the 
\textit{pistle to the Hebrews to Letter to the Messianic Jews. In his Messianic 
\textit{ellowship, Stern asserts that Messianic Jews are not 
\textit{ifty percent Jewish and fifty percent Christian, but rather 
\textit{undred percent Jewish and hundred percent Christian.

The early twenty-first century is seeing a new gener-
\textit{on of Messianic Jewish intellectuals with new interpreta-
\textit{ons of the movement. Completing doctoral degrees in 
\textit{igious American, British, or Israeli universities, and 
\textit{cting in increasingly pluralistic Evangelical environments, they 
\textit{ave developed a more daring theology. For example, 
\textit{ershon Nerel in Israel is advocating relying solely on the 
\textit{ible (both "\textit{old" and "\textit{New Testament" as a source of au-
\textit{ority, instead of Protestant theological constructions or 
\textit{clarations of faith. In a movement called Post-
\textit{issionary Messianic Judaism, Mark Kenzer advocates cutting the 
\textit{ord that has tied Messianic Judaism to the missionary 
\textit{nunity, and moving from Protestant theology to Jewish post-
\textit{iblical sources. Unlike the more familiar Jews for Jesus, 
\textit{ome members of Post-Missionary Messianic Judaism do not 
\textit{ist that one needs to believe in Jesus as Lord in order to 
\textit{e saved or in a right relationship with God. Kenzer and 
\textit{is group, Hashemru (Heb "\textit{bring us back"), have created an 
\textit{line Yeshiva to offer Messianic Jewish education as well 
as a series of publications and yearly conferences. While 
\textit{ommitted to the basic elements of Evangelical theology 
\textit{nd devoted to Jewish identity and heritage, Messianic 
\textit{ews are now becoming more autonomous, creating 
\textit{eological and communal spaces of their own.

\textbf{BEARING FALSE WITNESS: COMMON ERRORS MADE ABOUT EARLY JUDAISM}

\textbf{Amy-Jill Levine}

There are numerous ecclesial guidelines for Christian 
\textit{ergy and teachers on how to present Jews and Judaism. 
\textit{hese include the Commission for Religious Relations 
\textit{ith the Jews, "Notes on the Correct Way to Present the 
\textit{ews and Judaism in Preaching and Catechesis and 
\textit{roman Catholic Church" (1988); US Catholic Bishops and the 
\textit{nti-Defamation League, "Within Context: Guidelines for the 
\textit{atechmatical Presentation of Jews and Judaism in the 
\textit{ew Testament (1986, updated 1993); National Conference of 
\textit{atholic Bishops, "God's Mercy Endures Forever: Guide-
\textit{ines on the Presentation of Jews and Judaism in Catholic

\textit{ESSAYS | 739