

South University

**Veterans in Messianic Judaism:
An Examination of Transition
From Military to Civilian Life**

A Dissertation Submitted to
The Faculty of Theology
In Candidacy for the Degree of
Doctor of Ministry

By
David H Daugherty

Savannah, Georgia

June 2018

blank page

VETERANS IN MESSIANIC JUDAISM:

AN EXAMINATION OF TRANSITION

FROM MILITARY TO CIVILIAN LIFE

A dissertation
Presented in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree
Doctor of Ministry

by

David H. Daugherty

APPROVAL:

Carl B. Smith II Digitally signed by Carl B. Smith II
Date: 2018.06.22

12:06:01 -04'00'

Dissertation Advisor and Program Director:
Carl B. Smith II, Ph.D.

Robert R. Redman, Jr. Digitally signed by Robert R. Redman, Jr.
Date: 2018.06.22

12:19:05 -04'00'

Dean of the College:

Robert R. Redman, Jr., Dr. theol.

Christine Leclerc-Sherling, PhD Digitally signed by Christine Leclerc-Sherling, PhD Date:
2018.06.26 13:45:16

External Reader:

Christine Leclerc-Sherling, Ph.D.

South University Campus: Savannah, GA

Date: June 29, 2018

Dedication

To U.S. Army Chaplain, Cantor David Frommer, who took time to publicly consider the authenticity and faith of Messianic Jewish service members.

This mission was given to non-Jews [to fulfill their purpose as light to the world through observance of God's commandments] at the giving of the Torah, at that historic moment when God broke the barrier between heaven and earth and he commanded the Jews as well and empowered them to influence all mankind to fulfill their obligations; indeed, these laws are not secondary, rather they lie at the heart of all civilized life, God's vision for creation. Thus, one can appreciate the critical nature and great reward of their observance, 'God does not withhold the reward of any creature.' How much more so for man who is created in his image. It likewise follows that when a non-Jew carries out his mission, he must do so to the best of his individual ability, and to his full capacity. It further follows that every Jew is obligated to teach these laws to non-Jews—to those who are not fully informed of them as well to those who know nothing of them at all. This is an essential component of a Jew's life task and personal wholeness, and of the completion of the world. The creation will only be complete when "I shall call out to all nations to serve God with single purpose."¹

¹ Rabbi Menachem Mendel Schneerson.

Acknowledgments

I am deeply grateful to the people who participated in the work of this dissertation, including the participants who gave of themselves for the benefit of others, faculty of South University College of Theology, and the outside professionals who contributed their insights and abilities to the quality of this work. I am grateful for the standards of the process upheld by Dr. Carl B. Smith, and the echoes he made of my first graduate professor, Dr. Chris Seiple. My co-researchers, Colonel (Retired) Ann Johnson, LCSW and Rabbi John Schutz, MDiv, were indispensable. Finally, I must extend my appreciation to those who dedicated their lives to ministry and contributed to forging my Jewish worldview, Rabbi Doctor John Fischer, Rabbi David Levine, Paula Jones, Bishop Neil Lebhar and Reverend Bill Driscoll. Special thanks to Soldier Ride© for inadvertently facilitating my adult bar mitzvah at the Kotel.

Abstract

This dissertation focuses on military veterans in the Messianic Movement to determine whether integration of their faith enhanced their transition into civilian life. The hypothesis agrees with the purpose, yet identifies factors that may impede faith, such as the presence of trauma. The study also indicates that more trauma may lead to more ambiguity in how veterans define their faith.

The coming of age of the Messianic Movement has led to cultivation of young leaders who bring the values of their generation, including a drive for social change and justice. To help meet the needs of addressing these issues in congregational settings comprehensive pastoral care models are needed. This study examines the history of psychological care in military culture and solution-focused approaches that do not conflict with Messianic Jewish theology. The theology considers the nature of sin, and God's war against it through the nature of his Son, Messiah Yeshua. Correlations are drawn between Messianic Jewish theology and character of Yeshua with traits and behaviors of veterans in Messianic communities.

The theological development, psychological literature review, and comprehensive case conceptualizations of three volunteer veteran participants further integrate correlations to derive a suggested approach to pastoral care. That approach includes deep listening and comprehensive case conceptualization in a solution-focused atmosphere. This was derived from the veteran participants who underwent a narrative interview process and three measured evaluation instruments that covered the importance of their sense of purpose, presence of trauma, and religious identity. All three cases were then examined by a Licensed Clinical Social Worker and a Messianic Jewish Rabbi for the development of mental health and theological summaries respectively.

The information was then synthesized for commonalities to derive actionable information and strategies for faith-based counselors and clergy working with veterans in the congregational setting. Some of the findings included observations of veteran's circumstances and how they affect the defining nature of their faith. Behaviors associated with deep-seated faith resulting from profound military experiences that are also clouded by trauma. Also observed were inherent coping skills to major life challenges concomitant with morals and values that veterans in the study adhere to as their reason to live.

CONTENTS

Dedication	ii
Acknowledgements	iii
Abstract	iv

Part I: Moses to Chomsky as Resources in Veteran Culture

Chapter 1. Introducing the Convergence of Messianic Judaism and Veteran Culture	1
Chapter 2. A Messianic Jewish Theology of Veteran Culture	23
Chapter 3. Applications of Psychology and Spirituality in Veteran Culture	58

Part II: An Examination of Three Veterans in Messianic Communities

Chapter 4. Mixed Methods: Psychospiritual Examination of Faith and Identity	108
Chapter 5. Results of Psychospiritual Examination	131
Chapter 6. Discussion of Examination Outcomes	175

Bibliography	203
Appendix	215
Curriculum Vita	217

Part I: Moses to Chomsky as Resources in Veteran Culture

CHAPTER 1.	Introducing a Culture of Veterans in Messianic Judaism	
	The Convergence.....	1
	Purpose of the Research.....	6
	Background	9
	Guiding Research and Reason for the Study.....	10
	Overview of the Dissertation.....	14
	Definition of Terms.....	17
	Limitations and Delimitations of the Study.....	18
	Significance of the Study.....	19
CHAPTER 2.	A Messianic Jewish Theology of Veteran Culture	
	The Foundation.....	23
	Biblical-Historical Analysis and the Division of Messianic Judaism from Mainstream Judaism and Christianity.....	24
	The Challenges of Messianic Judaism in the Era.....	34
	Contemporary Messianic Jewish Identity as Theology.....	37
	Messianic Judaism and Its Distinction from Rabbinic Judaism and Christianity.....	42
	A Note on Language and Context.....	43
	Yeshua: The Hebrew Name of a Jewish Messiah to all Nations.....	46
	Servant, Son of David.....	47
	Following the Warrior Yeshua.....	48
	Enemies: Nahash ha-Kadmoni (the Serpent) and Yetzer hara (Evil Inclination)	49
	Servant, Son of Man.....	53

Messiah promised, Yeshua delivered.....	56
Conclusion.....	56

CHAPTER 3. Applications of Psychology and Spirituality in Veteran Culture

The Evolution.....	58
Veterans’ Mental Health and Combat Trauma.....	60
Military Culture/Ethnography and its Implications.....	61
Ethnographic Respect.....	66
Veteran Health Issues and the Benefit to Society.....	72
The Voice of Veterans and Self-Advocacy.....	73
Medical Models: Physical Combat Trauma Treatment.....	74
Medical Models: History of Psychological Combat Trauma.....	77
Meaning-Making Models: with Concurrent Moral Injury.....	79
Meaning-Making Models: Identify Moral Injury through Deep Listening.....	84
Identifying who Carries Moral Injury to Facilitating Meaningful Purpose.....	86
Meaning-centered Counseling and the Basis of Faith.....	91
Blending Approaches to Achieve Posttraumatic Growth.....	98
Blending Approaches to Achieve Post-Traumatic Growth: A Consideration.....	99
Blending Approaches to Achieve Post-Traumatic Growth: An Application.....	102
Review.....	105

Part II: An Examination of Three Veterans in Messianic Communities

CHAPTER 4. Mixed Methods: Psychospiritual Examination of Faith and Identity

Research Topic..... 108

Introduction: Theology and Psychology..... 108

Research Design 109

Population and sampling procedures 112

Instrumentation 115

Narrative Interviews 119

Assumptions and limitations 121

Permissions Used in the Study 127

First contact with participants 128

Instructions and materials used in the study 128

CHAPTER 5. Results and Analysis of Psychospiritual Examination

Introduction 131

The Hypothesis Tested 131

Procedure 133

Participants and Demographic Variables 134

Consent and Risk Mitigation 135

Protection of Participant’s Personal Information 137

Co-Researchers 137

Interview One: J 138

Interview One: Clinical Social Worker Summary of J 138

Interview One: Rabbinic Summary of J 142

J: Narrative Synthesis by Primary Researcher 146

J: Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q) 147

J: Davidson Trauma Scale 147

J: Bell Religious Identity Measure	148
J: Concluding Observation by Primary Researcher	149
Interview Two: S	150
Interview Two: Clinical Social Worker Summary of S	150
Interview Two: Rabbinic Summary of S	152
J: Narrative Synthesis by Primary Researcher	156
J: Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q)	157
J: Davidson Trauma Scale	157
J: Bell Religious Identity Measure	158
S: Concluding Observation by Primary Researcher	159
Interview Three: M	160
Interview Three: Clinical Social Worker Summary of M	161
Interview Three: Rabbinic Summary of M	164
M: Narrative Synthesis by Primary Researcher	171
M: Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q)	172
M: Davidson Trauma Scale	172
M: Bell Religious Identity Measure	173
M: Concluding Observation by Primary Researcher	174
Conclusion	174

CHAPTER 6.

Discussion of Examination Outcomes

Chapter Review.....	175
Interview Discussions: J.....	176
Interview Discussions: S.....	178
Interview Discussions: M.....	179
Accessing co-researchers and participants.....	180
Discussion of Narrative Interview Process.....	181
Discussion of Meaning in Life Questionnaire.....	185

Status Measure: The Davidson Trauma Survey.....	188
Discussion of Avoidance, and the Nature of Trauma.....	191
Discussion of Bell Religious Identity Measure.....	193
Further Discussion: Application and conceptual use of BRIM with Veterans.....	194
Toward Conclusion.....	195
Implications for Ministry Practice and Recommendations for Implementation.....	197
Overall Finding of Research Topic.....	198
Indications for Further Research.....	200
BIBLIOGRAPHY	203
APPENDIX	215
CURRICULUM VITA	217

PERMISSION

I, the author of the above abstract, hereby give permission to the ATLA Index Board to edit and publish the above abstract and to use it in any information system with which the Index is affiliated. In addition, I certify that I have not assigned or granted my right to apply for a copyright, if any, in the above abstract.

Signed: _____ Date: _____

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCING A CULTURE OF VETERANS IN MESSIANIC JUDAISM

The Convergence

The greatest impartation comes when God manifests Himself -His very Person- to us and dwells within us and upon us and flows out from us to others! The result is a tangible change in our circumstances, and as a consequence we obtain supernatural breakthroughs to fulfill our calling, destiny, and purpose while on planet Earth.²

This research is rooted in my own experiences in Messianic Judaism, in service in the military, and in a search for identity. This began at a very early age. Joining the military was a first step in this search and was one of the first life-directing choices I made as an adult. At the time, I was very focused on external components of identity. I was certain that the more impressive my uniform, the stronger my forging of outward identity. This seemed to be of utmost importance to me as a young man.

Over the course of my career in Special Forces, two profound influences turned my personal growth process focus inward. First was the sure-footed identity of the men I served with, who had become Green Berets for altruistic reasons. They were servant-warrior-diplomats who believed in the Special Forces motto - *de oppresso libre* (“To Free the Oppressed”). Second was the vast array of culture’s I was exposed to, particularly in the Middle East and Southwest

² Warren Marcus, *The Priestly Prayer of the Blessing: The Ancient Secret of the Only Prayer in the Bible Written by God Himself* (Lake Mary, FL: Charisma House, 2018), 36. Kindle

Asia. Among those cultural experiences were rudimentary exposures to other forms of language including non-linear languages and their sentence structure's that differ from Latin-based languages.

My exposure to foreign cultures and languages led to the realization that modular linguistics (like Hebrew and Arabic) are reflective of cognitive processing very different than western, linear thought process. This is reflected in word order. My knowledge of these concepts began to take hold in my own behaviors when confronted with my own transition from military life and the subsequent need to heal from trauma and addiction.

Without the vocational identity as a Special Forces soldier, and unsure of what to do with my experiences, I turned to my Creator and began to consider the significance of his relationship with the Jewish people. I felt a strong correlation between my faith in Jesus, his life as a Jew, and my own Jewish family heritage. I was aware of a prominent Messianic Synagogue nearby and began attending while watching for miraculous manifestations of adherence to the Jewish traditions practiced there. I experienced several.

The first miracle I experienced was the temporary cessation of struggle in early recovery from trauma and addiction during Shabbat (Saturday). As a result, I became keenly aware that God honors his own sabbath and was making it possible for me to practice the fourth commandment as it is written in Tanakh (Old Testament). Second was what felt like God's personal attentiveness to me as I experienced corporate worship in Hebrew language and Jewish context. The concurrent experience of reprieve on Shabbat and the profound meanings in Jewish worship affected the direction and impact of my personal growth. These experiences led to insights in posttraumatic growth (discussed in chapter three) to the extent of remarkable recognition by mental health professionals and clergy alike. My underlying motive for engaging

spiritual resources that led to profound posttraumatic growth was the need for a deep sense of authentic identity. This led to another outward facing crisis in identity related to the “middle way” of Messianic Judaism and its place between mainstream Judaism and Christianity.

One impactful relationship in those early days of my Messianic development was with a Jewish Christian. He was Jewish by descent and chose the outward expression of his faith as an Anglican bishop. He was keen to insert Jewish historical and cultural context to studies of New Testament passages, which taught me the significance of that while also delineating individual choice between Jewish and Christian expressions of faith (such as his personal adherence to Anglicanism). Concurrently, I was able to observe gentiles who joined Messianic Jewish congregations and began practicing traditional expressions of Jewish faith by wearing certain kinds of clothing (such as women covering their heads and men wearing *tzitzit*) and speaking in Hebrewisms as a linguistic expression of their faith. While observing these contrasting expressions of the same faith in Yeshua as Messiah and the Son of God, I contemplated motive and the element of choice. I determined that my own expression of faith leaned Jewish but was more aligned with an internal quest for identity as to the constructs of my heart, mind, and soul. Thus, I began my fusion of military and Jewish identity to be manifested in my own purpose determined to impact the world at large.

At this point I began to be inspired by a turning point in modern Messianic Judaism where professors, rabbis, and elders were passing the torch of responsibility to millennials who had been raised in Messianic Jewish homes. The previous generation had invested their lives from as early as the 1950's to present days in scholarly work, building congregations, and organizing unions and alliances for the future of the Movement. My own role as a formal *talmid* (disciple) juxtaposed between these first-generation leaders and the millennials being groomed

for leadership was to quietly observe. I witnessed a tangible change in direction of the Movement that preserved the explorations of theology and Jewish cultural identity developed by previous leadership, to applying these concepts to what was important to the millennials, which was largely personal wellness and social justice. For example, as young leaders began taking responsibility for various annual conferences, new kinds of lectures and workshops emerged from inner healing prayer, trauma and addiction recovery, to awareness of human trafficking.

By this time, I had completed a year of *yeshiva* studies (Jewish version of seminary) and was a graduate student in marriage and family counseling. I was encountering experiences as a middle-generation participant with leadership experience from the military and looking for how I could contribute to the needs within the transformation that Messianic Judaism was undergoing. I recognized a need for pastoral development while also recognizing my unusual perspective as a veteran. These facts, combined with my personal growth and development, led me to determine the importance of my expression as a Messianic Jew. My faith and identity would be expressed through my choices and actions, with less need for extrinsic recognition as a Jew. This was a personal choice based on my underlying motives for self-awareness and my place in the Messianic Jewish community and was not based on any sort of opinion on what others should and should not do. I tend to believe that this is a trait derived from military culture that is reflected in further study in chapters five and six.

I determined that my expression as a Jew would include unique contributions to the Messianic and veteran communities and the world at large. These contributions would include development of a pastoral counseling model focused for Messianic congregations with information also useful to the world at large. My observation of the Jewish bishop and the sacrifices of senior Messianic leaders demonstrated to me how they had made decisions within

themselves. These were examples of leaders who made internal decisions regarding who they are and how those decisions affected the world around them. The bishop's ethnographic understanding of Jewish history and culture had profound impact on the Christian community he served. The Messianic leaders dedicated their entire lives to building and preserving modern Messianic Judaism for future generations. These were choices they all made from within themselves that became outward expressions of faith and identity while cultivating their sense of belonging. In comparison, I sought the genetic connection to my Jewish lineage without releasing my faith in Yeshua as my Messiah. I also kept my awareness that that intense military training and immersion in Middle Eastern and Asian cultures played a role in impacting my identity. I therefore determined these did indeed contribute to my authentic identity and should be leveraged in service to God. As a veteran, my need for a mission was profound, and I found one that served my intrinsic need for a developed sense of identity and an extrinsic need to impact the world.

My self-discoveries in identity development and the usefulness of Messianic Judaism in the context of identity, culture, and relating to God became a vocational pursuit. Through internships in pastoral settings and nonprofit organizations, as well as public speaking and counseling in problem-solving courts, I discovered that existential purpose became a solution for many kinds of people and central to posttraumatic growth, but that service members and veterans particularly engaged this type of problem-solving. I was blessed to assist the process through talk therapy, and if the person desired to integrate their faith with the process, it was never a contradictory phenomenon. I was available to clients to discuss issues of faith but for those less interested in that, I was still capable of representing a positive display of empathy and understanding for people in crisis. Thus the model of existential purpose as a solution to manage

or overcome myriad issues was widely applicable and my skills in it were sharpened by my personal and ethnographic understanding of veteran culture. This became my doctoral pursuit and the challenge became organizing and narrowing my focus to produce tangible results in a research format that could be duplicated. The nature of the examination became necessary to develop it as a mixed method design, drawing from a wide array of perspective in attempt to contend against a single focus that may not account for as many aspects of culture as possible.

Purpose of the Research

Messianic Judaism can serve veterans through a specific perspective of who God is and a composite of traditions and beliefs otherwise found among other forms of Judaism and Christianity but is a culture of identity that serves the veteran who seeks a successful transition from military to civilian life through authentic manifestation of individual identity. Utilizing a depth-model of research (qualitative analysis) and Torah study,³ this dissertation also seeks a more profound depth regarding clergy and counselors' understanding sub-cultures within their faith groups. Veterans, as a sub-culture, have unique traits like any other sub-culture. When veterans consider their religious identity as a resource to transition from military to civilian life, interaction between veterans and clergy is likely. I wholeheartedly encourage both groups to seek a deeper meaning to their own connection to God.

This dissertation examines ethnographic awareness of successful transition from military to civilian life among combat veterans through engagement with the Messianic Jewish community. Ethnographic understanding is in-depth awareness of a culture by personal

³In Messianic Judaism, Torah study is understood to be study of the complete Bible, including B'rit Chadashah (New Testament).

involvement or intensive study. The research here utilizes ethnographic awareness to seek correlations in military and veteran culture with Messianic Judaism, whether veterans are being introduced to Messianic Judaism or already part of its culture.

The dissertation is a mixed method study of concurrent nested design,⁴ stemming from specific observations about how purpose and meaning are derived in veterans through their relationship with God and their sense of religious identity as they manage life issues. These issues may include posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD), depression, and moral injury.⁵

The context, or worldview of religious belief in this dissertation is through the lens of Messianic Judaism. At times, this worldview provides the basis of perspective (such as the entire theological chapter). At other times it is used as a comparison of perspective for veteran participants in the research project in chapters four through six.

The clinical aspect of the study is inspired by the writer's personal experiences of growth and transition. While veterans and their families tend to reach out to clergy first, this study utilizes clinical knowledge and theories to evaluate, derive, and measure the significance of the issues through current literature, psychological instruments, and narrative interviews.

The theological component of the study examines the relationship that the subjects have with God: who He is to them, what He means to them, and their perceptions of their relationship with Him regarding who they are. This includes perceived aspects of identity in military service and as veterans. The theological foundation includes an examination of the nature of the

⁴ Concurrent nested mixed methods design is where quantitative and qualitative data are collected together with more emphasis placed on one or the other type of data. In this study, qualitative data is given more weight than quantitative data.

⁵ Not all veterans experience these issues, so for purposes of the dissertation, they are sub-categories under the broader-sweeping challenge of transition from military to civilian life, which affects all veterans.

problems veterans face. Jesus Himself will be examined to project what aspect of his nature, personality, or character veterans may derive from him regarding personal growth.

This ethnographic study utilizes the fact that the investigator is a combat veteran who benefitted from the healing effects of understanding Yeshua as Messiah and the Son of God. This perception led to understanding the usefulness of clinical and other resources believed to be provided by God. As an “Interpretive Theory of Culture,”⁶ the ethnographic component understands personal identity as embedded in a culture, making it a matter of human growth and development when mixed into the dynamic of military transition. In this case, culture is compounded within the contexts of both Messianic and veteran cultures.

As shared in the introduction in this chapter, I have been able to narrate my various experiences with clinical and other resources as a mission of faith in God to heal from trauma. The ethnographic understanding of this narrative would be the deep-rooted understanding of how important it is to understand that healing is, indeed, a mission, much the same as any military mission. Trauma is a very challenging topic to broach in military culture. The unavoidable nature of its vulnerability risks the rapport of veteran readers who may adhere to the stoic nature of military life. The context of healing and vulnerability are by no means necessitated to benefit from the information here. It is simply one application for those who wish or need to use it that way. The journey through pursuit of post-military identity is personal and overarching. The need to face healing may be negligent for one veteran, while it is a major component in transition for

⁶ Clifford Geertz, ed., “Thick Description: Toward an Interpretive Theory of Culture,” in *The Interpretation of Cultures* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), 12-13.

another. Regardless, the components of culture, faith, purpose, and identity remain the same significance for veterans looking at or participating in Messianic Judaism.

Literature from the fields of theology and psychology validate the effects of military culture's positive ethnographic impact upon itself in formal and informal settings. An emphasis in peer-to-peer articulation will enhance Geertz's "thick" examination of anthropological-religious understanding as well as clinical case-conceptualization. While the study attempts to derive comprehensive understanding of military culture and the participant's personal reflections, there is also an overarching theological bent from Messianic Judaism in which to compare all other aspects of the study.

Background

The Messianic Jewish Movement is growing. Dating back to the crucifixion of Yeshua, it waned in the following centuries and has begun to re-emerge over the last 50 or so years.⁷ Before Christians existed, Jews and gentiles who believed in Yeshua as the awaited Messiah of Israel gathered in synagogues on Sabbath alongside all other Jews. Since the late 1960's, senior Messianic rabbis have been occupied with the apologetic development of Messianic Judaism as a theological perspective, a lifestyle, and an identity. Messianic rabbis have concerned themselves with a core issue within Judaism—identity. The re-emergence of Messianic Judaism is transforming an age-old belief that when a Jew believes Yeshua is Messiah they forfeit their Jewish identity entirely.

⁷ N. Yangarber-Hicks, "Messianic Believers: Reflections on Identity of a Largely Misunderstood Group," *Journal of Psychology and Theology*, 33, No. 2 (2005): 128.

Modern Messianic Jewish growth and the question of its definition as either Christian or Jewish segues to a broader definition of what constitutes a religious group. This dissertation is not a comparative religion study, but the position of Messianic Judaism between mainstream Judaism and Christianity often forces members to make the comparisons and determine what it means to them to participate and how it impacts their lifestyle and relationships. Comparing Messianic Judaism to standard definitions of Christianity and Judaism validates the group as meeting criteria set forth by both Christianity (a tri-personal understanding of God and the divinity of Jesus) and mainstream Judaism (centrality of Torah, traditions, rituals, and language). Messianic Jews and gentiles often find themselves struggling with a personal conclusion that historical accounts of the two religions being entirely separate and distinct from each other leaves little room for profound commonalities.⁸

Guiding Research and Reason for the Study

Veteran issues are widely known because of the Global War on Terror, media coverage, and the rise of many veteran service organizations. What is less known are the details of the issues even as they impact society at large. For example, Veterans Administration is the second largest agency in the federal government, assuming responsibility for all veterans' health. Many problems remain without solution. Concurrently, movements within the veteran community are increasingly turning toward each other in self-sufficiency to solve epidemic issues such as veteran suicide. This is an undercurrent of the entire dissertation and discussed more specifically

⁸ Patricia Powers, "Accounting for Judaism in the Study of American Messianic Judaism" (PhD Diss., Arizona State University, 2015).

in chapter three.⁹ As a member of the veteran community, the primary researcher supports self-driven solutions, while also seeking to vitalize relationships with resources that are already integrated in the veteran community and are deemed useful and effective. Two of these resources are specific components of religion and psychology.

Observations on the integration of religion and psychology is an outcome of this dissertation. The effect itself is widely researched regarding whether religion should supplement psychology, vice-versa, or remain separate.¹⁰ This dissertation focuses on the consumers, who are the veterans, and the choices they make to integrate resources as they strive for successful transition to civilian life. Some choose religion only. Some choose a secular path to recovery if mental, emotion, and moral issues manifest as obstacles to overcome. Some choose none of these. This researcher's experience is that the veterans who strive for the fullest manifestation of their human potential as civilians engage all of the resources available to them.

This brings to question what formula is the most effective. Admittedly, I am biased to the efficacy of Messianic Judaism, and I try to move past this argument and identify specific components of it that may be useful to anyone seeking to make the most of benefit of resources. For a generalized example, the richness of Messianic Jewish identity and tradition may also segue to aspects of engaging rich culture in general. More specifically, I try to identify Hebraisms derived from Messianic Jewish theology that Christian veterans can embrace. One example would be Yeshua in the Jewish depiction of both the suffering servant and Son of Man.

⁹ H. C. Robertson, "Narrative and Peer-to-Peer Approaches in Counseling Military and Veterans: A Review of Current Literature and Practices," *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 3, no. 2 (May-August 2015): 66-78.

¹⁰ Mary Euto Gomes Esperandio and Luciana Fernandes Marques. "The Psychology of Religion in Brazil," *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, 25 (2015): 255-271.

This is a depiction of a lowly servant who is also a conquering warrior, a dynamic which many, if not all veterans can recognize and identify with. In this study, imposing necessary objectivity to the process of this study in correlations and examining the history of the resources became necessary. Psychology, religion, and military culture each have ramifications from their own applications of language, which in turn, effects culture.

The historical context of psychoanalysis demonstrates many early pioneers in the field compared and contrasted their theories against Freud, as will be discussed in chapter three. From the inception of Freud's original theories, many other Jewish psychologists have expounded "within the realm of the natural world and therefore in the realm of science."¹¹ Among the most prominent disciplines expounding psychology are the cognitive sciences that includes research involved in behavior, learning, and human development. Chapter three discusses the influence of Hebrew thought in modern psychology due to the majority influence of Jewish psychologists from the Freudian period to now.

Cognitive linguists such as Chomsky and Mezirow expand understanding in the dynamics of learning in order to build bridges across religious interpretation from a Hebrew perspective that influences both Jewish and Christian worlds. Sieva and Cohen discuss the dynamics of learning that helps to correlate into religious interpretation. This is a direct examination of typical human behavior that can contribute to sorting the enmeshments of Judaism and Christianity. Conversely, Kaplan clarifies the depth that Greek philosophy has formed the western world. All of these things have potential to influence the counseling environment, whether psychological or pastoral. Kaplan's call for a "biblical reformation of

¹¹ S. Epstein, "Unconscious Roots of Hitler's Anti-Semitism," *The Annual of Psychoanalysis* 31 (2003): 47.

mental health” through qualitative comparison of biblical and Greek narratives, argues that Freud’s theory of psychoanalysis is rooted in Greek tragedy, and then argues that greater hope is offered to clients through a Hebrew perspective of biblical psychology.¹²

It is therefore beneficial to consider these influences upon a dynamic such as a veteran transitioning out of military service. McGowan goes so far as to insist that cultural impact on theological interpretation and clients’ personal situations are highly likely to influence how clients, clergy, and counselors utilize religion in counseling.¹³

McGowan’s research strongly suggests that clergy who counsel trauma victims in congregational settings must avoid the use of personal or doctrinal overlays upon original meaning in Scripture in order to mitigate already complex circumstances. A more positive example of paralleling non-biblical sources with biblical sources is the work of Estelle Frankel. Frankel points out that the origins of psychological theory are rooted in Judaism. Not least of these is the concept of repentance (*teshuvah*) into psychotherapy, which provides synthesis between Judaism and Christianity. Her allegiance remains with Judaism and its definition of *teshuvah* with a “meaningful framework for the many stages of healing.”¹⁴ Krichiver also demonstrates a positive influence of psychology in the religious environment through Jewish context. The author identified a need for further psycho-spiritual guidance and resources in the Jewish community. Her research indicates a strong correlation between Positive Psychology

¹² Kalman Kaplan, “Obedience and Disobedience/Rebellion in Biblical Versus Greek Narratives: Toward a Biblical Psychology,” *Pastoral Psychology*, 60, no. 5 (2011): 659-670.

¹³ Michael McGowan, “Trauma and Grace: Psychology and Theology in Conversation,” *Pastoral Psychology* 58, no. 2 (2009): 167-180.

¹⁴ Estelle Frankel, “Repentance, Psychotherapy, and Healing Through a Jewish Lens,” *The American Behavioral Scientist* 41 (1998): 6.

(also rooted in Victor Frankl’s Logotherapy-meaning centered psychotherapy) and the Jewish Holidays.¹⁵

Overview of the Dissertation

Chapter two discusses the theological underpinnings of the dissertation. There is increasing research among counseling theories that include elements of spirituality and meaning-making in multicultural settings, including implementation by Veterans Health Administration. Therefore, this dissertation heavily considers spiritual aspects of a veteran’s life from a Messianic Jewish perspective. Habenicht explains spirituality in mental health to be a sweeping term that is a paradigm shift in recent integrations of psychology; however, her overview of various approaches to biblical-psychological synthesis does not meet an exacting model.¹⁶ This study examines specific mental, moral, and emotional issues in a cultural context, with a correlation to the Jewish Messiah.

Cognitive, emotional, existential, and relational issues are all examples of issues that bring people to counseling and affect their perceptions to start with. Many counselees still seek God as the source of their solution. Yeshua’s significance as depicted in chapter two may be identified in the study of veteran participants in chapters four and five, where narrative analysis of veterans willing to share their faith through interview occurs.

Chapter three provides a history of combat medicine as a basis of understanding how the United States developed its treatment of mental health in military-related settings. The

¹⁵ Tami Krichever, “Positive Psychology and the Jewish Holiday Calendar: A Resource Manual for Small Groups” (PhD diss., Pepperdine University, 2010).

¹⁶ Donna J. Habenicht, “The Bible and Psychology.” Paper presented at the Symposium on the Bible and Adventist Scholarship, Dominican Republic, 200.

development of history is important to understand the breadth of difference between the medical model and spiritual approaches as well as how they correlate. The chapter also considers the ethical importance of veteran' health, their ability to self-manage, cultural implications, and ways to apply resources derived from both medical and faith-based approaches. The context of the chapter attempts to be solution-oriented as opposed to attempting to draw gains by analyzing problems.

Chapter four breaks down the method of design based in a narrative interview process, supplemented with three psychological instruments to develop a comprehensive case conceptualization of study participants as individuals, their faith, challenges and strategies for managing transition from military to civilian life. The Davidson Trauma Scale provides a brief synopsis regarding the presence of trauma and the type of symptomology. The Meaning in Life-Questionnaire helps to determine participants present state of meaning and their motivations to pursue meaning for the future. The Bell Religious Identity Measure helps to examine participants' personal sense of religious identity. The purpose of the study in chapters four through six is not to strictly identify their challenges; rather, it is an attempt to get to know them as members of a faith community, based in fact.¹⁷

While the overall dissertation design is a mixed-method study of concurrent nested design, the methodology outlined in chapter four describes the multiple applications of resources to understand the participants' needs, perceptions, and values. Quantitative measurements complement the qualitative aspect of the study, where the measurements are embedded to add

¹⁷ The veterans who participated were identified as "mature," recollect many things from their past, and are described from a perspective of a longstanding relationship with God.

insight to what they share in the interview process.¹⁸ In addition to the triangulation of narrative analysis (three researchers), and psychological measurements, the involvement of three researchers creates a triangulation within the ethnographic analysis of the narratives. The professional military experiences of all three researchers underscore the ethnographic component. The researchers include a primary researcher (dissertation author), a licensed clinical social worker supervisor (Ann Johnson), and a Messianic Rabbi (John Schutz). Johnson holds a Master of Social Work from University of Kansas, held adjunct professor positions in clinical social work, and retired from the U.S. Army Reserve as a Colonel with over thirty years of clinical experience working with soldiers. Schutz holds a Master of Divinity from Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary and ordination from the United Messianic Jewish Assembly. He is the congregational leader of Congregation Kehilat Elohim in Jacksonville, Florida, and a veteran who retired after twenty years of service as a Chief Petty Officer in the U.S. Navy.

Chapter five is the study itself, examining ethnographic sources for successful transition from military to civilian life among veterans who are members of the Messianic Jewish community. Using theological and psychological perspectives, narrative interviews are examined by a clinical social worker and a Messianic rabbi. Their observations are summarized and synthesized by the primary researcher (dissertation author) with supplemental information provided by the psychological. The participants' inherent drive towards purpose are examined against the motivations derived from their relationship with God.

¹⁸ Quantitative analysis will measure scores of purpose in life, trauma, and religious identity.

Chapter six is a discussion of the conclusions and interpretation of results. Qualitative and quantitative data, theology, and observations are discussed in an attempt to provide insight to members in the Messianic community as they interact with veterans among them. Limitations within the study is the relatively short duration of it and the small number of participants. While these limitations do not provide the ability to measure long-term growth, it does provide an in-depth examination of their current values, motivations, and beliefs.

Definition of Terms

B'rit Chadash- New Testament

Ethnographic- In-depth knowledge of military and veteran culture. This dissertation frequently alludes to veterans being the ethnographic experts of their own culture with their own language, values, and customs.

Messianic Judaism- A religious practice that focuses on Yeshua (Jesus) as Messiah in Jewish context and tradition.

Messianic Theology- Biblical interpretation in Jewish context with an emphasis of understanding B'rit Chadash firmly rooted in the importance of Jewish context, as prescribed by the history of the Jewish people as depicted in Tanakh.

Messiah Yeshua- A colloquial adaptation to the Christian reference to Jesus Christ.

Moral Injury- A psychological, cultural, emotional, and spiritual injury upon a person who acted or witnessed an action that transgresses their moral conscience. It is sometimes misconstrued as posttraumatic stress disorder and can occur concurrently with it.

Posttraumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD)- A psychological and emotional injury that occurs from exposure to life threatening circumstances such as child abuse and combat.

Religion- This dissertation generally refers to religion in a formal sense as Messianic Judaism, but also alludes to Orthodox Judaism and Christianity. However, the specific use of the word as it pertains to the religion of study participants is an examination of their own perceptions of God and their relationship with him. It also includes the traditions and practices that they integrate to their sense of identity and worldview.

Shabbat- The Hebrew word for Saturday, also known as Sabbath. Shabbat is recognized in Messianic Judaism as the day of rest and worship mandated in the Fourth Commandment of Exodus 20:8.

Tanakh- Old Testament, referring it in acronym as Torah (five books of Moses), Neviim (prophets), Ketuvim (Job, Psalms and Proverbs).

Torah- The first five books of the bible, also known as the books of Moses, or, Chumash. The term is sometimes used interchangeably with the entire Bible when discussing Bible study in Messianic Judaism.

Transition- The phenomenon experienced by military members leaving the military and adapting to civilian life. The physical act is delineated within a specified period of time, such as administrative out-processing and terminal leave. However, the adaptation of life as a veteran after military service may take several years.

Tzitzit- Strings attached to four corners of a man's clothing or prayer shawl. They are worn to remind the wearer of the omnipresence of God.

Veteran- Any person who has completed basic military and skills training in the United States military.

Yeshua- Hebrew for Jesus.

Limitations and Delimitations of the Study

The examination of ethnographic sources for successful transition from military to civilian life among members of the Messianic Jewish community is broad-based and complex. Narrowing of the examination is attempted by seeking to define the importance of purpose in a veteran's life during transition, then examining the outcomes of their efforts to succeed at it. The mixed methods approach is an attempt to increase validity and relevancy of each component of the study. Quantitative evaluations will provide a baseline of participants' current motivation levels in pursuit of purpose and religious identity, as well as any condition in recovery from trauma. Qualitative testing enhances self-report and derives concepts not measurable in quantitative scales.

This mixed methods research creates a vehicle to compare and contrast identified data in the narratives, narrative analyses, and psychological measures. In a sense, the research seeks to establish a baseline of understanding between Messianic Judaism and veteran culture. Given the

two-thousand-year span of related literature (from ancient biblical text to early history of modern psychology) and best practices in contemporary counseling and pastoral care, solutions to military transition are rapidly evolving and essentially a new, stand-alone topic. Therefore, integrating military transition to the composite culture of Messianic Judaism calls for a breadth of data. For example, much of the theology chapter discusses the humanity of Yeshua (Jesus) and aspects of his identity as a warrior. Another example is examination of how clergy can become more familiar with veterans in their congregations who are in transition from the military as well as the assets they bring to strengthen congregations, as discussed in chapter three. Still more examples are examinations of veteran's self-perceptions resulting from military service and integrating religious identity versus motivations for underlying faith, regardless of their sense of identity. This is examined in chapters four through six.

In spite of the focus on a specified period of time (transition from military life), veterans carry systems of belief, thought, emotion, and behavior with them throughout life (as do all people). Therefore, it is necessary to consider the impact of these pre-programmed systems upon their military service and their efforts in post-military life. In this study, these things are examined regarding how they integrate with their inner values related to faith as well as their outward religious expression. This underlying examination may be of particular use to clergy who seek to understand veteran's personal encounters in congregational settings.

Significance of the Study

There is a need for clergy to understand the nature of military ethnography and the intense issues faced by veterans as they make transition to civilian life. The intent of this study is for the findings to generate opportunity to help others like the study participants to enhance their own lives, witness the relevance of God, and derive purpose and meaning in their existence.

I suggest that the narrative veterans speak to themselves and others when in transition has a lot to do with the integration of identity and purpose. It is incumbent upon clergy to identify the benefits of a perspective of God that addresses the culture of identity that is authentic to the values inherent in them, as discussed in previous sections of this chapter and throughout the dissertation.

Just as the impact for veterans exploring this question for themselves may cause discouragement before growth, these experiences have a quantitative effect upon the congregations in which they participate. Commensurate with the profoundness of their military experiences is the level of impact they have upon their communities when they engage their post-military purpose. In a word, clergy and congregations will be impacted by veterans in their midst, contributing to their own understanding of Messianic Jewish culture commensurate with their efforts to understand veterans and their culture.

As familiarity of Messianic Judaism grows, more people from Jewish and Christian backgrounds may enjoy the Jewishness of Messiah Yeshua, known in Christian denomination as Jesus Christ. Historically, a Jew embracing belief in the divine nature of a Messiah to save the world has been considered shedding their Jewish identity to become a Christian. However, the inherently driven need for human identity has led many Jews to hold onto their sense of Jewish identity while placing their faith in Yeshua as divine Messiah. The dynamic that is created is that the Jew holds onto his or her sense of cultural belonging to Judaism as well as the religious traditions and practices in recognition that Yeshua did the same. For the gentile Christians who come to Messianic Judaism, it becomes an expression of their faith in the Jewish context of Old and New Testaments as well as belief that they should reflect God's faithfulness to Israel as his chosen conduit to bring light to the world. Both sides of these approaches contribute to a richness

of culture and tradition that is both unique and beneficial to veterans seeking a walk of faith as means to transition from military to civilian life.

Once servicemembers are no longer soldiers, sailors, airmen, or marines, a multi-applicable solution to myriad challenges to civilian transition is to press into a new purpose. This phenomenon is examined throughout the dissertation, including a substantial amount of material documenting the unique nature of military culture, transition from active duty to civilian life, and extensive mental health research. Ethnographic studies indicate significant accomplishments of veterans pursuing renewed purpose in civilian life, regardless of their personal challenges. Therefore, religious groups with veterans among them are also challenged to understand the unique nature of the veterans among them. Conversely, veterans often seek a deepening of their faith when confronted with the realities of their military transition. Understanding these distinctives will empower them to increase their advocacy on behalf of themselves, their families, and the other veterans among them.

This dissertation is part of my own efforts to be a better Jew. There are three Pillars of Judaism: Torah (Study), Avodah (Service), and Chesed (Kind Act). This research required my efforts to understand the Jewish Messiah more deeply and to seek ways in which I relate to him as a warrior. The research is also an act of service to advocate for my fellow veterans and to strengthen Messianic congregations with a better understanding of the incredible assets veterans among them are. Perhaps most significantly, the concept of *chesed* (loving kindness) in my own life has been substantial. My own discovery of how God brings his loving kindness to all of us, while taking on the lion's share of his own required justice, was one of the most life-changing occurrences in my own transition to civilian life. In spite of the many years I spent in Special Forces, God's lovingkindness was the single-most important aspect of his personality to bring

about deep-seated healing from life-long struggles. Through the knowledge shared in this dissertation, I impose God's loving kindness into cultures known for their stoic dispositions- military personnel and faith groups.

CHAPTER 2

A MESSIANIC JEWISH THEOLOGY OF CULTURE

The Foundation

This chapter provides the theological underpinnings of this dissertation, based in Messianic Jewish understanding. Messianic Jewish theology is developed by scholars who consider Jewish as well as Christian thoughts. It may seem unfamiliar to those accustomed to Conservative Christian grammatical hermeneutics. It is a middle way; it is not strictly Christian, and not negating the importance of New Testament Scripture such as is done in mainstream Judaism, but building on the Jewish impact of biblical history, context, and Hebraisms. This chapter addresses topics related to aspects of the nature of God that members of military culture can turn to in challenging times.

Messianic Judaism is a perspective that defines itself as a stream of Jewish practice and identity where Yeshua (Jesus) is Messiah. This chapter explores only the points of Messianic Judaism that will prove significant in the methodology chapter of research, rather than a complete defense of its theology at large.¹⁹ The chapter explores the derivation of Messianic Judaism from mainstream Judaism and Christianity in general, to provide a basis for understanding narrative interviews of military veterans pertinent to their subculture. Messianic

¹⁹ For an in-depth description of Messianic Judaism in the modern era, see David Stern's *Messianic Jewish Manifesto* (Clarksville, MD: Jewish New Testament Publications, 1991).

Jewish adherents of military culture may consider how their relationship with, and understanding of God provides the means to overcome the challenging transition from military service to civilian life.

All lifestyles impact neurosynaptic pathways in the brain. Just as challenges as posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD), depression, moral injury, or the absence of them, the military training inherent to all veterans accesses them to neurosynaptic pathways capable of overcoming one of the most significant transitional occurrences in American life, that of a uniformed member of the Armed Forces, to life fully immersed in civilian society. Much like Messianic Judaism is a perspective and way of life not central to either mainstream Judaism or Christianity,²⁰ life in the United States Armed Forces is fully American, but not fully immersed in free society. For as much as U.S. Servicemembers are a significantly sub-culture within civilian society, they are directly affected by, and privy to world events as primary witnesses. Much like this, Messianic Judaism is a fully Jewish expression of Jesus as Messiah. Conversely, Messianic Jews do not experience a full immersion to, or identity with Christianity. For members of the military culture who adhere to Messianic Judaism, they are unusual among the unusual, yet able to fully identify with a Messiah who accomplished his mission at great sacrifice.

Biblical-Historical Analysis and the Division of Messianic Judaism from Mainstream Judaism and Christianity

Judaism and Christianity have a monotheistic foundation, both being descended from Avraham (Abraham). Tensions between them is akin to siblings vying for favor from *Avinu*

²⁰ Faydra Shapiro, "Jesus for Jews: The Unique Problem of Messianic Judaism," *Journal of Religion & Society* 14 (2012): 4.

(Our Father). Brief examination reveals an unfolding of God's Covenant intention, which is Yeshua's ratification of the New Covenant, pre-staged from Avraham, to Moshe (Moses) to David. Discrepancies arise concerning the heir to David's throne (2 Sa. 7:12-16), as depicted in God's Covenant with him.²¹ Messianic Judaism arrives at the New Testament as the fulfillment of the Covenantal promise, derived from the ultimate work of Yeshua, as Son of God as well as the awaited Jewish Messiah. The completion of his Messianic redemption is built on the work of God's Covenant with Avraham. Indeed, three religions stake their own claim regarding the outcome of God's Covenant with Avraham. "Christians, like Jews and Muslims, believe that only one God exists. The creed states the assumption of the ancient Shema: Hear O Israel, the Lord our God is one Lord."²²

Rabbinic Judaism does not recognize New Covenant Scripture (New Testament) as canonical, whereas Messianic Judaism and Christianity do. Indeed, Islam makes its own departure from the Abrahamic Covenant and regards Ishmael as the recipient of God's favor as opposed to his step-brother Isaac (Qu. 37:100-111).

Messianic Judaism narrows the perspective that not only is Yeshua God and Messiah, but that he did so in a lasting expression of Jewishness as opposed to Hebraic understanding being made obsolete. Despite this inherent Jewishness, the foundation of Yeshua's blood atoning for the sins of all, distinguishes it from mainstream Judaism. The close nature of Messianic Judaism and Christianity are critically paired under the atoning sacrifice, but there are differences in understanding.

²¹ John Fischer, "'Abrahamic Covenant': 'Jewish Roots of Christianity I'" (class lecture presented at St. Petersburg Theological seminary, St. Petersburg, Florida, Spring 2010).

²² David Bennett, "The Nicene Creed: Symbol of the Catholic Faith," Ancient and Future Catholics, accessed November 11, 2016, from <http://www.ancient-future.net/nicene.html>.

Christianity's focus on the crucifixion and resurrection of Jesus for the sins of humanity is not in conflict with Messianic Judaism, which whole-heartedly agrees with Yeshua's mission to complete salvation. However, when one starts their perspective of salvation with the atonement, it is an inductive perspective of Christianity (starting with the solution and working back toward the problem [sin]). In Messianic Judaism, the atonement is approached from the problem (sin), the guidance (Torah) and then the solution (Yeshua's atonement). This is a Hebraic, or "top down" approach; God's promise to Avraham provides the seeds of the New Covenant promise with Hebraic lineage that blesses the entire world. From the Abrahamic Covenant to the Mosaic Covenant, provides the national order in which Yeshua will be born. Then the Davidic Covenant establishes the throne upon which Yeshua will reign. The manifestation of these promises sets the stage for Messiah's birth. This Hebraic, "top down" approach is converse to the Christian inductive approach:

Most Christian theology through the centuries has been characterized by Aristotelian inductive thinking, moving from specific observations to broader generalizations. That is, in order to understand a phenomenon, one would take it apart into as small units of observation as possible, and would build an understanding from there (also known as "bottom-up" approaches). This method is different from the Hebraic thinking characterizing the Hebrew Scripture, which is more associative, or deductive, working from the more general to the more specific. In this way of thinking, understanding a phenomenon is best achieved when it is investigated as a whole (top-down approach).²³

Under guidance from Moshe, the Israelites journeyed to the land promised to Avraham. This is a physical transition in Hebraic context leading to the fullness of the Abrahamic Covenant, but not without the guidance of Torah under Moshe. While Messianic Judaism embraces both top-down (Torah, Covenants, etc.) it is not without the induction of Yeshua's salvation. Indeed, the concept of "Mosaic Law" is a Christian term referring to Judaism's Mosaic

²³ Erez Soref, "Can a Believer Suffer a Psychological Disorder?" *Mishkan* 40, no. 2 (2004): 7.

Covenant and the 613 biblical commandments.²⁴ It may be an oversight of the purpose of Torah to assume that the commandments enable the reception of God's grace: "[The Apostle Paul] expected that [Jews] naturally would continue to live [devoutly] (1 Co 7:18). However, they were to understand that observance and obedience do not produce salvation; they result from it."²⁵ It is central in Messianic Judaism to understand the broader Jewish perception of Torah and its commandments as merciful and loving.

Mainstream Judaism agrees with the Christian historical account of the Abrahamic Covenant being passed to Isaac, then Jacob, expanding to the Mosaic Covenant, and then the Davidic Covenant. While mainstream Judaism stops there, Messianic Judaism adheres to this evolution of the Covenant as a sign of God's faithfulness to the Jewish people, and extends that evolution to include an understanding of New Covenant Scripture (New Testament). The covenant theme is continual for Messianic Judaism, and thereby transcends the divisive tone of "Old" and "New" Testament seen in Christianity. Moreover, it dismisses supersessionist overtones that "Mosaic Law" has been done away with, and that Christianity has been chosen to replace Judaism for God's purpose and blessing.

The terms "anti-Jewish" and "supersessionist" have many nuanced interpretations... Anti-Judaism is a Christian interpretation of scripture and of liturgy that privileges Christians' relationship with God through Jesus Christ over Jewish interpretation and practice, while disparaging all things Jewish. Supersessionism is the Christian understanding that the covenant of God with Israel has been superseded by that with Jesus Christ. Thus the Jewish covenant is null and void.²⁶

²⁴ Jason Meyer, *The End of the Law* (Nashville: B&H Publishing, 2009), 35.

²⁵ John Fischer, "Paul in his Jewish Context," *Evangelical Quarterly* 62, no. 3 (July 1985): 211-236.

²⁶ Mary C. Boys, *Has God Only One Blessing? Judaism as a Source of Christian Self-Understanding* (New York: Paulist Press, 2000), 10-11, quoted in Theresa O'Keefe, "Relationships Across the Divide: An Instigator of Transformation," *Studies in Christian-Jewish Relations* 5 (2010): 13.

Opinions differ as to whether the Jeremiah prophecy that God promises to write Torah on the hearts of those who believe has yet to occur. The fulfillment of this prophesy transpires in the New Testament, described as the New or Renewed Covenant in Messianic Jewish understanding (Je 31). This is not to imply that the entirety of Christianity adopts supersession ideology and theology. However, it is Messianic Judaism that fully embraces the New Covenant as an extension of the Abrahamic, Mosaic, and Davidic Covenants as one, complete Covenant. This is the distinction from mainstream Judaism and Christianity.

Orthodox Jews continue to wait for Eliyahu (Elijah) to return and usher in the Messianic reign. This closely reflects the nature of messianic prophesy to followers of Messiah Yeshua: “They looked forward to the advent of Elijah that will be followed by the Messiah who will transform the world to embrace the heavenly Father. In early Christian tradition, Jesus is the Messiah and John the Baptist is Elijah.”²⁷ Messianic Judaism is cognizant of the spirit of the anticipatory wait for Eliyahu, while waiting for the second coming of Messiah Yeshua to assume the Davidic throne; “Pay attention!” [says Yeshua,] “I am coming soon... Those blessed are those who wash their robes, so that they have the right to eat from the Tree of Life and go through the gates into the city! I, Yeshua, have sent my angel to give you this testimony for the Messianic communities. I am the Root and Offspring of David, the bright Morning Star (Rv 22:12-14; 16).”

New Covenant Scripture in the book of Matthew, documents Yeshua of Nazareth deriving from the line of David, which alludes to God’s promise to him that a descendent will establish his throne forever; From Ya’akov (Jacob or Israel) to Y’hudah (Judah), David, Nathan,

²⁷ Asher Finkel, “Elijah in Light of Rabbinic and Early Christian Sources,” *Teshuva Institute Papers* (2011): 5.

and Neri (Lk 3:27), to Y'hoyakim (Jehoichin; Je 22:24, 30), to P'dayah and Sh'alti'el (Pedaiah and Shealtiel; I Ch 3:17-18), to Z'rubavel (Zerubbabel; I Ch 3:19; Ez 3:2), to Reisha (Rhesa; Lk 3:26-27), to Hananyah (Hananiah; I Ch 3:19), to Yodah (Joda; Mt 1:13), to Hodavyahu (Hodaviah; I Ch 3:24), to Elyakim (Eliakim), Yosef (Josech), Eli (Heli), and Ya'akov (Nm 27:3-8, 36:6-7), to Yosef (Joseph, Husband of Miriam [Mary], who is also a descendent of David). The significant Messianic Jewish perspective of Yeshua's Davidic lineage not only leads to the documentation of his messiahship, but continues the covenantal theme of God's faithfulness. Covenant is the very nature of Yeshua's messiahship, and thereby the nature of God's relationship with humankind, even spilling into some circles of Christianity, "From Adam through Abraham, Moses, David and The Messiah himself in his death and resurrection, we all live in some form of covenant relationship with God."²⁸

The concept of canonization contributes significantly to mainstream Judaism's rejection of Yeshua as the awaited Messiah. As New Covenant Scripture is not part of mainstream Jewish canon,²⁹ Yeshua's Davidic lineage is rendered unratified. Therefore, the occurrence of a Jew turning to Yeshua as Messiah disrupts the belief system of mainstream Jewish canonization. Such an occurrence conflates Old and New Testaments as *echad* (one), with the Jewishness of Yeshua (and his Davidic lineage) as one journey of God from his faithfulness to Adam and Eve in the beginning, to his reign from Jerusalem as heir to David's throne (Rv 21:1-6; 22:16).

²⁸ Tim Clinton and George Ohlschlager, eds., *Competent Christian Counseling: Foundations and Practice of Compassionate Soul Care*, Volume 1 (Colorado Springs: WaterBrook, 2002), 60.

²⁹David Stern, *The Complete Jewish Study Bible* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2016), xxxvi.

How and when the canonization of Tanakh³⁰ occurred has not been determined,³¹ but the books themselves are of the same content of Protestant Old Testament tradition, with different order and categorization. Tanakh has 24 books, while the same content is found in Protestantism's 39 books.³² The Apocrypha, which is accepted by Catholics and some Protestants as deuterocanonical writings,³³ includes books that were nearly canonized in Judaism.³⁴ Among them is the Book of Maccabees, which ties the miracle of God's faithfulness to covenant and nationalism. An example of this relevance to Messianic Judaism is that Maccabees contains the story of the feast of Chanukah. The festival itself is significant in all streams of Judaism, but is not considered a "biblical" feast because Apocryphal books are not canonized.³⁵

Considering that Yeshua's teachings did not become canonized in the broader Jewish world, it is natural to consider that tensions grew between followers of Yeshua and the broader Jewish community as early as the first century.³⁶ Segregation of worshipers in synagogues (non-

³⁰ Christianity's Old Testament (Pentateuch, prophets and letters) are Judaism's Tanakh (Torah, Writings, and Prophets).

³¹ James VanderKam, *From Revelation to Canon: Studies in the Hebrew Bible and Second Temple Literature* (Leiden: Brill, 1999), 2.

³² *Ibid.*, xxxiv.

³³ Daniel Harrington, "The Old Testament Apocrypha in the Early Church and Today" in *The Canon Debate*, eds. Lee McDonald & James Sanders (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2002), 197.

³⁴ The Apocryphal books include several different genres of literature – historical narrative, wisdom literature, etc.

³⁵ In *The Complete Jewish Study Bible*, Stern points out that Catholic and Anglican Bibles do include the same Apocryphal books (see page xxiv). It must also be noted that Messianic Judaism does not dismiss Chanukah, based on its inherent Jewish qualities, but ratifies its legitimacy based upon Yeshua's attendance at the celebration in John: 10:23.

³⁶ Arnold Fruchtenbaum, "The Quest for a Messianic Theology," *Mishkan*, no. 2. (1985): 2.

Yeshua following Jews, Yeshua-following Jews, and Gentiles) took place over a 600-year period, the momentum of active separation between Rabbinic Judaism and Christianity began taking significant hold in the third century. This is evidenced in a commentary on the life of Josephus and the tension between Jews and Christians of the fourth century:

For when we met with Joseph at his home and asked questions about him and knew that in regard to his public life he lived in accordance with the Jews, we discussed both his way of life and how he converted to Christianity. We may note here that Joseph seems to have continued – at least as far as Epiphanius could see – to live like a Jew. There was also another younger man from the Hebrews in the city who was orthodox in belief, who did not dare to consort with us openly, but visited us secretly. Both of these Jewish Christians, then must have continued outwardly to live like Jews; the older man was already known as a believer in Jesus and so had no fear of being seen in open association with Christians, while the younger man evidently kept his faith secret.³⁷

The question of which books were authoritative affected Jewish leaders in the post-Second Temple period as they worked to hold post-exilic communities together. The Jewish diaspora was surviving under the community leadership of rabbis, who were deriving interpretations of Tanakh and oral traditions in a decentralized, post-Temple world. These interpretations resulted in Mishna-discussions among the rabbis regarding Law, which were redacted into six orders (*Shisha Sidarim* or “*Shas*”) by Rabbi Judah the Prince, in 170 C.E., in Israel.³⁸ Messianic Judaism acknowledges the historical aspects of these rabbinic writings, and some teachings are approached in various ways by some Messianic Rabbis. However, Messianic Judaism does not afford Mishna the authoritative status which it has in Orthodox Judaism. “What I and many others caution against is the uncritical, and sometimes even cavalier use of rabbinic

³⁷ Ray Pritz. “Joseph of Tiberias: The Legend of a 4th Century Jewish Christian.” *Mishkan*, no. 2 (1985): 39.

³⁸ For an overview of Mishna, and other ancient Rabbinic writings, see *The Complete Jewish Study Bible*, xiii-xv.

writings as sources for New Testament interpretation. Rabbinic literature can be extremely useful, but it must be utilized critically and carefully.”³⁹

The efforts to further the separation in Jewish communities between those who followed Yeshua and those who did not, included rabbinic attempts to protect the Jewish communities from those whom they considered to be heretical. The actual process of identifying and expelling Yeshua-followers took centuries.⁴⁰

Yeshua-followers were implicated as one of “24 sectarian factions”⁴¹ the rabbis strategically identified by implementing an additional blessing onto the number twelve position of the *Shemoni Esrei* (the name meaning “the eighteen,” for its original number of blessings), also called Amidah (“Standing”).⁴² That blessing is titled, *Birkhat HaMinim* (Against Heretics). Like canonization of Tanakh, there are many variations to the account of the manifestation of *Shemoni Esrei*, the following being one.

At Yavneh the traditional twelfth benediction of the Amidah [the Jewish 18-Prayer], a formal excommunication of sectaries, was directed against those who had been Jewish but who now identified as Christians. It had been invoked earlier against Sadducees and was later invoked against gnostic Jews. This evidence would suggest that at Yavneh the twelfth benediction was directed against deviant Jews and Christians were perceived as deviant Jews.”⁴³

³⁹ Michael Brown. “The Issue of the Inspired Text: A Rejoinder to David Bivin,” *Mishkan* 1, no. 20 (1994): 57.

⁴⁰ Michael Kok. “Marking a Difference: The Gospel of Mark and the ‘Early High Christology’ Paradigm,” *Journal of the Jesus Movement in its Jewish Setting* 3 (2016): 106.

⁴¹ Ibid: 106-107.

⁴² Barry Holtz, ed., *Back to the Sources: Reading the Classic Jewish Texts* (Blue Ridge Summit, PA: Summit Books, 1986), 418.

⁴³ Annie Amos, “The Parting of the Ways,” *Jewish-Christian Relations: Insights and Issues in the Ongoing Jewish-Christian Dialogue* (2010), accessed June 24, 2017, <http://www.jcrelations.net/The+Parting+of+the+Ways.2237.0.html?L=3#top>.

With Yeshua-followers listed in heretical proclamations,⁴⁴ the fifteenth blessing, *Malkhut beit David* (Kingdom of David) was no longer tolerated to be proclaimed as openly referencing Yeshua as the messianic heir to the Davidic Covenant: “Speedily cause the Branch of David your servant to flourish. Exalt his horn by your salvation (yeshua), because we hope for your yeshua all day. Praise be you, Adonai, who causes the horn of yeshua to flourish.”⁴⁵

By the end of the second century, Jewish-Christians continued to observe Jewish Holy Days. Passover was naturally among those days, with the theological understanding of Yeshua as the Passover Lamb. However, much like the rabbis, who were charged with the preservation of Jewish life, had implemented protections against “heretical sects,” so, too, the Nicene Council convened to protect the Christian Church from false doctrines. This conversely, implicated Jewish believers and their practices.

The Council of Nicea of 325 A. D., which met to settle the issues of Arianism and Ebionism, unfortunately went further and firmly established a Sunday Easter. The Council was attended by 318 bishops, 18 of whom were from the land of Israel but not one was a Jewish believer. The Council of Antioch of 341 made strong indictments against other Jewish practices and went even further by issuing an Edict of Excommunication to those who refused to observe a Sunday Easter.⁴⁶

This brief history of Messianic Judaism demonstrates its challenges in withstanding Jewish and Christian forces in the first centuries of the Common Era. Veterans who adhere to Messianic Judaism are joining with a perspective that is wedged somewhere between Mainstream Judaism and Christianity. Much like their worldview forged by experiences

⁴⁴ Arnold Fruchtenbaum, “The Quest for a Messianic Theology,” *Mishkan: A Forum on the Gospel and the Jewish People* 2 (1985): 2.

⁴⁵ Reuven Kimelman, “The Messiah of the Amidah: A study in Comparative Messianism,” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 116, no. 2 (July 1997): 313-20.

⁴⁶ Fruchtembaum, “The Quest for a Messianic Theology,” 6.

uncommon to most American citizens, to the foreign nationals they may be closely encountered during military service, they are unequivocally American. Moreover, veterans who at one time had sworn to sacrifice for their nation align themselves with a God who swore from the beginning of time to sacrifice and redeem in covenant love and loyalty.⁴⁷

The Challenges of Messianic Judaism in the Modern Era

While splinters of Messianic Judaism existed throughout the centuries, the Holocaust has changed the way Jews and Christians examine faith and God. While some of the survivors lost their belief in a God who calls, “*Shema* (listen intently), *Echad* (I Am One)”, others were invigorated.

The truth is that among those who went through the experience of Auschwitz, the number of those whose religious life was deepened... by far exceeds the number of those who gave up their belief... Just as the small fire is extinguished by the storm whereas a large fire is enhanced by it - likewise a weak faith is weakened by predicaments and catastrophes whereas a strong faith is strengthened by them.⁴⁸

An example of profound growth in faith resulting from the Holocaust is the plight and purpose of Holocaust survivor, Victor Frankl. In his first book, *Man's Search for Meaning*, Frankl describes how the Nazi's separated him from his family, never to be seen again. Confiscated from him was his manuscript, his life's work as a prominent Viennese psychiatrist. His initial reaction was a loss of his sense of humanity. But his story is about the fact that his humanity can never be taken from him, regardless of the temptation to choose otherwise.

⁴⁷ Up to and including the point of death.

⁴⁸ Victor Frankl, *The Unconscious God* (New York: Pocket Books, 1985), 17.

Shortly after the confiscation of his manuscript, he found a torn section of Torah in the pocket of his issued pajamas.⁴⁹ From that, he began to write all over again. To adhere to a sense of purpose and inspire as many Jews who would join him, he dedicated himself to this writing. As one of merely twelve survivors from his block in Dachau, he lived on to reach acclaim that rivaled that of Sigmund Freud.

A Christian theologian would be remiss to overlook the choice title of Frankl's existential approach - Logotherapy. Like the lessons that believers derive from bible stories, they are inextricably connected to the lives of the characters portrayed. Frankl's lessons derived in the concentration camps are similarly portrayed. While incapable of refuting the inherent Jewishness of his life, 'meaning-centered therapy' was built on a foundation of Greek entitlement, is inextricably Jewish, tested and proven inside the fences of Auschwitz and Dachau.

Eventually he was among the few survivors and liberated, Frankl endured more isolation and discouragement after the war as he purposed his life to further Logotherapy. Yet, he was profoundly encouraged by Rebbe Menachem Mendel Schneerson (founder of the ultra-Orthodox Chabad Lubavitcher movement) who believed that Logotherapy was the most Torah observant form of therapy by which to save lives.⁵⁰ It is rooted in theology and manifests itself in individuals' applications of their actions in faith that seek to improve the world around them. Its simplicity does not contradict theology from that of the Ultra-Orthodox, to Messianic, to Christian. And it is useful to veterans who are often challenged to find personal meaning to their military service.

⁴⁹ Viktor Frankl, *Man's Search for Meaning* (New York: Washington Square Press, 1984), 15-100.

⁵⁰ Chaim Miller, *Turning Judaism Outwards: A Biography of the Rebbe, Menachem Mendel Schneerson* (Brooklyn: KOL Menachem, 2014), 224.

After the Nazi's failed to solve their "Jewish problem,"⁵¹ Christianity began to reconsider the 'Jewish question': "It was Judaism that brought the concept of a God-given universal moral law into the world...The Jew carries the burden of God in history, [and] for this has never been forgiven."⁵²

The Jewish question still exists. It would be foolish to deny it. It is a remnant of the Middle Ages, which civilized nations do not even yet seem able to shake off, try as they will. They certainly showed a generous desire to do so when they emancipated us. The Jewish question exists wherever Jews live in perceptible numbers. Where it does not exist, it is carried by Jews in the course of their migrations. We naturally move to those places where we are not persecuted, and there our presence produces persecution.⁵³

Yet the significant growth of today's Messianic Movement draws Jew and Gentile alike, seeking a deeper sense of Jewish identity or affiliation, and a Hebraic context of relating to God. Many adherents to Protestantism are developing interest in its Jewish connection, with individual study, Jewish outreach, even supporting Messianic Jewish synagogues.⁵⁴ In the same way that Judaism carries the burden of God into history, Messianic Judaism carries the burden of a Jewish Messiah, fully man and fully God into history; "Despite being marginalized by the dialogue and ecumenical movements, the reality of Jesus-believing Jews cannot be ignored forever."⁵⁵

Military culture does much the same; Americans who have served represent experiences of national interest uncommon and often uncomfortable to others. Meanwhile they carry a burden

⁵¹ David Irving, *The War Path: Hitler's Germany 1933-1939* (London: Papermac, 1983), xxi.

⁵² Edward Flannery, quoted in Dennis Prager and Joseph Telushkin, *Why the Jews? The Reason for Antisemitism* (New York: Touchstone, 2003), vi.

⁵³ Theodor Hertzl, *The Jewish State*, trans. Sylvie d'Avigdor (London: Nutt, 1896), 75.

⁵⁴ The emergence of the Messianic Jewish Movement of the 1960's due in a significant degree to Protestant outreach, including Chosen People Ministries and Jews for Jesus. Today, three major organizations stand independently, Union of Messianic Jewish Congregations, Messianic Jewish Association of America, and International Alliance of Messianic Congregations and Synagogues.

⁵⁵ Richard Robinson, "Judaism: Current Issues," in *Handbook of Religion: A Christian Engagement with Traditions, Teachings, and Practices*, eds. Terry Muck, Harold Netland, and Gerald McDermott (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2014), 142.

of understanding also uncommon to others. Sometimes there is lasting suffering, resulting from a sacrifice necessary for the preservation of national interests.

Contemporary Messianic Jewish Identity as Theology

Messianic Judaism derives its theological identity from the covenants, which are connected in God's plan for redemption of the world through Messiah Yeshua. God blessed the world by his covenant with Avraham (Ge 12:1-7). He continues to bless by covenantal expansion through Moshe where Avraham's seed (one of the blessings) becomes a nation in its land (Ex 19 – Lv 27; another of the blessings). God introduces himself as king over Israel (Dt 6:4-9) and establishes his Torah in love (Ex 6:6-8; Ro 10:5-8), later to be ratified as a renewed covenant (Je 31:31-39), through the Anointed One, Yeshua.

The anointing of a person is intended for prophets, priests and kings, set aside for God's purpose (Ex 28:41). This king's anointing is by its very name (anointed, Messiah, Christ), the very hope of Judaism. The following quote reflects parallels of Orthodox Judaism's understanding of a Messiah. It acknowledges that a dead Messiah is no Messiah at all. However, it is modern Messianic Judaism which recognizes Yeshua as having overcome death.

If a king will arise from the House of David who is learned in Torah and observant of the mitzvot [instruction, law), as David his ancestor was, and will compel all of Israel to walk in the way of the Torah and reinforce the breaches; and fight the wars of G-d, we may, with assurance, consider him the Messiah. ... If he did not succeed to this degree or he was killed, he surely is not the redeemer promised by the Torah...⁵⁶

Messianic Jewish groups are inherently religious, at the least; deeply committed to their understanding of who God is, at most. This point is significant in the fact that the God of Messianic Judaism is relational and faithful (covenantal), personal as in Christianity, yet still

⁵⁶ Mishneh Torah: Hilchot Melachim, Laws Concerning Kings, xi: 4.

inextricably cultural, as in mainstream Judaism. Regardless, such things only take precedence as biblical concepts, theology is central. This does not distinguish it from other forms of Judaism that seek holiness. However, much of the early rabbinic guarding against “heresy” in the first centuries remains to this day and may be significantly stronger as a result of facing centuries of deadly anti-Semitism from Christianity. “Certainly, the fact that no similar repudiation [against belief in a divine messiah] is made, for example, of Jews confessing Buddhist or Hindu beliefs and practices, or atheism, which are no less theologically problematic than Trinitarianism, suggests the issue is at least as much sociological and historical as it is strictly theological.”⁵⁷

The foundations of Messianic Jewish theology rests on the linguistic, historical, and cultural context of the history of the Bible when examining the New Testament (*B'rit Chadashah*) and recognizing the legitimacy of Yeshua as both God and Messiah (man). Other terms utilized in Messianic Judaism are the “Newer Testament,” and in covenantal terms, advocated by Rabbi Doctor John Fischer, “Renewed Covenant.”⁵⁸ Fischer’s description identifies all the Covenants God made to Avraham, Moshe, and David as essentially one, and “renewed” by Yeshua through his ratification as “*Kippur*,” his atoning sacrifice for the separation of God and man caused by events in Genesis 1. This furthermore binds “Old” and “New” Covenants as one, complete Jewish Bible⁵⁹ from Genesis to Revelation (Rv 1:8; 22:13).

Messianic Judaism strains the relational ties from Judaism to Christianity and back. Messianic Jewish groups are centrally biblical at the core of their values, the amalgamation of

⁵⁷ Shapiro, “Jesus for Jews,” 3.

⁵⁸ John Fischer, “Covenant, Fulfillment and Judaism in Hebrews,” *Evangelical Review of Theology* 13 (1989): 175-87.

⁵⁹ Hence, the title of Stern’s work, *The Complete Jewish Bible* (see iii).

Tanakh with New Covenant Scriptures. Hebrew perspective is heavily emphasized, without dismissing indisputable Greek expression. Yeshua as Messiah is held central, yet with continual examining of the nuances of his behaviors, authority, and teachings as a rabbi. Messianic Jews are immersed in Jewish thought and perspective, but it is the adherence to the biblical narrative that Messianic Jews cling to more than anything else, including the theology, the values, and the nature of the relationship with God. Yet, they are held suspect by both Jewish and Christian worlds, and as communal creatures. This dynamic affects psyche, such has been recognized by the Israeli Messianic Counseling Ministry, Everlasting Arms;

It [body of Messiah in Israel] is largely comprised of immigrants from all over the world, carrying different cultural heritages, languages, and different Messianic and Christian traditions. Issues of identity as Jewish believers/Messianic Jews, compounded by a growing rejection from the general population within a very stressful part of the world cause great spiritual, emotional, and physical stress for many believers in Israel.⁶⁰

Kaplan argues that the mechanics of a culture's psychology is based in a core set of beliefs (a narrative).⁶¹ Messianic Judaism values its perspective of biblical narrative, where theology impacts worldview and identity. As much could be said of any group that emphasizes the centrality of the Bible.⁶² However, the broader Jewish theological context (beyond strictly Messianic) includes a unique compilation of concepts stricken together; These include variations in biblical structure different from Christianity to derive specific meanings unique to Jewish life,

⁶⁰ Erez Soref, "Everlasting Arms: Messianic Counseling." *Mishkan* 40, no. 2 (2004): 42.

⁶¹ Kalman Kaplan. "Obedience and Disobedience/Rebellion in Biblical Versus Greek Narratives: Toward a Biblical Psychology," *Pastoral Psychology* 60, no.5 (March, 2011): 659.

⁶² Michael McGowan, "Trauma and grace: Psychology and Theology in Conversation," *Pastoral Psychology* 58, no. 2 (April 2009): 167-180.

beliefs, rituals, identity and psychological benefits to religious value,⁶³ rooted in Hebraics.⁶⁴ Messianic Judaism emphasizes a stronger leaning toward the Hebraic theological tenets (top down), along with those cited above from the Krichiver document, than Greek, yet is not dismissive of such. Such a bend of theological underpinnings is evident in literature produced by Messianic scholars, but also in liturgy, tradition, and symbolism of contemporary time. Yet when these tenets are ambiguous regarding Jewish or Greek origins, Messianic Judaism tends toward the Jewish from the importance of preserving context and identity.

As ancient and modern rabbis studied the Torah, they strove to interpret its meaning and instructions for their time... The liturgy... is within the Siddur, the Jewish prayer book, which is based on tradition with a biblical foundation... In the context of a Torah service, many prayers are recited... [The] Alenu... basically expresses gratitude and praise to God for giving the covenant, the Torah, and making the Jews His covenant people... Jews observe both religious cycles and life cycle events... In Messianic Judaism, when a person comes to believe in Yeshua as the Messiah, they are immersed in water in obedience with biblical commands. Due to the connotations of the term baptism, Messianic Jews prefer the term immersion.⁶⁵

Messianic Jews are sometimes cautious, perhaps biased, that Greek underpinnings may lead to a narrative belief system rooted in Greek philosophy. In support of these concerns Kaplan (a non-Messianic Jew), draws into question the significance of Greek philosophy in some Christian biblical interpretations.⁶⁶ One may want to treat it cautiously, and consider personal preferences. In the following example, a dichotomous parallel is depicted between theological underpinnings and experience.

⁶³ Tami Krichiver, "Positive Psychology and the Jewish Holiday Calendar: A Resource Manual for Small Groups" (PhD diss., Pepperdine University, 2010), 40-72.

⁶⁴ David Aaron, *Biblical Ambiguities: Metaphor, Semantics and Divine Imagery* (Leiden: Brill, 2011), ix, 221.

⁶⁵ Elizabeth Ames, "Messianic Jewish Liturgical Practices" (PhD diss., Liberty University, 2014), 9-11.

⁶⁶ Kalman Kaplan. "Obedience and Disobedience," 660.

The Christian and Messianic Jewish doctrine that Miriam was a virgin at conception of Yeshua and remained so until after his birth is a linguistic construct that occurred during the time that Christianity historically called the “400 years of silence.” In other words, Christianity proclaims God did not speak from the time of Malachi until the time of the Gospels. Yet Jewish history depicts this time to be of tremendous political, religious, and theological tumult, some of the tumult being on the quest for Messiah.

God may not have been silent. If the Divine Christian Messiah was indeed at work, then he may be responsible for the transformation of understanding that occurred in the translations out of the Hebrew Bible into Greek that resulted in the Septuagint. For example, the very word, “virgin” in Matthew 1:23 was translated from more ambiguous use of a synonym from its Semitic root in Isaiah 7:1. The original meaning was not necessarily “virgin,” but did not rule it out. While the Hebrew may not have been able to succinctly imply “virgin,” Greek could clearly state it. Without this word, Christian doctrine of a virgin birth is void. This raises the question, did God use the evolution of translation from Isaiah 7:1, into Matthew 1:23, in order to fulfill the Abrahamic Covenant and bless all the families of the earth with a Divine Messiah for all (Is 49:6; Mi 5:6)?

The Hebrew word ‘almah’ in Isaiah 7:14 means “young woman,” and in the context of the *Tanakh* always “a young woman of unsullied reputation,” which is why Jewish translators of the Septuagint, the Greek version of the *Tanakh* prepared 200 years before Yeshua’s birth, rendered this word into Greek as *parthenos*, “virgin”; this is the word used at Matthew 1:23.⁶⁷

The Septuagint translation from Semitic foundation to Greek, renders the word explicitly depicting a virgin (*parthenos*); “[The] construct state form that existed in its own right [leads to

⁶⁷ Stern, *Complete Jewish Bible*, xlv.

a] genitive as a morphological category [that] is found in other languages, but not in Hebrew.’⁶⁸

In other words, to make the point that Yeshua was born of a virgin, Kartveit argues that the translation from a Semitic expression to Greek was necessary. Indeed, God’s promise to Avraham that he would bless many nations has evidently been reached through a Jewish Messiah, but primarily by Greek understanding in the New Testament.

The nuance of this kind of insight requires an ability to understand the subtleties of Messianic Judaism’s position between mainstream Judaism and Christianity. In the same way, veterans in the Messianic Jewish movement carry the institutional application of military life with them to a civilian world where they must function without expecting others to understand their worldview. They must derive a personal synthesis of their adult origins from military culture to apply in a civilian world.

Messianic Judaism and Its Distinction from Rabbinic Judaism and Christianity

Messianic Judaism brings Torah to its full glory through its focus on Yeshua as Messiah. It adheres to Israel and the Jewish people as much as to the church in accordance with Isaiah 49:6, where God assigns himself to serve Israel, and the Gentiles “to the end of the earth.” The centrality and identification with Torah (first five books of the Old Testament) and its application is the common theme among all Jewish groups. A distinction from Messianic Jewish and Christian theologies is that Christian theology often departs from Torah, called Mosaic Law, and its Hebrew context. This departure strains understanding of who Messiah Yeshua is and his relevance in New Covenant Scripture (*B’rit Chadasha*).

⁶⁸ Magnar Kartveit, *Rejoice, Dear Zion! Hebrew Construct Phrases with 'Daughter' and 'Virgin' as Nomen Regens* (Boston: DeGuyter, 2013), 103, 112.

The writers of B'rit Chadasha were mostly Jewish who wrote essentially in Greek. The Hebraisms behind their Greek terms are evident, while their Jewishness is available to the observant reader.⁶⁹ Messianic Judaism demonstrates a seamless alignment of Jewish Torah, Tanakh, and *B'rit Chadashah* without negation of their Jewish context.⁷⁰ Perhaps it is the distractions of language or culture that distances acceptance and rejection of various canons, and what each group believes as ultimate truth.⁷¹ Yet cultural relevance of the writers in their “Hebrew-Greek lends credence to the Jewish context of B'rit Chadashah.”⁷²

While seeking truth is a quest for all humanity, seeking truthful Hebraic idioms wherever they are, in and of itself, is one of many Jewish practices.⁷³ Veterans are also often known to be seekers. Military operations rely on facts and knowledge for successful missions. These things are communicated in their own military language and culture. So, too, are veterans able to seek truth in knowledge of Torah, based on an inherent need to be well informed as part of an orientation toward purpose in life (mission).

A Note on Language and Context

The linguist, Noam Chomsky's modular learning theory, rooted in cognitive psychology, lends a scientific credibility to the centrality of Torah as it affects Jewish thought. Some 39

⁶⁹ Eberhard Bons, Ralph Brucker, and Jan Joosten, eds., *The Reception of Septuagint Words in Jewish-Hellenistic and Christian Literature* (Tubingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2014), viii-213.

⁷⁰ Stern, *Complete Jewish Study Bible*, xxvii-xxxiii. Abbreviate footnotes after the first reference.

⁷¹ In Genesis 11, we see that God intentionally distracted the consolidated power of humanity by diversifying language. While the purpose of the action was for the benefit of humanity, it also causes great divide among seekers of biblical truth to this day.

⁷² Stern (Ed.). *Complete Jewish Study Bible*, xl-xlv.

⁷³ Joseph Hertz, ed., *The Pentateuch and Haftorahs: Hebrew Text English Translation and Commentary* (London: Soncino Press, 1937), vii.

percent of pioneers in psychology were raised in Jewish homes (many of them Orthodox, with the study of biblical Hebraisms).⁷⁴ Adherents to Chomsky's modular linguistic theory strongly support the correlation of human thought to a speaker's first acquired language.⁷⁵

Messianic theology is of a distinct Hebraic understanding, even though New Testament is essentially a Greek document. However, it is inspired by Hebrew-based thought. While encompassing many things different from Jewish orthodoxy, it is a distinct linguistic understanding from its close relationship with Christianity. "Messianic Judaism is a movement of Jewish congregations and congregation-like groupings committed to Yeshua the Messiah that embrace the covenantal responsibility of Jewish life and identity rooted in Torah, expressed in tradition, and renewed and applied in the context of the New Covenant."⁷⁶

The context of Torah is love, with its emphasis upon covenant, promise, and union between God and humanity. A Messianic Jewish perspective bridges rabbinic perspective, when it is discernible, to New Covenant purpose, but solely for the purpose of contextualizing love from Torah to *B'rit Chadashah*. For example, "Paul's source [for Romans 5:12-21] was close to a nomistic⁷⁷ non-Christological passage attributed to Rabbi Yose in the *Sifra*, as well as to other Jewish passages."⁷⁸ Fischer points to the tension between legalism and "nomism" in the Pauline

⁷⁴ Steven J. Haggblom, et. al., "The 100 Most Eminent Psychologists of the 20th Century," *Review of General Psychology* 6, no. 2 (2002): 146-47.

⁷⁵ Geoffrey Harpham, "Chomsky and the Rest of Us," review of Robert F. Barsky, "Noam Chomsky: A Life of Dissent" *Salmagundi* 121/122 (Winter, 1999): 211-237, accessed January 19, 2017, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/i40023919>.

⁷⁶Russ Resnik, "Defining Messianic Judaism - A Commentary," *Kesher- A Journal of Messianic Judaism* 17 (March 2004), accessed January 19, 2017. http://www.kesherjournal.com/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=66&Itemid=.

⁷⁷ Having a moral basis.

⁷⁸ Menahem Kister, "Romans 5:12-21 against the Background of Torah-Theology and Hebrew Usage," *Harvard Theological Review* 100, no. 4 (2007): 392.

period: “[Reacting nomism] consisted of molding one's life in all its varying relations according to the Law in response to the love and grace of God.”⁷⁹

[A] nomistic Pharisee ... while he insisted that faith was wholehearted trust in God and fidelity to His instruction, his emphasis, as opposed to the legalist, was upon God and trust in Him. He agreed that 'God demands obedience', but likewise insisted that such was 'only as the proof and expression of something else; the intimate personal attitude of trust and love'. Yet he did not forget for a moment that such faith is 'of value only so far as it is productive of faithful action'. Thus, emunah was both 'trust in' and 'fidelity to'; reliance and faithfulness. (cf. 1QHab 2.4 and 1QS adjunct). The emphasis must always be upon the former, though without negating the importance of the latter. In this he was a true child of Old Testament piety.⁸⁰

Gentiles are brought into the covenant relationship symbolized as a branch grafted onto an olive tree [peace] (Ro 11:17), through Yeshua, the Jewish Messiah. There is no Scripture declaring that God reneges on any aspect of any covenant with Israel. The Abrahamic covenant establishes the context of God's promises. In Genesis 13:14-17, God promises the land of Israel to him and his descendants. In verse 18, Avraham responds with faithfulness, but the failings of him and his descendants prove God's promises to be literal, eternal, and unconditional, as Israel's blessings are returning along with her existence. The story of Israel in Tanakh depicts the ebb and flow of blessing and curse based on their faithfulness; yet, God does not abandon, nor waiver from his faithfulness to them. This is evident in his character.

Messianic Judaism receives Messiah Yeshua as the embodied fulfillment of the covenants in Tanakh and *B'rit Chadashah* and as the authoritative guide for the application of

⁷⁹ John Fischer, “Paul in his Jewish Context,” *Evangelical Quarterly* 57, no. 3 (July 1985): 216-17.

⁸⁰ Richard Longenecker, *Paul, Apostle of Liberty: The Origin and Nature of Paul's Christianity* (New York: Harper and Row, 1964), 82-83.

the Tanakh today (Mt 5:17). Yeshua corrected the Torah-teacher's legalistic perspective, to enlighten all of the nomistic reaction perspective:

Rabbi, which of the *mitzvat* in the Torah is the most important?" He told them, "You are to love Adonai your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your strength. This is the greatest and most important *mitzvah*. And the second is similar to it, 'You are to love your neighbor as yourself.' All the Torah and the Prophets are dependent on these two *mitzvot* (Mt. 22:36-40).

These concepts of constancy and oneness lend credence to God's faithfulness through the Abrahamic, Mosaic, Davidic, and New covenants, as literal and irrevocable. Romans 11:29 explains God's Covenant faithfulness to Israel "for the sake of the patriarchs."⁸¹ God blessed the world by his Covenant with Abraham (Ge 17:1-8).

Yeshua: The Hebrew Name of a Jewish Messiah to all Nations

This and following sections discuss Yeshua as Messiah, servant, and Warrior. He is examined in a Messianic Jewish context as king, Messiah, and servant. Jewish thought alludes to principles of Messianic Judaism and Christianity such as the compelling nature of Torah to draw all people to God through love. In that way, messianic prophesy, whether Christian or Jewish, encompasses everyone in the context of one book - Tanakh to *B'rit Chadashah*:

In that era there will be neither famine nor war, neither envy nor strife, because good will emanate in abundance and all delightful things will be accessible as dust. The one preoccupation of the entire world will be solely to know G- d. The Israelites, therefore, will be great sages and know the hidden matters, and they will attain knowledge of their Creator to the extent of human capacity, as it is said: "The earth shall be full with the knowledge of G- d as the waters cover the sea!"⁸²

⁸¹ David Stern, *Jewish New Testament Commentary* (Clarksville, MD: Jewish New Testament Publications, 1992), 424.

⁸² Mishneh Torah: *Hilchot Melachim, Laws Concerning Kings*, xi. 5.

It is not an easy path to respond to God's love and to emulate Yeshua in nomistic obedience (He 12:2). Yet it is, indeed, the love of Yeshua, Son of David, that compels his followers.

Some would consider that the re-emergence of what is recognized today as Messianic Judaism is a prophetic emergence of God restoring Israel and Jerusalem (Rv 21:1-3)⁸³ from which Yeshua will fulfill God's promise to David that his descendants will reign forever. This began with the Messianic birth which occurred in unassuming circumstances. Torah was fulfilled upon his death (but not abolished), with atonement completed and the Davidic line was established forever.

The Davidic Covenant delivered Messiah. The Mosaic Covenant was fulfilled as Yeshua proclaimed that he did so and rose from the dead (Jn 19:30). It is the Messianic Jewish perspective that because of Yeshua's fulfillment of the Mosaic Covenant (Mt 5:17-18), its reliance on the Abrahamic Covenant is therefore a fulfillment of both; Moshe received Torah in the desert as God promised Avraham that he would deliver his descendants from slavery into the land (Ge 15:13). Such is a reflection- a foreshadowing- that Israel is blessed forever, and is and will be a blessing to all nations: Yeshua blesses all nations as the fulfillment of Torah and the covenants.

Servant, Son of David

"Yeshua derives his human-office of Messianic King from Yosef, but his divine quality from his Divine Father."⁸⁴ In Jewish tradition, a king is first and foremost a servant of the people.

⁸³ Stern, *Complete Jewish Study Bible*, 1808n. Revelation 21:3 is an important verse which describes the final fulfillment of the most frequently repeated covenant promise in the Tanakh: that God will live with his people and be their God, with fellowship restored as in the Garden of Eden (see Ezekiel 37:27, for example).

⁸⁴ Cyrus H. Gordon, *Before the Bible: The Common Background of Greek and Hebrew Civilizations* (New York: Harper and Row, 1962), 291.

In loving-mercy (chesed), his decrees and laws are for the good of the people over which he is responsible. Yeshua fulfills the covenant lineage as heir to the Davidic throne (Mt 1). It is his position that rulership is one of love and, therefore, service (Mk 10:41-45). This is his nature and his purpose, and for the discerning heart, a nomistic example to follow (Mt 22:36-40).

The example of God's love and service starts before Yeshua's birth. From Genesis 46 through Exodus 18, God's faithfulness to and preservation of Israel is a testimony of love and mercy. His priority of love is demonstrated in his obedience and faithfulness to his covenants, to which others are called to emulate (He 12:2). Through his covenant with Moshe, Avraham's seed becomes a nation that begins to inhabit the land of Israel where Messiah will complete Torah (Ex 19 – Lv 27; Mt 5:17-18). Before God establishes his covenant with King David, he depicts himself as king over Israel (Ex 19:8). However, this kingly rulership is through a context of love, as the key to his covenants (Dt 4:37; Ro 10:6-8).

Just as he brings life through the House of David, he brings love through Torah. His love is so great, he renews (Jo 24:25; He 9:14-18) his covenants through the New Covenant so that all humankind may respond (Jn 3:16). He says, "I will give you a new heart and put a new spirit inside you; I will take the stony heart out of your flesh and give you a heart of flesh. I will put my Spirit inside you to live by my laws, respect my rulings and obey them" (Ez 36:26-27).

Following the Warrior Yeshua

Yeshua, being the established King of the Davidic line, is also the Messiah. It is he that humankind can follow away from sinful nature. The path of Messianic Judaism is sanctification of character resulting from a relationship with the Messiah Yeshua. It is the development of an identity of faith. This identity transcends all other aspects of culture and vocation, which are

inherent elements of military life. The veteran who shifts his or her understanding of self from servicemember to veteran, may be confronted with many challenges regarding identity, as well as skills regarding everyday civilian life. Many are also confronted with challenges of the heart and mind that include posttraumatic stress disorder, depression, and moral injury. Whether such issues were imposed, or the veteran is free of such issues, they will experience significant changes in identity.

For those who turn to God for assistance in the transition, they will be confronted with aspects of their own sin and selfishness. Just as any member of the military is a contributor to a warrior culture, so, too, Yeshua models a warrior victory that veterans can choose to identify with on a cultural, if not a personal level. God knew the enemy in the garden, and he knew Adam and Eve. Conversely, they did not know the enemy, nor did they seem to know themselves. Yeshua, the warrior, knows both himself and his enemy (Mt 4:1-11). The entire book, *The Art of War* is based on this premise.⁸⁵

Enemies: *Nahash ha-Kadmoni* (the Serpent) and *Yetzer hara* (Evil Inclination)

Humankind is matched by sin and Satan. Sin is better understood within the relationship between God and human curiosity. One possible reason for God to allow sin is to protect us. In this same way, God commanded Adam and Eve to avoid the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil (Ge 2-3). Biblical history demonstrates that the dangers were cunning. Rachmiel Frydland explains, “The ‘ancient serpent,’ (*nahash ha-kadmoni*) was subtler than any other creature and proved irresistible to Eve, and then to Adam.”⁸⁶

⁸⁵ Sun-tzu, and Samuel B. Griffith. *The Art of War*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964.

⁸⁶ Rachmiel Frydland, *What the Rabbis Know About the Messiah*, ed. Elliot Klayman (Columbus, OH: Messianic Publishing, 2011), 11.

Clearly, the premise of forbidding did not work. It appears that “*nahash ha-kadmoni*” knew the principle that humankind was capable of independent, free and intelligent thought, and free will, before Eve ate from the Tree of Knowledge. *Nahash ha-kadmoni* tempted Eve with the opportunity to acquire self-awareness (Ge 3:5), much like Rene Descartes announced his awareness through the conscious mind, “*Cogito ergo sum* (I think therefore I am).”⁸⁷

It was “*nahash ha-kadmoni*” who used the potential of Eve’s self-awareness (before she was aware that she had it) by suggesting that she consider God’s warning against a higher level of consciousness as innocuous (Ge 3:4). The result of the consideration (whether to seek higher consciousness) is similar in principle to Descartes proclamation. However, Eve’s consideration that she will not actually die if she is disobedient, as suggested by *nahash ha-kadmoni*, reflects the third law of Isaac Newton;⁸⁸ “Any single force is only one aspect of a mutual interaction between two entities, be they principles, physicalities, or institutions.”⁸⁹ It is the interaction of *nahash ha-kadmoni* subtleties with Eve’s thoughts regarding a false belief that disobedience is innocuous that led to the “single force” of disobedience (Ja 1:15). *Nahash ha-kadmoni*’s words to Eve created the “mutual interaction” between him and her and thus, her consideration to act independently and raise her awareness, or awareness of identity, was the birth of sin in humankind. Had *nahash ha-kadmoni* not presented himself, it is not certain that would have been

⁸⁷ William Burns, *The Scientific Revolution: An Encyclopedia* (Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 2001), 84.

⁸⁸ Derek Whiteside, “The Prehistory of the ‘Principia’ from 1664 to 1686,” *Notes and Records of the Royal Society of London* 45, no. 1 (January 1991): 11-61.

⁸⁹ Robert Resnick and David Halliday, *Physics*, Third Edition (Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, 1977), 78–79.

compelled Eve into rebellion would have occurred, in spite of her inclination to do so. She was simply unaware of it.

God, who later identified himself to Moshe as “I am that I am” (YHVH, Ex 3:14), commanded Adam and Eve not to set disobedience in motion (Ge 2:17). The disobedience was an action, and God depicted reaction (Ge 3:14-19).⁹⁰ *Nahash ha-kadmoni* prompted action into motion by questioning Eve of her consciousness, indeed her existence: “Did God really say, ‘You must not eat from all the trees of the garden?’” (Ge. 3:1[b]) It is noteworthy that the biblical history of human behavior begins with dialogical encounter. After sin occurred, God and Adam met and God asks, “*ayyekah* (where are you)?” The question is an existential one. God is not asking about location; “Adam was not expected to describe where he was (though he did), but what he was doing.”⁹¹

This writer suggests that Descartes’ philosophical ponderings depict the nature of *yetzer hara*, derived through human awareness: “Since I doubt, I think; since I think, I exist; I doubt, therefore I think, therefore I am.”⁹² *Nahash ha-Kadmoni* suggested she would “be like God (Ge 3:5; Ge 3:22)”; this was also the desire of Lucifer ((Is 14: 12-17). This is *yetzer hara* (Ge 3:22) and the subtlety of the serpent to be aware of; that the enemies of which Yeshua combats which challenges veteran and non-veteran alike.

⁹⁰ It should also be noted that God’s deliberate reaction was not restricted to ‘the curse’; it also included immediate action toward restoration as depicted in Gn 3:21.

⁹¹ Jakob Jocz, “The Jewish-Christian Dialogue: a Theological Assessment,” *Mishkan* 3 (1985): 4.

⁹² René Descartes. *The Correspondence between Princess Elisabeth of Bohemia and René Descartes*. Trans. Lisa Shapiro (University of Chicago Press, 2007), 5.

Yetzer hara also wars against Yeshua and humankind. It is a “warrior dedicated to deluding and misleading the human mind... causing it to mix up moral categories and to resist change and growth.”⁹³ Luzzatto’s counter to the *yetzer hara* is a messianic figure, “This is the path, take it.”⁹⁴ Should the devil be a warrior, then bewilderment and confusion in the human mind is war. If the purpose of Messiah is to overcome *yetzer hara*, then he, Yeshua, is a warrior, the counter to *yetzer hara*. Yeshua is the warrior that can guide the human mind away from that war of confusion and bring them to peace, clarity, and faithfulness (Jo 14:6).

Rabbi Sha’ul (Apostle Paul), after pointing out that nothing supersedes freedom of the atoning sacrifice of Yeshua’s blood, points to a higher way; he appeals to all to “follow him” as he follows Yeshua (1 Co 11:1). For those seeking the closeness of their identity to God’s they are called to follow a warrior who has won against *yetzer hara*- our evil inclination- a way established to overcome by fulfilling Torah. Christians often mistake this principle as returning to the Law. But it is adhering to a life pleasing to God by choice (Mt 22:36-40). This level of understanding, leads a Yeshua follower to the matter of heart; “This is the covenant which I will make with them after those days,’ says Adonai: ‘I will put my Torah on their hearts, and write it on their minds’” (Je 31:32).

Rabbi Hertz says that the “heart resides at the seat of the intellect.”⁹⁵ This matter of Yeshua sending his Holy Spirit to write Torah on the hearts of people, was a matter of

⁹³ Andrew Heinze, "The Americanization of Mussar: Abraham Twerski's Twelve Steps," *Judaism* 48, no. 4 (1999): 454.

⁹⁴ Moshe Chaim Luzzatto and Shraga Silverstein, *Mesillat Yesharim: The Path of the Just*, 3rd rev. ed. (Jerusalem: Feldheim, 1990), 11.

⁹⁵ Azriel Rozenfeld, “The Heart, the Head, and the Halakah,” ed. by William Ober, *New York State Journal of Medicine* 70 (15 October 1970): 2615.

overcoming sin. This was his purpose, his teaching (Mt 5:21), and was reflective of his authority which believers are called to obey, even unto warfare. If he is the fulfiller and teacher of Torah, spoken of as the angel of God in Genesis 24 and Exodus 23, then he is the warrior, whose objects of battle are the hearts and minds of people. This is the war that implicates each believer overcoming one's own *yetzer hara* (the battle within against sin).

Yeshua asked them a question, saying, 'What do you think about the Messiah? Whose Son is He?' 'David's,' they say to Him. 'Then how is it,' He says to them, 'that David by the Ruach calls him 'Lord'? For he says, 'Adonai said to my Lord, "Sit at My right hand, until I put Your enemies under Your feet."'"

Servant, Son of Man

Yeshua establishes himself as "merely a son of man," before all people (Ze 12:10; Mt 20:17-19). And yet, in his actions, he exerts authority as one who stands above all in physical and spiritual form, Son of Man (Mt 12:8). Servicemembers dichotomy of authority (such as making decisions regarding life and death, etc.) and the act of serving to a point even unto death, have this genre of their life to relate to Yeshua. He depicts himself as servant, and yet Lord of all. Moreover, there is discretion in what servicemember do, much like there was in order for Yeshua to accomplish his own mission. "In Mark 9, [the disciples] are commanded not to speak of what they had seen until the Son of [Man] should have risen from the dead... But with the resurrection comes the revelation to all."⁹⁶

At the appointed time, Yeshua proclaimed his authority as Son of Man and Messiah of the covenants; As much as the Sabbath is a sign of the Mosaic Covenant (Ex 31:16-17; Ez 20:12; Ne 20:13-14), Yeshua proclaims himself as Lord of the Sabbath (Mt 12:8). "But look! I will

⁹⁶ James Dunn, "The Messianic Secret in Mark," *Tyndale Bulletin* 21 (1970): 93.

prove to you that the Son of Man has authority on earth to forgive sins.’ He then said to the paralyzed man, ‘Get up, pick up your mattress, and go home’” (Mt 9:6)!

Orthodox Rabbi and New Testament scholar, Daniel Boyarin, addresses the so called “*sogenannte* (Son of Man) issue, this man who forgives sin.”⁹⁷ Utilizing philology, he adapts a methodical system in order to analyze the true meaning of what Yeshua meant as proclaiming himself, Son of Man.

As with many such issues, some clarity can be introduced by separating out different parts of the issue... Once we bracket these questions entirely [of the historical Jesus], which are not, in any case, properly the subject of the study of the Gospels, then the question becomes much simpler... Once we reframe the question as a philological, literary-historical one and not a theological or psychological one, the task is more straightforward...⁹⁸

Boyarin makes theological considerations from the concept of Son of Man/*sogenannte*. He draws attention to the concept as an exclusively historical question and finds no deductive reason regarding divine power. Boyarin then determines that the Hebrew, Aramaic, and Greek, whether individualized or coordinated, obscure the issue further. Then he considers the structure of the grammatical influence, evolving in the development of its “historical and linguistic” relationships as opposed to ‘linguistic’ or ‘theological’ considerations as more important.

Son of Man is first seen in Daniel 7 which deduces that this is the only biblical connection to which Mark can follow chronologically. So, it becomes a matter of how the term “Son of Man” was utilized between the time of Daniel and the time of Mark. Boyarin refers to 1 Enoch, not as a canonical reference, but as a ‘historical and linguistic’ development. Daniel 7 defines “one like” Son of Man as it is described in 1 Enoch. Yeshua, the Nazarene, proclaims Himself as Son of Man (Mk 13:26), Lord of Shabbat (Mk 2:28), who forgives sin (Mk 2:10). It is the magnitude, the authority, power, and position which are the Son of Man.⁹⁹

⁹⁷ Daniel Boyarin, "How Enoch Can Teach Us About Jesus," *Early Christianity* 2, no. 1 (2011): 53.

⁹⁸ Nicholas T. Wright, “Two Radical Jews: A Review Article of Daniel Boyarin, ‘A Radical Jew: Paul and the Politics of Identity,’” *Reviews in Religion and Theology* 2, no. 3 (August 1996): 15.

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, 23.

As servant and authority, Yeshua takes ownership of Torah itself: “Do not think that I came to abolish the Torah or the Prophets! I did not come to abolish, but to fulfill” (Mt 5:17). He makes it possible to overcome the influence of *nahash ha-kadmoni* who convinced Eve to activate *yetzer hara* by questioning her existence. An unbeliever may affirm their own existence with awareness of their thoughts. However, believers are made aware of their thoughts by the existence of God and his accomplishments to reach us.

Now who would speak so authoritatively against *Midrash* but God himself? Such was Yeshua proclaiming himself above all others. Indeed, “*V’Ahavta*” is the Jewish tradition of reciting what Yeshua called the greatest commandment. Yet, it is the carrying out of this commandment that is the manifestation of following Yeshua into victory over *yetzer hara*; ‘You shall love Adonai your God with all your heart, and with all your soul, and with all your mind.’ This is the first and greatest commandment. And the second is like it, ‘You shall love your neighbor as yourself.’ The entire Torah and the Prophets hang on these two commandments.

So, to find Messiah with the authority of God as Son of Man, can be discovered in the engagement of Jewish discourse. The urgency of Eve’s existential conundrum set in motion by Satan (*nahash ha-kadmoni*) must synthesize with other recognized sources. This is grounding truth in logic. Therefore, we use logic in biblical theology to find truth: We seek plain truth.

Messiah promised, Yeshua delivered

Indeed, God's covenantal promises leading to Messiah is established on Semitic foundation of grace.¹⁰⁰ As Noah blessed Shem and Yefet (Japhet), so God assured that the Gentiles of Yefet would be drawn to the *Shekinah* glory dwelling in the tents of Shem.¹⁰¹

God passes the promise of land, seed (of Messiah), and blessing from Avraham (Ge 17:1-8) to Israel (Rom 11:29). He then begins to evolve the Hebrews from slave mentality to a priestly nation, based in Torah, by the covenant through Moshe. Avraham's seed becomes a nation that begins to inhabit the land of Israel (Ex 19 - Lv 27). Yeshua himself fulfills Israel's calling as the *Shekinah* glory of Shem's blessing (Jn 1:14), and the Chanukah light to all nations (Jn 1:4-5). He is, as well, heir to the throne of David. "If a king will arise from the House of David who is learned in Torah and observant of the mitzvot [instruction, law], as David his ancestor was, and will compel all of Israel to walk in the way of the Torah and reinforce the breaches; and fight the wars of G-d, we may, with assurance, consider him the Messiah" (Mishneh Torah).¹⁰²

Conclusion

Many of Yeshua's actions and those of his followers are best understood by looking closely at the Hebrew context of the New Testament. When observing the very persons and their actions, a greater pastoral perspective is gained in order to utilize scripture as text for the purpose of Messianic Jewish pastoral counseling. Truly observing the motives, beliefs, and actions of

¹⁰⁰ Roger Brooks, *The Spirit of the Ten Commandments: Shattering the Myth of Rabbinic Legalism* (San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1990), 54.

¹⁰¹ Frydland, *What the Rabbis Know About the Messiah*, 8.

¹⁰²Eli Lizorkin-Eyzenberg, *The Jewish Gospel of John: Discovering Jesus, King of All Israel* (Charleston, SC: CreateSpace, 2015), 322.

biblical characters gives Messianic Jewish pastoral counseling an endless mine of knowledge into human construct and behavior, with the added benefit of including God in the dynamic.

The Messianic Jewish perspective is a middle-way between mainstream Judaism and Christianity. In this way, it parallels American military culture that while unequivocally American, is narrowed by experiences and purpose. Members of the Messianic Jewish movement often find themselves defending their identity from Jewish family members and their very faith perspective from Christian friends. It is often the point of resolve to the defendants to accept the isolation that is concurrent with misunderstanding. The final solution to this is to focus not on the conflict, but on the purpose- to become the person God wants them to be, and to become a better Jew. This same solution-focused approach is the solution to the challenges of military transition. Whether there are related mental and emotional challenges or not, veterans (and everyone) are called to continue to transform their identity closer to God, to be fruitful in purpose, and to know their God.

CHAPTER 3

APPLICATIONS OF PSYCHOLOGY AND SPIRITUALITY IN VETERAN CULTURE

The Evolution

The purpose of this literature review is to trace the history of management of combat injuries in American conflict from World War I, and its effects on the evolution of treatment in psychological injuries, and to orient towards a solution with lasting effects. The aggressive behavior of addressing physical wounds in combat may be due to the tangible mitigation of “weakness” on the battlefield. This is reflective of the medical model of treatment, where injury or illness is recognized, diagnosed, and addressed.

Effects of the medical model of treatment in “invisible injuries,” such as posttraumatic stress disorder, depression, anxiety, addiction, and moral injury are seen in the history of these aspects of combat trauma. Sigmund Freud’s theories merged with the medical model of a problem-oriented system. Current trends now merge solution-oriented perspectives to the system, for comprehensive understanding of military culture, inherent strengths in the culture, and use of those strengths towards posttraumatic growth.

Not all servicemembers become injured from combat. But all servicemembers who physically survive military service face substantial challenge transitioning to civilian life. Regardless of injuries sustained, all challenges resulting from military service confront veterans

within their post-military transition. This paper presents veterans themselves as possessing the strengths and inherent resources to lead the success in military transition, no matter the myriad of issues.

There are moral and ethical considerations regarding responsibility for transitional issues (including injuries sustained from combat) that are focused in legislation, the media, and those directly affected by the availability of resources. Yet there is a concurrent responsibility for individual veterans to draw from the inherent strengths that set them apart from other subcultures of American society. Whether one considers this an extension of the rugged individualism of America's history, or the reality that each day lived in suffering is a day that is forever gone, veterans have opportunity to work individually and collectively to draw resources from within.

This paper is not limited to mental health issues, or posttraumatic stress disorder as a single barrier to adequate transition. It does, however, address what may be among the gravest of challenges in transition. The solution to the myriad of issues all include successful transition, and the worst of the challenges include an in-depth understanding of military culture. While America does not typically focus on war, its military is exclusively a war culture. From the Infantryman to the administrative specialist, all exist for the purpose of war. Yet often without noticing, all military and civilian personnel are affected by the continuing wage of casualties. In order to handle it successfully, this paper argues that embracing the challenges can lead to victory over the challenges. It should not be avoided.

The strain of sustained combat on military personnel and its ramifications for public support, raise the traditional themes of alienation, indifference, and lack of understanding, despite the apparent popularity and general admiration of military personnel. Many people now hope to move beyond the post-9/11 war on terror and America's long and contentious counterinsurgency wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. A new war is accelerating against the

Islamic State of Iraq and al-Sham (ISIS). Russia is actively destabilizing Ukraine, and China is making ever more aggressive moves in the south and east China seas.¹⁰³

Veterans' Mental Health and Combat Trauma

The medical model of health treatment is not perfect science. In general, the facets of human nature that conflict during times of trauma (e.g., what the eyes see, the brain processes, the heart feels, and the conscience determines to be moral or immoral). For instance, civilians are required to maintain a life within the confines of societal and legal acceptance (e.g., be civil and polite and don't murder or steal). On the other hand, a soldier is required to maintain life within the confines of a military existence, which in times of war demands one's mind and body to be in constant fight or flight mode. Furthermore, a soldier has been conditioned to ignore the societal norms and laws of a civilized society and instead works within a context of self-preservation and preservation of one's comrades. In fact, soldiers are frequently commanded to operate in violent and unpredictable atmospheres, which are contrary to the once familiar environment of civilian life wherein all Americans are expected to conduct themselves in a non-violent manner. These extremes create great conflict for combat veterans who are returning to or reintegrating into the societal norms of home. Additionally, the veterans who suffer from posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and are unable to secure treatment are at great risk.

¹⁰³ Jim Golby, Lindsay Cohn, and Peter Feaver, "Thanks for Your Service: Civilian and Veteran Attitudes After Fifteen Years of War," in *Warriors and Citizens: American Views of Our Military*, eds. Kori Schake and Jim Mattis (Stanford: Hoover Institutional Press, 2016), 99.

Military Culture/Ethnography and its Implications

Military culture is an unparalleled subculture in the United States that includes those currently serving as well as those who have previously served.¹⁰⁴ Veterans, who have previously served, are unique from civilians, due to their military conditioning and its long-lasting effects. A veteran, during times of service, has endured grueling mental and physical conditioning. The veteran's belief system is conditioned and anchored in the newly acquired military system of morals, values, and purposes. Brown, et al., states, "A military culture by definition, must differ significantly from civilian culture in a democratic society, a fact recognized in U.S. Law and supported by the Supreme Court."¹⁰⁵ Veterans Health Administration (VHA) acknowledges the complexity of military culture as its target demographic is the military population. The VHA has an advanced understanding of the rigor and danger of military life and has improved its services by acknowledging the complex nature of military culture, and how it impacts the quality of the services provided; Distinctives of military culture include, "generational differences, the impact of war, types of war, as well as the absence of it impact programming."¹⁰⁶ There is a need for improved relations between veteran health service providers and veterans that can begin with a recognition of the cultural differences between civilians and veterans.

Military training and conditioning create a tightly closed system, so actions considered immoral in other contexts are sanctioned and even celebrated (e.g., killing) within rules of engagement....¹⁰⁷ Given the many mechanisms for disengaging moral control, civilized life,

¹⁰⁴ Eric W. Price, Victoria Stickley, and Elizabeth A. Prosek, "Fall in Line with Duty: Preparing Counseling Students to Serve the Military Population," *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 3, no. 2 (May-August 2015): 79.

¹⁰⁵ William Brown et al., "The Perfect Storm: Veterans, Culture, and the Criminal Justice System," *Justice Policy Journal* 10, no. 2 (Fall 2013): 27.

¹⁰⁶ US Department of Veteran Affairs, "Department of Veterans Affairs FY 2014–2020 Strategic Plan," 479.

¹⁰⁷ Rita Brock, *Moral Injury and Soul Repair*, (Fort Worth, TX: The Soul Repair Center for recovery from moral injury, 2013), 3.

in addition to moral and intellectual personal standards, requires safeguards to be built into social systems that uphold compassionate behavior and renounce cruelty.¹⁰⁸

These findings lead to strong indications of culturalism as a barrier to care. Conversely, culturalism can be utilized as a conduit to healing. While the above quotation may seem harsh, it discusses the context of utilizing violence to oppose violence of a different nature (such as terrorism), and that the military's moral system can also be imposed on those who must transition from a survival mode in combat by assimilating into a society that generally opposes indiscriminate violence. Veterans' experiences and responses to war exacerbate the complications of readjustment to American life. These conflicts between military and civilian life are often countercultural. Stakeholders are not immune to the polarization and turning against veterans that takes place while assisting them in the readjustment process. Therefore, stakeholders have a responsibility to educate themselves, to obtain a profound understanding of military culture, to respect the military as an ethnographic group that is capable of self-advocating and that is required to make adjustments to conform to and integrate with civilian values. Brown, et. al., illustrates the point:

Discounting or excluding the values, beliefs, and material objects germane to the military culture, relative to veteran defendants in the civilian courtroom, is an example of practicing ethnocentrism. The same can be said for military personnel who try to find their former civilian roles after discharge. American culture typically inculcates the value that its members, when confronted with a potential threat, must think first before they respond. Contrary to the civilian culture, the military culture teaches recruits to instantaneously react to a potential or perceived threat.¹⁰⁹

¹⁰⁸ Albert Bandura, "Moral Disengagement in the Perpetration of Inhumanities," *Personality and Social Psychology Review* 3 (1999): 194.

¹⁰⁹ William Brown, Robert Stanilus, Bryan Theis, Jordan Farnsworth, and David Daniles. "The Perfect Storm: Veterans, Culture, and the Criminal Justice System," *Justice Policy Journal* 10, no. 2 (Fall 2013): 25.

Equal to American society's failure to understand and accommodate veterans' adjustment to civilian life, is the veterans' resistance to accepting changing of roles. Instead of seeking a maturation and integration of military experience and its effects on new roles in civilian life, veterans often attempt to force present circumstances to fit their past. Succinctly, veterans have acquired mindsets and methods of survival which apply to cultures of violence. The acquired mindsets and methods must evolve to function within the societal norms of a civilized world. Otherwise, the mindsets are always at odds with society and amplify the moral injury sustained by the veteran during service. "One of the most complex, yet noticeably salient issues facing military mental health providers is, as previously noted, the cultural-complexity inherent in work with military service members."¹¹⁰

The military's position on mental health issues, including a soldier's repeated exposure to traumatic events, can complicate a servicemember or veteran's difficulty to realign his or her perspective to a civilian mindset, regarding societal norms. Examples of exactly which servicemembers struggle with this transition to civilian society are found in Krull and Oguz's analysis of Wounded Warrior Project Alumni surveys between 2010 and 2012; these individuals tend to be males who served in a lower rank, identified as transitioning from middle-aged to elderly at time of crisis, and served in Army combat roles.¹¹¹ This demographic is consistent with veterans identified as most likely to complete the act of suicide, supporting the VA's 2016 study on suicide.¹¹²

¹¹⁰ Aaron J. Smith, "Culturally Competent Therapy with Military Veterans: Identifying and Overcoming Issues Facing Providers," *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 2, no. 2 (May – Aug. 2014): Page 121

¹¹¹Heather Krull, and Mustafa Oguz, "Health and Economic Outcomes in the Alumni of the Wounded Warrior Project" (Santa Monica, CA: Rand, 2014) 21.

¹¹² US Veterans Health Administration, "Veterans Health Administration Suicide Report," August 2016.

The Krull and Orguz study also notes that those who served in the Marine Corps are more likely to seek out peer support, VA counseling, and medication than those who served in the Army, reflecting a lower suicide rate. Regardless of which military branch individuals served in, veterans who served in lower ranks have higher incidents of depression, PTSD, and Traumatic Brain Injury (TBI) than those of their superiors, concurrent with lower resiliency rates.¹¹³ And finally, those who report having PTSD or Traumatic Brain Injury are substantially more likely to have talked to other veterans about feelings of stress or emotional or health concerns than those who do not report these injuries.¹¹⁴ Note the cultural nuance of similar combat roles, equal susceptibility to wounding, yet handled differently between Army combatants and Marine Corp combatants.

The Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America's alumni survey, completed by 1,501 alumni in 2014, indicates that veterans are not getting the mental health care they need. By some indications in this study (such as urban versus rural locations) there is often limited access to care. Though there are substantial issues related to access elsewhere, the majority of IAVA alumni living in New York City, 80% are enrolled in VA healthcare. In these circumstances where access is adequate, quality of care leaves veterans distrusting of the VA providers.¹¹⁵ This is another area where cultural relevance impacts wellness. The 2008 Rand study shows that the stigma of seeking help as well as the expectation of being misunderstood is profound.¹¹⁶

¹¹³These are more indications of the complexity of military culture.

¹¹⁴ Heather Krull and Mustafa Oguz, "Health and Economic Outcomes in the Alumni of the Wounded Warrior Project: 2010-2012," (Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2014), 21.

¹¹⁵ Jacqueline Maffucci and Chantell Frazier, "7TH Annual IAVA Member Survey," (New York, NY: Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America, 2015), 21.

¹¹⁶ Terri Tanielian and Lisa H. Jaycox, eds., "Invisible Wounds of War: Psychological and Cognitive Injuries, Their Consequences, and Services to Assist Recovery," (Santa Monica: Rand, 2008), 54-55.

Indeed, many issues remain vital to requiring a greater understanding of the culture in a solution-focused environment. For instance, Ullman and Filipa's 2001 report shows that while the sexual assault on females in the military is not PTSD related to direct combat, there is increasing prevalence resulting in PTSD and exacerbating depression. This is but one example of a myriad of circumstances that may impede the successful transition to civilian life.¹¹⁷ The Veteran Administration's August 2016 Suicide Report depicting a 98% increase in suicide among female veterans since 2010 must be accepted and internalized.¹¹⁸

An Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America 2016 Member Survey cites that there were 26,000 reports of unwanted sexual contact in the Department of Defense in 2012,¹¹⁹ a statistic amplified by the fact that most females do not report sexual assault because they "didn't think anything would be done."¹²⁰ Of the 71% surveyed, 56% "worried that my peers would treat me differently," and 49% "worried that my commander would not believe me."

Indeed, Franklin's report found that 32.6% of Wounded Warrior Project Alumni surveyed in 2013 avoided treatment due to concerns about career plans, 28.1% would be "considered weak," and 24.6% would be stigmatized by "peers or family."¹²¹ Schumm, et. al., report increasing synergistic effects of depression resulted from these negative perceptions,

¹¹⁷Tanielian and Jaycox,, "Invisible Wounds of War," 53.

¹¹⁸ U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs, "Suicide Among Veterans and Other Americans 2001–2014," (Washington, DC: Office of Suicide Prevention, 2016), 1.

¹¹⁹ Maffucci and Frazier, "7TH Annual IAVA Member Survey," 20.

¹²⁰ Ibid., 20.

¹²¹Artha Franklin, et al., *Wounded Warrior Project Survey: Report of Findings* (Rockville, MD: Westat, 2013), 6.

whether real or perceived.¹²² The percentage of veterans that agreed they “did not feel comfortable with existing resources within the DoD or VA,” was 32.5%. Service members with TBI, PTSD, or depression) indicated fears of self-reporting due to being perceived as weak, or unfit for duty.¹²³

Ethnographic Respect

Veterans who would describe themselves as an ethnographic group, recognize the inherent military culture within, markedly different than the civilian cultures of American society.¹²⁴ During a war, the assault on a soldier’s core belief system, moral values, and self-identification are imminent. At times, in the spirit of survival and to defend one’s comrades or one’s nation, as the case may be, soldiers are required, during wartime, to take action which is contrary to one’s conscience. The mental and emotional injuries resulting from such assaults on the conscience are unique to those who have participated in a war. As such, in this instance, the term “ethnographic” describes a particular group of people, veterans, who are distinct in comparison to civilians. In addition, the identification of the aspects of this ethnographic group is necessary for mental health treatment of veterans and to help ease the transitional process of returning to civilian societal norms. Resiliency to accomplish missions is central to military culture. The ability to endure and emerge from hardship with increasing strength is tantamount to acceptance in military culture, and essential to success. Regarding this, a facet of Aristotle’s

¹²² Jeremiah Schumm, Ellen. M. Koucky, and Alisa Bartel, “Associations Between Perceived Social Reactions to Trauma-Related Experiences with PTSD and Depression Among Veterans Seeking PTSD Treatment,” *Journal of Traumatic Stress* 27, no. 1 (2014): 54.

¹²³ Kathleen Bell et al., “Concussion Treatment After Combat Trauma: Development of a Telemedicine Based, Problem Solving Intervention for Servicemembers,” *Contemporary Clinical Trials* 40 (2015): 58.

¹²⁴ Aaron J. Smith. “Culturally Competent Therapy with Military Veterans: Identifying and Overcoming Issues Facing Providers,” *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 2, no. 2 (May – Aug. 2014): 121- 32.

philosophy, known as The Nicomachean Ethics, finds expression in the term, antifragile that veterans sometimes need to be reminded of during civilian transition:

Taleb argues that everything in the world falls into three types. Things that break when subjected to shock, force, and volatility—like fine-bone china—are fragile. Things that survive when attacked are robust. Moreover, those that can be subjected to stress and emerge even stronger, like human muscle, are antifragile. In Taleb’s thinking, individuals and societies should strive to be antifragile. We render ourselves vulnerable to debilitating shocks if we run away from difficult challenges. However, if we learn to handle setbacks as opportunities, we can, to quote Jewish liturgy, make the bad Decree less bad.¹²⁵

The successful transition from military service to civilian life is a major issue to the culture at large, challenging each servicemember when the time arrives for them to discharge, or retire. Transition may be quick, decades long, or require the remainder of the veteran’s life. It is within the context of transition that this paper examines myriad challenges that must be overcome, including issues of purpose and identity, trauma, and other issues that may manifest in the body, mind and heart. The myriad of challenges that confront veterans in transition require ethnographic understanding. Veterans themselves having much of the keys to success inherent within themselves.

A correct understanding of military to civilian transition must be framed within a culturally-informed context to include the unique character and intrinsic motivations of service members, to include their ethnographic makeup. It is helpful and entirely appropriate that the VA, and non-government organizations provide resources and assistance to veterans facing transition. While veterans must be their own primary resource to accept “the mission” of transition, maintain military resiliency in the challenge, and obtain astuteness to military culture, external resource

¹²⁵ Elyon Aslan-Levy, “Embracing Aristotle at Yom Kippur,” *Tablet Magazine*, October 7, 2016, accessed February 21, 2017, <http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-life-and-religion/213956/embracing-aristotle-at-yom-kippur>.

are entirely appropriate for things such as vocational and mental health issues. However, those external resources must also be culturally astute.

In a previous section, mistrust was cited as a primary reason why accessible healthcare is not used. No other subculture in America is trained and conditioned to approach problems like military culture. A lack of awareness from both veterans and non-veterans, regarding transition, can be devastating; Schake and Mattis¹²⁶ express concern that military culture may create feelings of entitlement on the part of those who serve; Citizens and policy-makers with limited understanding about the differences in military and civilian culture and their values continue to influence meta-analysis polls. “Public opinion surveys conducted as part of this study strongly suggest that while the American public is not knowledgeable about military issues, its judgment is fundamentally sound, and its concern is unabated...”¹²⁷

The message that physical, psychological, emotional, and spiritual setbacks are a mere means for personal growth in veteran’s due to their inherent resiliency is increasingly difficult to ignore. Meanwhile, families, communities, and government agencies, must combat a state of bewilderment about the dynamic, converse behavior of veterans who struggle and fail to overcome visible and invisible wounds. The grimmest outcome is the number of veteran suicide. In August 2016, the VHA announced new initiatives to intervene in the lives of veterans who are at the greatest risk for committing suicide.

¹²⁶ Sanford Gifford, “From the Second World War to Vietnam: Historical, Clinical, and Personal Reflections on Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder,” *American Imago* 72, no. 1 (2015): 3.

¹²⁷ Kori Schake and Jim Mattis, eds., *Warriors and Citizens: American Views of Our Military* (Stanford: Hoover Institutional Press, 2016), 3.

Maffucci's report on Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America's member survey measures self-reporting of veteran suicide and mental health, VA Disability benefits, as well as employment.¹²⁸ Krull and Haugseth report that two of the three most common barriers to care are issues within the institutions involved and their understanding of military culture (e.g., friction with the military or Veterans Affairs and stigmatization by peers or family), and beliefs and preference for treatment.¹²⁹ The disparity between military culture and service-providers is reflected further in Maffucci's report on female veterans; The report illustrates feelings of further isolation than their male counterparts, largely due to the uniqueness of military culture: only "15% feel that the general public understands the contributions of women in the military."¹³⁰ As this dissertation attempts to focus on the solution of veteran transition, readers are asked to consider the increasing awareness of female veterans, and the possibility of their challenges being overlooked.

Treatment providers must consider and accommodate the self-sustaining attributes of military culture within itself. Consider the following excerpt from a former Navy corpsman:

After my talk, a muscular young man approached me to discuss one of his friends. He looked so familiar. When he got close enough, I could see that he had a prosthetic eye. The battalion commanding officer introduced him, saying that he was a sniper, and that his missing eye was one of many combat wounds he had survived. After the talk, the skipper and I sat down to debrief. I asked about the Marine with the prosthetic eye.

'He is one of the best snipers in the Corps,' he told me. 'Even with one eye?' I asked, incredulous. 'You close one eye to shoot, don't you, Doc?' The Colonel smiled at me. It had been nine years since I'd carried a weapon, and I hadn't thought about it in a long time. Of course, I was never good at shooting, even back then. I had to admit, though, he was right. Even I used to close one eye. Suddenly, a previously blurred memory became crystal clear. And I remembered that Sergeant (who might have been a different rank) –

¹²⁸ Maffucci and Frazier, "7TH Annual IAVA Member Survey," 3.

¹²⁹ Krull and Haugseth, "Health and Economic Outcomes," 81.

¹³⁰ Maffucci, and Frazier, 20.

that one who lost an eye and was treated in our surgical company. I had journaled about him on the day I met him, surmising that, although life would be different with one eye, he would recover.¹³¹

Psychotherapy must be culturally relevant, including confidence in the ability of veteran to draw upon their strengths to overcome (such as the story cited above), acknowledgment of the needs of veterans to derive meaning from their experiences, define a purpose in the present state, and allow for all other factors in their life, including physical injuries, family, and community to connect.

Veterans who are self-initiated to manage their mental health issues may frequently be misunderstood due to bias rooted in a failure to consider the multicultural perspective and the unique systems of this particular ethnographic group. Mental health professionals are not immune to this failure of consideration, specifically, the unique experiences of serving in a combat zone. However, this is not to say that mental health professionals who lack personal military experience cannot effectively treat veterans.¹³² However, the treatment requires “deep listening,”¹³³ that is the ability of the mental health professional to push the limits of empathy to come alongside a veteran who is attempting to utilize their virtues of military skill and determination to overcome obstacles.¹³⁴

It is possible that many people in the helping professions will not practice deep listening on a level that calls beyond best practices of evidence-based care. This is a new concept where

¹³¹ Heidi Kraft, “Rehabilitation and Recovery After Combat Trauma: The New Normal,” *Work: Journal of Prevention, Assessment & Rehabilitation* 50, no. 1 (2015): 1.

¹³² Price, Stickley, and Prosek, “Fall in Line,” 79.

¹³³ Rita Brock and Gabriella Lettini, *Soul Repair: Recovering from Moral Injury after War* (Boston, MA.: Beacon Press, 2012), 114.

¹³⁴ Joshua Jackson, Felix Thoemmes, Kathrin Jonkmann, Oliver Lüdtke, and Ulrich Trautwein, “Military Training and Personality Trait Development: Does the Military Make the Man, or Does the Man Make the Military?” *Psychology Science* 23, no. 3 (March 2012): 273.

the number of peer reviewed articles only beginning to integrate moral injury to evidence-based care. Some may even consider it unethical to press the boundaries of empathy and become more authentically present in a session. The challenge which will present during the session: Should counselors deprive themselves of human compassion and common emotion to empower a client to achieve the greatest outcomes? This is an ethical issue that counselors must determine for themselves. If they do not have the ability or willingness to seek deep understanding of a veteran client, individually and culturally, they must also consider the appropriateness of their service to this type of specialty client.

While “[each] person’s brain has a great degree of plasticity and develops uniquely in response to the social and natural environment as the person develops over his or her life,”¹³⁵ veterans demonstrate imposed conditioned personalities.¹³⁶ While some veterans entered service with pre-existing beliefs that they can draw upon in post-military transition, experiences in combat may challenge those experiences. Moreover, some with more agnostic leanings may benefit from exploration of existential values placed upon their memories or transitional circumstances. The point is that cultural resistance to change in military experience can be overcome. Values and resilience serve veterans in both productive and counterproductive ways as they transition into civilian life.¹³⁷ When considering that the variability of human potential to adapt and that concept’s congruency with military culture, there may be tremendous opportunity

¹³⁵Walter Glannon. 2002. “Depression as a Mind-Body Problem.” *Philosophy, Psychiatry & Psychology* 9, no. 3: 244.

¹³⁶ Joshua Jackson et al., “Military Training and Personality Trait Development: Does the Military Make the Man, or Does the Man Make the Military?” *Psychology Science* 23, no. 3 (March 2012): 273.

¹³⁷Emma Eckard and Roxane Dufrene, “Barriers to Mental Health Treatment in the Military,” *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 3, no. 1 (Jan-Apr 2015): 41.

to assist veterans this way. By domesticating client-centered, meaning-based approaches to therapy, ethnographically driven treatment may empower military culture to de-stigmatize its bias toward mental health as a whole.¹³⁸ Taking steps to remove bias would include, in particular, destigmatizing mental and emotional problems incurred by service members during times of war, specific training for mental health professionals who treat military clientele, and education of the public toward understanding the causes and effects of PTSD and how to offer support.

Veteran Health Issues and the Benefit to Society

Veteran health care is a public issue. Modern warfare yields more battlefield survivors than previous American wars. Along with these survivors is an increase in long-term health care needs. Currently, there are 8.4 million veterans enrolled in VA care. Of the veterans enrolled, 25.9% have received a 50% disability rating or higher, marking them as the top priority to receive VA health care.¹³⁹

American society benefits greatly by military existence, and the service and sacrifice of servicemembers and veterans. One of many examples is the fact that VA is an umbrella institution that provides resources for research that has little or nothing to do with veterans; A substantial number of VHA programs focus on outside research, unrelated to veteran health. While veterans do benefit from the existence of the research studies, “the proportion of non-Veteran patients [such as volunteers for research and veteran family members] has decreased

¹³⁸ Paul Carrola and Marilyn Corbin-Burdick, “Counseling Military Veterans: Advocating for Culturally Competent and Holistic Interventions,” *Journal of Mental Health Counseling* 37, no. 1 (2015): 6.

¹³⁹ US Veterans Health Administration, “Veterans Health Administration Suicide Report,” (August 2016): 6.

significantly, dropping from 8.8 percent in 2001 to 4.4 percent of all VHA patients in 2014” (VHA Report, August 2016). Nonetheless, VHA is a substantial venue for medical research which benefits the civilian population in the United States. A report by the VA’s Office of Inspector General states: “VA has estimated that during FY 2012, over \$1.7 billion and 3,200 full-time personnel will be allocated to support over 2,100 VA research projects.”¹⁴⁰ These jobs created, the revenue generated, the findings of the studies occur simply because VA exists. Though there is no direct benefit to veterans, society benefits.

The Voice of Veterans and Self-Advocacy

Culturally-astute civilians and veterans, who themselves are under the auspices of several Veteran Service Organizations (VSOs), operationalize programming, lobby for legislation, defend budgeting, and scrutinize and appraise the quality of health care for veterans. After military service, many veterans are redefining their sense of purpose and are indeed, the “voice of veterans.”

The VHA has struggled to meet the numerical and cultural requirements of veterans in the Post-9/11 era.¹⁴¹ The VA system specifically addresses the requirements concerning the transition to civilian life, as well as current and future demands in customer service:

[The veterans of the Post-9/11] era and their families wanted the Departments of Defense and Veterans Affairs to transform their approaches to post-deployment mental health services and stress family-centered treatment rather than focus on individual veterans—a paradigm shift for VA... This new generation of veterans is younger, technologically savvy, and demands improved access to information via the Internet... They also expect support for their family caregivers and better transition and collaboration between the Department of Defense and VA in policies for caregivers. Likewise, Congress, advocacy groups, and community stakeholders, including groups in the private sector offering

¹⁴⁰ Office of the Inspector General, “Veterans Health Administration Audit,” (2012).

¹⁴¹ Office of Veterans Affairs, “Independent Budget Fiscal Year 2013” (Washington, DC, 2013) 59.

specialized services, have been very active in pressing for change in how VA relates to community providers....¹⁴²

Medical Models: Physical Combat Trauma Treatment

There are more survivors of trauma among war veterans now than in the past: Survival rates of American troops in combat have consistently increased with each war from the early 1900s to present. Medical advances in the treatment of infection after 1918 reduced war mortality leaving physical trauma as the primary cause after 1941.¹⁴³ Of the 31,000 American casualties in Iraq from 2003 until 2010, there were 4,200 deaths, 800 from means other than combat trauma.¹⁴⁴

The military's ability to provide treatment to soldiers on site is termed "damage control." The implementation of "damage control" in Naval warfare¹⁴⁵ began taking on broader strategic usefulness in American combat strategy during World War I; Studies of combat trauma (traumatology), and treatment of combat wounds were implemented at the site where the infliction of injury took place by peer combatants and medics. These actions led to closer proximity to the higher echelons of care (surgery) by the emplacement of surgical teams close to battle lines.¹⁴⁶ Medevac helicopters, introduced during the war in Vietnam, shortened the time

¹⁴² Joy Ilem, "Joy Ilem, House Committee on Veterans Affairs," accessed March 01, 2017, <https://veterans.house.gov/witness-testimony/joy-ilem>.

¹⁴³ Vincent Cirillo, "Two Faces of Death: Fatalities from Disease and Combat in America's Principal Wars, 1775 to Present," *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 51, no. 1 (2008): 122.

¹⁴⁴ Matthew Goldberg, "Death and Injury Rate of U.S. Military Personnel in Iraq," *Military Medicine* 175, no. 4 (2010): 220.

¹⁴⁵ Sailors were trained to help their ship absorb combat damage and maintain mission integrity as described in the Department of the Warfare Manual, from 1996.

¹⁴⁶ Alec Beekley and David Watts, "Combat Trauma Experience with the United States Army 102nd Forward Surgical Team in Afghanistan," *The American Journal of Surgery* 187, no. 5 (2004): 65.

between the point of injury and surgery. Dr. R. Adams Cowley, a medical pioneer in the treatment of shock trauma, described the principle of the “golden hour.” The golden hour identified an increase in patient survival rates when trauma patients underwent surgery and received whole blood within one hour of injury.¹⁴⁷ Therefore, damage control techniques allowed fighting to continue, (maintain mission integrity), and at the same time, render trauma care to soldiers at the battle site (absorb the damage).

The execution of Tactical Combat Casualty Care (TCCC) in the Global War on Terror (GWOT) is the modern evolution of “damage control” as was seen in WWI. The introduction of TCCC at the site of injury has advanced the efficacy of combatants saving the lives of their peers.¹⁴⁸ Meanwhile, Forward Surgical Teams are strategically emplaced to maximize accessibility within the “golden hour.” The plethora of variables introduced through technological advances, such as armor protection, has led to the most significant increases in combat survivability in the history of American wars.¹⁴⁹ However, while the physical protection of combat soldiers has evolved, a technique or methodology for the prevention of mental and emotional injuries remains in the spiritual and existential genres.

Increased survivability means hundreds of thousands of combat veterans will transition to civilian life with an imposed adaptation of a “new normal” due to long-term or life-long

¹⁴⁷Howard Belzberg, “R. Adams Cowley, MD: Timing Is Everything,” *Prehospital and Disaster Medicine* 5, no. 3 (1990): 269.

¹⁴⁸ Frank Butler Jr. et al., “Tactical Combat Casualty Care, 2007: Evolving Concepts and Battlefield Experience,” *Military Medicine* 172, no. 11 (2007): 119.

¹⁴⁹ Gayle E. Reiber et al., “Servicemembers and Veterans with Major Traumatic Limb Loss from Vietnam War and OIF/OEF Conflicts: Survey Methods, Participants, and Summary Findings,” *Journal of Rehabilitation Research and Development* 47, no. 4 (2010): 276.

physical, mental, and emotional injuries.¹⁵⁰ Veterans' Health Administration Research indicates that at least 20% of veterans from the GWOT have "invisible" wounds that are diagnosable as PTSD, depression, anxiety, and subsequent substance use.¹⁵¹ These invisible wounds can come in many forms. Invisible or spiritual wounds increase in times of war when an individual can be both the victim and the perpetrator of trauma. Soldiers are exposed to death and injury and are themselves, required to kill an enemy. Additionally, during these times, one's core belief system is challenged as to what is morally right and wrong.

Along with the estimated base rate of mental health disorders for combat veterans, the most common diagnoses are depressive disorders and PTSD.¹⁵² Although symptoms experienced by combat veterans upon returning home have not significantly changed since WWI, approaches to treatment continue to evolve. Historically, the identification of PTSD cluster manifestations in combat veterans occurred during WWII and continuously through the Vietnam War.¹⁵³ However, a more exhaustive understanding and awareness of these issues and the prevalence of reporting continue to increase concurrently with the decrease in casualty rates resulting from advancements in tactics, techniques, and procedures of modern warfare. The same can be for mental, emotional, and spiritual issues, leading to better performance in service and transition after service by developing spiritual and existential resiliency in preparation for combat.

¹⁵⁰ Heidi Kraft, "Rehabilitation and Recovery After Combat Trauma: The New Normal," *Work: Journal of Prevention, Assessment & Rehabilitation* 50, no. 1 (2015): 6.

¹⁵¹ Paul Kim et al., "Stigma, Barriers to Care, and Use of Mental Health Services Among Active Duty and National Guard Soldiers After Combat," *Psychiatric Services* 61, no. 6 (June 2010): 584.

¹⁵² Tanielian and Jaycox, "Invisible Wounds of War: Psychological and Cognitive Injuries, Their Consequences, and Services to Assist Recover," (Santa Monica: Rand. 2008): 54-55.

¹⁵³ Gifford, "From the Second World War to Vietnam," 1.

Medical Models: History of Psychological Combat Trauma

In the early part of the 20th century, Sigmund Freud's theory of "destiny neurosis" was a primary underlying principle that drove general psychological theory. According to Helene Deutsch,¹⁵⁴ "destiny neurosis" reflects the clash of a person's outward behavior in contrast to their unconscious desires to be free of the hindrance in their conscious life. According to Gifford's first-hand account of treating World War II (WWII) soldiers for posttraumatic stress, this theory was the basis of a clinical investigation while he and his colleagues treated soldiers from the front lines. Freud recognized in his theory on observation of soldiers of World War I that soldiers' nightmares regarding combat caused repetitive trauma but did not dissuade the soldiers' desire to return to duty. Per Gifford,¹⁵⁵ several of Freud's followers during WWII began to consider two more theories regarding combat trauma with destiny neurosis as the basis. The first theory is the trauma theory, which postulates that an excess of painful stimuli either breaks down the natural defenses, creating overwhelming anxiety or undergoes "conversion" into symptoms of hysteria with reduced anxiety. The second theory is the conflict theory, which suggests that the acute trauma precipitating a war neurosis is only the last in a series of traumatic events that go back to childhood conflicts.¹⁵⁶

Freudians postulated the latter. They also suggested that symptomology varied with different wars. Gifford's observation is that symptomology evolves over time, with the onset persistence of chronic depression after time served in the military.¹⁵⁷ Gifford does, however,

¹⁵⁴ Helene Deutsch, "Ein Fall von Hysterischer Schicksalsneurose," *Psychoanalytische Bewegung* 2 (1930): 274.

¹⁵⁵ Gifford, "From the Second World War to Vietnam," 3.

¹⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 7.

¹⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 10.

corroborate a predisposition to PTSD resulting from childhood trauma exposure. He also adds that the reason for the military to emphasize this was to deny responsibility for disability compensation and treatment.¹⁵⁸ The 1950s saw an emergence of data suggesting that a person's experiences affecting "gene-environment" are causative agents for combat-related PTSD.¹⁵⁹ Contemporary studies continue to look at multigenerational issues related to trauma.¹⁶⁰

While the identification and clustering of PTSD symptoms among combat veterans have remained consistent, the level of understanding is consistently rising with succeeding conflicts since WWII. Meanwhile, there is an indication of the increase in the severity of PTSD since the Korean Conflict. The increase in the severity of PTSD is attributable to the changes in the dynamics of homecoming, regarding the transition of service members from combat zones. These dynamics include the evolution of the veteran's world view as was molded by training of the era's, as well as combat, and which is now required to be remolded to fit a civilized society.

The study of Vietnam veterans during the 1980s describes much of the PTSD evolution to changes in family support among combat veterans as well as societal rejection.¹⁶¹ Other factors include increasing social isolation, family instability, past childhood abuse, and participation in morally deviating violence during combat. More recent studies further validate the supportive or unsupportive effects of family environment on the presence or severity of

¹⁵⁸ Gifford, "From the Second World War to Vietnam," 11.

¹⁵⁹ Gregory Carey and Irving I. Gottesman, "Genes and Antisocial Behavior: Perceived Versus Real Threats to Jurisprudence," *Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics* 34, no. 2 (Summer 2006): 343.

¹⁶⁰ Michelle Durham and Sala S. N. Webb, "Historical Trauma: A Panoramic Perspective," *The Brown University Child and Adolescent Behavior Letter* 30, no. 10 (2014): 3.

¹⁶¹ Edward McCranie and Leon A. Hyer, "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms in Korean Conflict and World War II Combat Veterans Seeking Outpatient Treatment," *Journal of Trauma Stress* 13, no. 3 (July 2000): 433.

PTSD. However, the same study reports that while adjusting to civilian life is irrespective of social support, the same social support does impose a significant impact on PTSD-related depression.¹⁶²

Meaning-Making Models with Concurrent Moral Injury

Moral injury is an undermining of an individual's understanding and self-imposed expectations about his or her moral behavior. A servicemember's capacity to behave in a just and ethical manner may be undermined by the realities of war, causing him to act in a way contrary to his sense of whom he believes himself to be. This issue continues to be studied in military culture but remains "chiefly unaddressed."¹⁶³ When working with veterans, a multicultural perspective calls for a counselor to consider that moral injury may render evidence-based treatment for PTSD ineffective.¹⁶⁴ Brite Divinity School and the VHA have proclaimed that moral injury exists concurrent with PTSD and that it manifests with overlapping symptomology and will prevent wellness for the client if not addressed.¹⁶⁵

Nash and others developed a moral injury Event Scale to measure the validity of combatants' "perceived transgressions by self or others (Factor 1)" and "perceived betrayals by

¹⁶² Jeremiah Schumm, Ellen Koucky, and Alisa Bartel, "Associations Between Perceived Social Reactions to Trauma-Related Experiences with PTSD and Depression Among Veterans Seeking PTSD Treatment," *Journal of Traumatic Stress* 27, no. 1 (2014): 53.

¹⁶³ Brett Litz, Nathan Stein, Eileen Delaney, Leslie Lebowitz, William P. Nash, Caroline Silva, and Shira Maguen. "Moral Injury and Moral Repair in War Veterans: A Preliminary Model and Intervention Strategy." *Clinical Psychology Review* 29 (2009): 69.

¹⁶⁴ Kent Drescher and David Foy, "When They Come Home: Posttraumatic Stress, Moral Injury, and Spiritual Consequences for Veterans," *Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry* 28 (2009): 88.

¹⁶⁵ Shira Maguen and Brett Litz, "Moral Injury in Veterans of War," *PTSD Research Quarterly* 23, no. 1 (2012): 4.

others in or outside the military (Factor 2)” to identify “potentially morally injurious events.”¹⁶⁶

It is important to note that their validity findings include manifestations of morally injurious events in the experiences of the combatants and must also include non-military relationships.

Their instrument (MIES) “was positively correlated with several other measures of psychological distress,” including depression, anxiety, negative affect, and PTSD.¹⁶⁷ The validity findings suggest that clinicians must incorporate several concepts, to include the importance of relationships and the integration of evidence-based care, with existential outcomes. When a veteran speaks of personal military service, ethnographic studies indicate that a therapist without military experience will be challenged to appreciate the veteran’s experience. Application of deep listening may begin to overcome the cultural barrier to help the therapist develop a therapeutic alliance, if handled genuinely.

Greek military veteran, Agelopoulos, lists the “experience of militarism, military ideology, identity transformations in military settings, the problem of symbolic and physical violence, power structures within the military and the survival strategies of soldiers.”¹⁶⁸

Concerning Agelopoulos’ list, it is the uniqueness of military experience which permeates the more commonly understood aspects of the culture as a whole; the venture, which one can only experience, transcends description. The personality of a military recruit is altered to suit the structure, conformity, and actions of a military system.¹⁶⁹ As cited in a previous section, military

¹⁶⁶ William Nash, Teresa Marino Carper, Mary Alice Mills, Teresa Au, Abigail Goldsmith, and Brett Litz. “Psychometric Evaluation of the Moral Injury Events Scale.” *Military Medicine* 178, no. 6 (2013): 648.

¹⁶⁷ Nash, “Moral Injury Events Scale,” 648

¹⁶⁸ Georgios Agelopoulos, “You Are in the Army Now: An Ethnographic Account of Military Training,” paper presented at the 6th Biennial EASA Conference, Krakow, July 26-29 2000.

¹⁶⁹ Jackson et al., “Military Training and Personality Trait Development,” 272.

personalities are trained to emit conditioned responses unique to war, or in support of it.¹⁷⁰ Part of that response is to bear the burden of stressors with a profound sense of duty to an altruistic mission.¹⁷¹ Finally, military personalities are conditioned to live and function in “a tightly closed system,” with little to no expectation to be respected or understood by others.¹⁷²

Essentially, the ability to identify, acknowledge, and respect a veteran’s sense of authentic self (as defined by the veteran, as he or she discovers their injury), is crucial to access moral injury in the therapeutic environment, without invalidating any experience, whether before, during, or after military service; “Emotional outcomes of moral injury (sic) are related to personal core beliefs and the formation of schemas influenced by childhood experiences within social, familial, cultural, and societal contexts.”¹⁷³ The activation of this kind of moral injury (not typically addressed in PTSD counseling that focuses on fear) may invoke repressed feelings of shame and guilt, causing resistance or even cessation from counseling.

Shame, fear, guilt, and a decision that may give an impression of incompetence cause shunning in a military system. Therefore, as these feelings surface, an unwavering respect and focused attention on the veteran’s needs are necessary to aid the veteran in discovering a sense of moral value. It is important that the veteran’s military service or the military itself not be perceived as being judged by the counselor. Such things are the prerogative of the servicemember or veteran only.

¹⁷⁰ Brown et al., “Perfect Storm,” 25.

¹⁷¹ Price, Stickley, and Prosek, “Fall in Line with Duty,” 85.

¹⁷² Brock, Handout: “Moral Injury and Soul Repair,” 4.

¹⁷³ Lisa Kruger, “Is There More to the Experience of War Trauma Than PTSD? the Development of Moral Injury and Its Impact on Soldiers,” *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 2, no. 2 (2014): 137.

The capability of therapists to authenticate a veterans' true self, acknowledge their experience and afford the possibility of healing a moral injury requires the fine skill of deep listening.¹⁷⁴ Deep listening enables the therapist to (1) identify morally injurious behavior in the client's past, and (2) develop "thick" case conceptualization.¹⁷⁵ These facets of deep listening facilitate a better utilization of therapy that challenges distorted perceptions of reality, facilitates the processing of emotional pain, and addresses other aspects of vulnerability without arousing feelings of impending threat in the veteran.

While Cognitive Behavioral Therapy (CBT) is found to be useful in treatment-resistant depression, Abel found that it is the competence of CBT therapists' case conceptualization skills which assists clients' in sudden gains in treatment-resistant depression.¹⁷⁶ Carolla and Corbin-Burdick report, "As clinicians address the mental health needs of veterans, it is important to acknowledge the effects of the medical model in treating them, because counselors may be especially vulnerable to a pathology-based bias."¹⁷⁷ This is the point where considerations for moral injury identified through the use of deep listening, may assist a therapist to develop a "thick" case conceptualization and an in-depth understanding of the client and their moral wound.

¹⁷⁴ Deep listening, as a skill emphasized in this dissertation, must be practiced concurrent with the expert awareness of the cultural nuances also emphasizes moral injury in the context of military service, compounded by childhood trauma as well as organizational stressors such as constant exposure to danger during deployments.

¹⁷⁵ Clifford Geertz, "Thick Description: Toward an Interpretive Theory of Culture," in *The Interpretation of Cultures* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), 7.

¹⁷⁶ Anna Abel et al., "Sudden Gains in Cognitive-Behavior Therapy for Treatment-Resistant Depression: Processes of Change," *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* 84, no. 8 (2016): 730.

¹⁷⁷ Paul Carolla and Marilyn Corbin-Burdick, "Counseling Military Veterans: Advocating for Culturally Competent and Holistic Interventions," *Journal of Mental Health Counseling* 37, no. 1 (2015): 3.

Cognitive Behavioral Therapy facilitates the discussion of clients underlying beliefs. When a therapist and client have developed rapport and a strong therapeutic alliance, the client may be willing to explore identified events that they judge to be moments of betrayal. Carolla and Corbin-Burdick, emphasize the importance of acknowledging events and relationships outside of the veterans' military experience.¹⁷⁸ The key understanding is whether the veteran articulates an understanding of a morally injurious phenomenon.

Cognitive Behavioral Therapy offers a good platform to explore the reality of events versus client perceptions. As the realities of an event are sorted and compared to the clients' perceptions of the event, manifestations of the clients' authentic values may emerge that allow the identification of the morally injurious factors. Identifying these factors can empower the client to determine an existential framing of self-perception and experiences. Kruger reports, "Individuals form assumptions about the self and the world through early life events, resulting in beliefs that are embedded in a personally created theory. These underlying core beliefs and worldly assumptions may become triggered and shift in the aftermath of a traumatic event."¹⁷⁹

It is possible such a pattern is not far from what clinicians already try to accomplish with traumatized clients, the identification of cognitive distortions. However, clinicians should be exceptionally mindful of the concurrent issues of moral injury and apply "deep listening" to matters of a veteran's subtle and overt expressions of identity. While the diagnosis of posttraumatic stress serves to identify, and therefore, mitigate physiologic symptoms, it is

¹⁷⁸Carroll and Corbin-Burdick, "Counseling Military Veterans," 9.

¹⁷⁹ Kruger, "Is There More to the Experience of War Trauma Than PTSD?" 137.

possible that suffering on a deeper level (such as moral beliefs, emotional maladies, etc.) calls for a deeper assistance for relief of the suffering.

Meaning-Making Models: Identify Moral Injury through Deep Listening

The medical model has made significant advances in understanding human psyche and behavior, encompassing assessment of persons beyond their pathology and defining individuals based in a whole person perspective. Moral injury seems to touch the soul, who a person perceives himself to be. A moral injury does not fit within the medical model with psychological measuring instruments utilized in the helping professions. Moreover, it overlaps the border between psychology and spirituality. Perhaps more emphasis needs to be placed on learning to understand our congregants and our clients while helping them through the healing process.

Deep listening is a concept that transcends worldviews, and fields of expertise, including psychotherapy, religion, and education, as well as anthropology and the arts. Moreover, the American Psychological Association and American Counseling Association are endorsing training in this skill/discipline. The skill of deep listening employs a therapist's practice of assessment (curiosity), timing, their cognitive processing, and empathy. As the veteran engages in the process of learning about themselves, the therapist must recognize the depth of their involvement as beyond empathy, while remaining skillful in their employment in ongoing cognitive assessment and therapy. Geller depicts her application of attentiveness in a holistic fashion not adversarial to Glannon's depiction of the proper mindset is not a replacement for psychotherapeutic skills, but calls for a truly present mindset that veteran population will inherently evaluate for authenticity:

Research revealed that this inner receptive state includes therapists' complete openness to the client's multidimensional internal world, including their bodily and verbal expression,

as well as openness to their own bodily experience of the moment in order to access the knowledge, professional skill, and wisdom embodied within. Being fully present then allows therapists to access an attuned responsiveness that is based on a kinesthetic and emotional sensing of the other's affect and experience as well as one's own intuition and skill and the relationship between. Similarly, Rogers reflected that: 'In using myself, I include my intuition and the essence of myself.'¹⁸⁰

To summarize the qualities of deep listening discussed so far, deep listening, it must satisfy two broad criteria: First, it must repress the listener's inner dialogue, and second, it must be exclusively attentive to the client's words and body language. The acquisition of deep listening skills is necessary to listen to discursive speech and remain grounded to continue in the practices of psychotherapy, education, and anthropology. The listener strives for a brand of "one-pointedness" or the ability to focus on the present and to absorb the speaker's experiences while following the discourse of the speaker.

To genuinely empathize with a veteran as he or she relays their mental and emotional suffering, the listener is required to acknowledge the veterans' unique values experiences, and the likelihood of various layers: before the military, values adopted during the military service, and the difficulty in overlapping those two layers as well as other exacerbating systems such as family, society, media, expectations, and other types of narratives in the veterans life (work, presence of disability, political beliefs). The causes of the veteran's sufferings may be unimaginable and jarring to the listener's senses and conscience. However, the ability of the listener to empathize with the veteran will aid the veteran in healing deep moral injuries. The veteran suicide epidemic is one piece of evidence depicting military culture's struggle to overcome invisible wounds. The accomplished work is substantial, and many veterans are attaining tremendous success in living a meaningful, post-military life. However, there are

¹⁸⁰ Shari Geller, "Therapeutic Presence as a Foundation for Relational Depth," in *Relational Depth: New Perspectives and Developments*, edited by R. Knox, D. Murphy, S. Wiggins, and M. Cooper (Basingstoke, UK: Palgrave, 2013): 177.

conundrums to decipher in the pursuit of healing seemingly unhealable tragedies. Fostering an environment for veterans to heal the deepest invisible wounds, without diminishing a sense of self, and to at the same time build resiliency is promising.

Identifying who Carries Moral Injury to Facilitating Meaningful Purpose

A more comprehensive system of care, with a broader menu of services addressing veterans' individual needs, may improve services, including suicide prevention. To be assertively mindful of veteran suicide under a meaning-making model (to be discussed below), one must identify the sub-demographics, and nuances of behaviors among veterans. There is a vast array of invisible wounds identified among veterans.

Krull evaluated data provided by Wounded Warrior Project (WWP) survey results, utilizing a mental health measurement instrument called the Patient Health Questionnaire (PHQ-8).¹⁸¹ He was seeking evidence of a Major Depressive Disorder among WWP alumni over a 3-year period, deducing that certain demographic facts increased the likelihood for signs of the malady. "The results show that this probability is strongly correlated with age: The older the respondent, the higher the probability that he or she will screen positive for depression."¹⁸² Another study identified anxious and avoidant attachment orientations in Israeli veterans as a result of combat over 30 years previous.¹⁸³ While there are significant difference in American and Israeli culture, there are significant similarities to values within military cultures, such as the reason for the existence of the respective militaries, largely the same enemies and loyalties. This

¹⁸¹ Kurt Kroenke et al., "The PHQ-8 as a Measure of Current Depression in the General Population," *Journal of Affective Disorders* 114, no. 1 (Apr 2009): 163.

¹⁸² Krull and Haugseth, *Health and Economic Outcomes*, 42.

¹⁸³ Anot Horesh, Tsachi Ein Dor, and Zahava Solomon, "Stressful Life Events Across the Life Span and Insecure Attachment Following Combat Trauma," *Clinical Social Work Journal* 42, no. 4 (December 2014): 376.

is indicative of potentially increasing distress in certain veterans who do not resolve military-related issues during their transition to civilian life. This dynamic creates a paradox, specific sub-demographic patterns are identified among veterans in the most distress, those who are also least likely to trust the resources available to them for help.

The cultural nuance that is indicated throughout this chapter is the military culture self-advocacy. Concurrent with the need for issues such as severe depression to be addressed on a professional level, such services are rendered useless, perhaps even counterproductive, if veterans in distress are reluctant to engage such services. Veterans trusting veterans, based on the experiences and personality development resulting from military service, is what may bridge the gap and directly combat the veteran suicide epidemic. Franklin's 2013 report on that year's Wounded Warrior Project Alumni survey acknowledged that 56.7% of respondents said talking with another veteran of the wars in Afghanistan and Iraq (OEF/OIF) was their solution of choice for mental health needs, and 54.2% agreed that their lives had "very clear goals and purposes." While various studies indicate different levels of training for peers who support other peers, it is the ethnographic support that all military peer support programs are built upon, and that the studies are attributing to their success.

A study of VA mental health treatment by Hundt, et al., indicates that older veterans demonstrate a higher usage of VA services compared to Post-9/11 veterans, while they also represent the highest number of suicide completions according to the 2016 VA report. However, "Qualitative data indicated that social and relational factors, such as lack of social support, may contribute to utilization rates [of VA services] in veterans with PTSD."¹⁸⁴ Meanwhile, WWP

¹⁸⁴ Horesh, Ein Dor, and Solomon, "Stressful Life Events Across the Life Span," 376.

reports in 2013, 2014, and 2015 correlate military service to suicidality by an over 27% increase in suicidal ideations from before to after military service. The correlation of this information indicates several things.

First of all, the WWP reports indicate that something related to military service is a major contributing factor to suicide among veterans. Further studies would call for closer identification of the “something.” Second, the VA study indicates that veterans tend to avoid professional services until they experience severe distress. Finally, the services are not utilized by all veterans who reach severe distress, many of them complete the act of suicide. Previous information in multiple sections of this chapter indicate that military peers, and fellow veterans are the most effective at initially addressing these issues. Also indicated throughout sections of this chapter is that ultimately, the element of purpose in veterans’ lives is tangible based on research previously discussed.

While veterans whose military service included serving at lower ranks in combat arms specialties are at risk of losing a sense of purpose, thus leading to suicide, female veterans are also an area of concern. Those female veterans in distress who are not engaged in VA services have nearly doubled their rate of completing suicide.¹⁸⁵ It is therefore likely that the most effective intervention to female veteran suicide are other female veterans.

Identifying who is most likely in distress, and who is likely to successfully intercede is helpful. But informed action must follow knowledge and understanding. Applied Suicide Intervention Skills Training (ASIST) is a program that trains military veterans as well as mental health professionals to recognize symptoms of potential suicidal thoughts and to intervene in

¹⁸⁵ US Veterans Health Administration, “Veterans Health Administration Suicide Report,” 14.

prescribed ways to interrupt and prevent the completion of suicide. It also corroborates the basis of meaning-centered therapy, the most prominent of which is Logotherapy, created by Victor Frankl, an Austrian neurologist, psychiatrist, and Holocaust survivor. Suicide training and meaning-centered approaches to solving distress are tangible skills that veterans and professionals alike can use to intervene and help veterans orient toward the solution to their own problems.

Logotherapy (as well as ASIST) makes use of a technique of dialogue that facilitates the flow of meaningful conversation, called Socratic dialogue. This dialogue is the cornerstone technique emphasized by Frankl.¹⁸⁶ Moreover, the Victor Frankl Institute endorses the useful intent of meaning-centered therapy for persons in all positions to help others, as described in their pamphlet for the 19th World Congress:

At the Eighteenth World Congress in 2011, participants came from 37 nations representing a wide range of disciplines including psychiatry and other medical specialties, nursing and the allied health sciences, psychology, psychotherapy, philosophy, religion, pastoral counseling, counselor education, social work, criminal justice, military personnel, graduate students and others interested in pursuing an elevated awareness of meaning in life.¹⁸⁷

The theme of the 19th World Conference in 2013 was, “Inspiring Meaning-Centered Living in Diverse Disciplines, Cultures and Wisdom Traditions.”¹⁸⁸ Among the 22 topics, those related to serving military culture and adaptations useful in training development were,

¹⁸⁶Aaron Smith, “Logotherapy to Treat Substance Abuse as a Result of Military Related PTSD,” *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 61 No. 1 (2013): 68.

¹⁸⁷ Viktor Frankl Institute of Logotherapy. Nineteenth World Congress. Dallas, TX, 2013.

¹⁸⁸ Ibid.

“Preparing Military Personnel to Assist Those Experiencing Combat Stress,” “Using Logotherapy with Veterans and Families Experiencing post-traumatic stress disorder (sic),” “Using Logotherapy in Substance Abuse Counseling,” “Creatively Using Logotherapy in Health Related Disciplines,” “Inspiring Courageous, Meaningful Leadership,” and many others.¹⁸⁹

Frankl’s survival in Nazi concentration camps caused him to recognize “that suffering can obscure one’s sense of purpose and weaken the drive to engage in meaningful activities.”¹⁹⁰ Smith, a mental health counselor and doctoral candidate in Counselor Supervision and Education at the University of New Mexico, describes his use of Frankl’s teachings as personal coping strategies during his 8 years in the United States Marine Corps, and as a peer to Royal Dutch Marines who had served in the War on Terror, “Whether it’s a loss of sleep, constant intrusive recollections, or fear of daily tasks such as driving, my interactions with these individuals made salient the idea that these can be ameliorated through a re-analysis of their attitudes towards what they experienced.”¹⁹¹ Smith also describes measurable outcomes with the use of the Purpose in Life (PIL) psychometric instrument and the Seeking of Noetic Goals (SONG) assessment, intended to be used in pre- and post- evaluation in treatment for substance abuse and PTSD.¹⁹²

Purpose and meaning are behavior-driven values embedded deeply in military culture, requiring an ethnographic level of understanding. As veterans are just as likely to speak to non-mental health professionals (clergy or peers) regarding the first contact for mental health needs, Robertson suggests peer-based, narrative training for veterans to reach other veterans. Robertson

¹⁸⁹ Viktor Frankl Institute of Logotherapy. Nineteenth World Congress. Dallas, TX, 2013.

¹⁹⁰ Victor Frankl, *The Will to Meaning* (New York: Meridian, 1970), 55.

¹⁹¹ Smith, “Logotherapy to Treat Substance Abuse,” 72.

¹⁹² *Ibid.*, 65.

cites many contemporary and well-known issues about veterans' access to care. However, she is careful to recognize "self-imposed and institutionally-imposed barriers" as well.¹⁹³ As stated above, moral injury related to military service is best understood by those who have experienced it. It is likely that part of new purpose and meaning in peers who help other peers, are the acts of helping those who still suffer in the first place.

Meaning-centered Counseling and the Basis of Faith

Studies have shown that people are more likely to approach clergy than counselors for issues within their family, and therefore clergy should be aware of cognitive, emotional, and trauma issues.¹⁹⁴ "There is increasing competencies among researched counseling theories that include elements of spirituality with meaning-making in multicultural settings, including such implementation by Veterans Health Administration, where chaplains are full members of the healthcare team."¹⁹⁵

Given that the tradition of clergy holds a more authoritative position than therapists in the eyes of their congregants, it is essential for clergy to maintain vigilance of the impressions they make on people in their most vulnerable moments. Friedman's book, *Generation to Generation: Family Process in Church and Synagogue*,¹⁹⁶ informs clergy of this issue, and advises to manage

¹⁹³Heather Robertson, "Narrative and Peer-to-Peer Approaches in Counseling Military and Veterans: A Review of Current Literature and Practices," *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 3, no. 2 (May-August 2015): 67.

¹⁹⁴ Gayle Privette, Stephen Quackenbos, and Charles M. Bundrick, "Preferences for Religious and Nonreligious Counseling and Psychotherapy," *Psychological Reports* 75, no. 1 (1994): 540.

¹⁹⁵ Jason Nieuwsma, et al., "Chaplaincy and Mental Health in the Department of Veterans Affairs and Department of Defense," *Journal of Health Care Chaplaincy* 19, no. 1 (2013): 14.

¹⁹⁶ Edwin H. Friedman. *Generation to Generation: Family Process in Church and Synagogue*. (New York: Guilford Press. 1985): 2.

the intricacies of authoritative influence on counselees, to everyone's benefit. Friedman integrates his knowledge as a rabbi, with Family Systems Theory that maps relationship dynamics and the behaviors that result. Whether faith-based, or spiritual counseling is offered by a therapist, or clergy, it is essential to understand the impact that person has on focused-individuals, as well as the family systems they represent. The involvements in the counselor's own life, will have an effect on those they are counseling. Things such as their counseling perspective, administrative responsibilities, ministries (if present), personal growth, family, and not least of all, leadership.¹⁹⁷

Licensed professionals are obligated by law to be informed of safe practices. However, clergy are not. Counseling theologians, such as Jay Adams, function from a premise that "the Bible is sufficient" and "sola Scriptura," and therefore represents an opinion contrary to the usefulness of the theories and standards of professional psychology.¹⁹⁸ In such situations, clergy or their overseeing institutions must take it upon themselves to emplace safeguards that ensure counselees are being cared for ethically and from an informed position. In a similar vein, John MacArthur writes, "Professional psychologists are no substitute for spiritually gifted people, and the counsel that psychology offers cannot replace biblical wisdom and divine power. Moreover, psychology tends to make people dependent on a therapist, whereas those exercising true spiritual gifts always turn people back to all-sufficient Savior and His all-sufficient Word."¹⁹⁹ The debate as to whether psychology include spirituality within its efforts, or should clergy assist

¹⁹⁷ Friedman, *Generation to Generation*, 2.

¹⁹⁸ Timothy Clinton and George Ohlschlager, *Competent Christian Counseling: Foundations and Practice of Compassionate Soul Care, Volume 1* (Colorado Springs, CO: WaterBrook Press, 2002), 45.

¹⁹⁹ John Macarthur, "The Sufficiency of Scripture," *The Masters Seminary Journal* 15. No. 2 (Fall 2014): 165. Sermon derived from: <http://www.gty.org/resources/distinctives/DD11/the-sufficiency-of-scripture>.

mental health professionals has been long debated. The scope of this paper does not seek to answer this question, but to emphasize that when a veteran seeks help within her or his own sphere, then it is essential for those in all helping professions to be informed enough to respect the challenging exploration of values and morality of the veteran to prioritize for him or herself.

Meanwhile, faith-based research takes many approaches to psychological-biblical correlation. There are macro-comparisons, of which none make a perfect fit. Some experiments have sought to integrate theology into psychology. Others have tried psychology into theology with varying results.²⁰⁰ Some approaches call into question the interpretations of Scripture.²⁰¹ The specialized advice by Freidman of implementing Family Systems Theory in congregational settings, to “Sola Scriptura” approach to counseling by Adams and MacArthur, represents each side of a spectrum of approaches. Elsewhere in this chapter Clinton and Ohschlager represent to blended approach of evidence-based counseling theories while upholding the Divine inerrancy of Scripture, such is the median of the spectrum. Meanwhile, the ethical responsibility to reach and counsel veterans successfully is upheld not by the limited reach of statute, or the efficacy of preaching or theology, but is measured by the cultural understanding of outcomes. Each veteran’s successful transition amidst the myriad of pitfalls from isolation to suicide.

If a person has found the meaning sought for, he is prepared to suffer, to offer sacrifices, even, if need be, to give his life for the sake of it. Contrariwise, if there is no meaning he is inclined to take his life, and he is prepared to do so even if all his needs, to all appearances, have been satisfied.²⁰²

²⁰⁰ Steven Sandage and Jeannine Brown, “Relational Integration, Part I: Differentiated Relativity Between Psychology and Theology,” *Journal of Psychology and Theology* 43, no. 3 (2015): 166.

²⁰¹ Kalman Kaplan, “Obedience and Disobedience/Rebellion in Biblical Versus Greek Narratives: Toward a Biblical Psychology,” *Pastoral Psychology* 60, no. 5 (2011): 659.

²⁰² Viktor Frankl, *The Unheard Cry for Meaning*, (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1978), 20.

There are supplemental approaches to the likes of Victor Frankl and Abraham Twerski. Frankl defends his process of Logotherapy as one that supplements any other type of therapy or stands alone. Citing the term, “Logotherapy,” he states it may be conceived as “healing through meaning.”²⁰³ In this, he implies its religious compatibility. He is implying that meaning in a religious person’s life may be the relationship and service to their God. In such case, Logotherapy would help a person examine their relationship with God.

It may be unethical for a clergyperson to advise a depressed person that they must surrender their misery to God, without first walking with that person for a time. Should that person complete a suicide, it remains unclear whether the clergyperson was competent to recognize the signs of suicidality, and whether he or she could recognize the need for intervention. On the other hand, should a clergyperson seek to be prepared to the fullest extent possible for the genuine and potential pitfalls of human suffering, they may recognize how to, with compassion and knowledge, help a person connect with God in a meaningful way. No matter a counselor’s credentials or worldview, meaning-centered therapy provides a competent basis of care that counters no form of faith or theology. Frankl writes, “Religion provides man with more than psychotherapy ever could.”²⁰⁴ Yet also adds, “The less psychotherapy condescends to serve theology as a handmaid, the greater will be the service it actually performs. One need not be a servant to be able to serve.”²⁰⁵ Intended to be non-controversial, skeptical

²⁰³ Frankl, *Unheard Cry for Meaning*, 20.

²⁰⁴ Viktor Frankl, *Man’s Search for Ultimate Meaning*, (New York: Basic Books, 2000): 80.

²⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, 81.

clergy may investigate Frankl's "handmaid" to religion for its ability to derive their own theological understanding and application of helping others in times of crisis.

In the narrative portion of *Man's Search for Meaning*, Frankl tells the story of the confiscation of his manuscript, while also stripped of family, outward identity, and morale. His purpose became, therefore, to survive in order to be reunited with his family, and meanwhile began to rewrite the manuscript from memory, inspired by a piece of Bible found in his pajamas.

In Frankl's endeavor after surviving the Holocaust, to teach others about meaning and purpose, he cites 11 studies that connect addiction and suicidal depression with a person's sense of meaninglessness.²⁰⁶ He addresses the commonality of an "existential vacuum," which he calls a "mass neurosis," and a "feeling of meaninglessness."²⁰⁷ Frankl's description of "mass neurosis" is the existence of a cultural and societal problem as opposed to an individual. Conversely, the veterans who take their own lives, may be facing individual crisis of a cultural proportion: "If a person has found the meaning sought for, he is prepared to suffer, to offer sacrifices even, if need be, to give his life for the sake of it. Contrariwise, if there is no meaning he is inclined to take his life, and he is prepared to do so even if all his needs, to all appearances, have been satisfied."²⁰⁸

Not only does Frankl describe the solution to this existential vacuum as spiritual,²⁰⁹ but he also asserts that the problem encompasses spirituality (he calls noological), psychology, and biology. He further asserts that the spiritual matters are the highest of the three and therefore

²⁰⁶ Frankl, *Man's Search for Ultimate Meaning*, 20-28.

²⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, 23.

²⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, 20.

²⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, 22.

encompasses the other two factors (psychological and somatic). Therefore, all three are involved in the etiology of mental illness.”²¹⁰ This description corroborates with Blackburn and Owens, cited elsewhere in this chapter.²¹¹ Even utilizing of the medical model (which frames every human challenge in a pathological context), describes the “mind” as encompassing far more than a person’s brain. This thinking may account for Frankl’s hypothesis where a psychological or physical malady can stem from a spiritual one.

Using depression as a symptomological example of one of three components of the “mass neurotic triad (depression, aggression, and addiction),”²¹² its effects on the transition out of military service may lead to what Frankl called a noogenic neurosis, a lack of purpose created by insufficient tension in a person’s life.²¹³ All military career specialties are either aggressive in nature or serve in support of aggression. They are rife with meaningful purpose, stressful, and task-oriented. In fact, the primary function of a military system is to destroy a threat by fostering a culture of disciplined and specialized aggression.

Thus, it emerges that the human is not just in search of tension, but one in search of tasks whose completion might add meaning to his existence. Basically, people are motivated by the “will to meaning,” as empirical research in recent years has confirmed.²¹⁴

²¹⁰ Frankl, *Man’s Search for Ultimate Meaning*, 23.

²¹¹ Laura Blackburn and Gina Owens, “The Effect of Self-Efficacy and Meaning in Life on Posttraumatic Stress Disorder and Depression Severity Among Veterans,” *Journal of Clinical Psychology* 71, no. 3 (2015): 219–28.

²¹² *Ibid.*, 226.

²¹³ *Ibid.*, 225.

²¹⁴ *Ibid.*

Military service gives servicemembers an intense sense of purpose and meaning for life that is not easily or automatically renewable after the transition to civilian life.²¹⁵ Given the unique resiliency of military veterans²¹⁶ and their deep need for purpose,²¹⁷ therapists should be willing to explore a veteran's sense of meaning within their experiences²¹⁸ and seek renewed purpose and the utilization of new data, combining innovative approaches with evidence-based theories.

Deeply entrenched beliefs, about what makes psychological growth possible today, operate as Platonic ideas, or meta-codes, for interpreting and assigning meaning to life. These codes usually are inculcated through the religio-cultural environment surrounding people during crucial periods of their life.²¹⁹ Within the context of adapting new purpose after military service, despite visible or invisible wounds of war, Wounded Warrior Project encourages alumni to adapt to a "new normal."²²⁰ Several other Veteran Service Organizations are thriving as the result of their meaningful and purpose-oriented mission, established on ethnographic foundations. Veterans of the War on Terror created action-oriented organizations such as Team Rubicon²²¹

²¹⁵ Heather Robertson and Pamela Brott, "Male Veterans' Perceptions of Midlife Career Transition and Life Satisfaction: A Study of Military Men Transitioning to the Teaching Profession," *Adulthood* 12, no. 2 (2013): 67.

²¹⁶ Patrick Armistead-Jehle et al., "Posttraumatic Stress in U.S. Marines: The Role of Unit Cohesion and Combat Exposure." *Journal of Counseling and Development* 89, no. 1 (2011): 84.

²¹⁷ Blackburn and Owens, "Effect of Self Efficacy and Meaning," 220.

²¹⁸ Mordechai Rotenberg, "Psychology and Judaism," in *The International Encyclopedia of Judaism*, edited by Jacob Neusner (Boston: Brill Leiden, 2005), 69.

²¹⁹ Ibid.

²²⁰ Brooks Fletcher. "Empowering Wounded Warriors to Establish New Normal." *Soldier Magazine*. January 9, 2012. Accessed May 31, 2017. https://www.army.mil/article/71341/empowering_wounded_warriors_to_establish_new_normal

²²¹ Team Rubicon, "Our Mission." Accessed May 31, 2017. <https://teamrubiconusa.org/our-mission/>

and The Mission Continues.²²² These organizations adapt military experience into community service. Mighty Oaks Warrior Programs is a faith-based initiative that serves a unique niche, focusing on mental, emotional, spiritual, and relational well-being as a catalyst to developing and accessing strengths required to preserve meaningful relationships and build new purpose. The meaning-based capacity boasts high resiliency rates in their Marriage Advance program and zero suicides among alumni.²²³

Blending Approaches to Achieve Posttraumatic Growth

Blackburn and Owens examined veterans' sense of self-efficacy and found positive correlations to PTSD and depression. Indeed, more recent research demonstrates depression and other human conditions as more than a disease of the brain.²²⁴ VHA and others must imbibe every facet of a veterans' life. Instead of an exclusive focus on symptomology of the brain, the VHA and others who work with veterans would do well to consider that the veteran may not express his intentions but may potentially act upon them because of his overall sense of who he is, and the fulfillment of what he intends to accomplish. "Neither the subjective nature of these mental states nor their representational content can be explained in terms of the brain alone. The medical model more closely captures the idea that the mind is not located in any one place but is distributed among the brain, the body, and the environment."²²⁵

²²² The Mission Continues, "About." Accessed May 31, 2017. <https://www.missioncontinues.org/about/>

²²³ Mighty Oaks Warrior Programs, "About." Accessed May 31, 2017. <http://www.mightyoaksprograms.org/about/>

²²⁴ Blackburn and Owens, "The Effect of Self Efficacy and Meaning," 220.

²²⁵ Glannon, "Depression as a Mind-Body Problem," 247.

The VHA's suicide report demonstrates the striking efficacy of enrollment in services as causing a decreased likelihood that a veteran will complete the act of suicide before treatment begins. VHA currently reports robust plans to expand resources to identify veterans most at risk and to provide programming. However, the programming must be culturally relevant. Moreover, VHA must cultivate an environment conducive to a resistant population. An Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America (IAVA) report states that out of a sample of its 2.8 million members, 52.5% reported an unprofessional/unwelcoming staff, difficulty with care providers, [and] poor quality of care" at VHA facilities.²²⁶ However, the VHA is not entirely failing as many participants surveyed also reported some improvements in quality of care and service. While there are some key elements to be built upon to reduce mental health issues with veterans, such as evidence of a veteran's willingness to seek services, and noted improvements in quality of care and service, there is much to be done to address the disparity between veterans and the services they require.

Blending Approaches to Achieve Post-Traumatic Growth: A Consideration

Mental health providers, caregivers, peer supporters, and proponents for veterans' issues require specialized knowledge and understanding to be useful in assisting survivors of military trauma to experience restoration and adaptation. Not all survivors find themselves in utterly difficult circumstances, but for those that do, in-depth understanding of the cultural implications is invaluable.

Research is beginning to reveal a cultural understanding for mental health treatment of veterans, particularly in cognitive-based therapies and the reduction of symptoms. However, the

²²⁶ Maffucci, and Frazier, "7TH Annual IAVA Member Survey," 20.

prevalence of mental health issues among veterans is increasing, and veteran suicide rates have significantly risen since September 11, 2001. Meaning-centered therapy is a way to accommodate the strengths of combat veterans and allows for consideration that moral injury may broaden the options to arrest other trauma-related issues, including PTSD, depression, and suicide. The result of successfully addressing moral injury can be the transformation of traumatic experiences into growth.

Hall believes that the trained response of service members' to engage stressful situations becomes a double-edged sword where accepting the responsibility of stress management is the simultaneous acceptance of blame for stress-induced reactions.²²⁷ This moral paradox explains how stigma related to seeking help continues to exist and why only approximately 50% of those identified as having mental health concerns have received services.²²⁸ Xenakis suggests, "comorbid medical illnesses and injuries affecting mental state and general health and the failures of the systems that treat them contribute to the so-called 'resistance' of chronic PTSD, depression, and anxiety."²²⁹ Glannon agrees, based on his psychoneuroimmunologic premise cited above, that depression, when treated by a medical model, is best treated in a blended approach: "MAOI's and SSRI's [psychotropic medicines] can enhance the effect of cognitive psychotherapy." However, "proper treatment of the disorder requires the understanding of more than the brain or central nervous system."²³⁰ Indeed, Nibuya, Morinobu, and Duman show that

²²⁷ Price, Stickley and Proseck, "Fall in Line with Duty," 82.

²²⁸ *Ibid.*, 81.

²²⁹ Steven Xenakis, "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder: Beyond Best Practices," *Psychoanalytic Psychology* 31, no. 2 (2014): 237.

²³⁰ Glannon, "Depression as a Mind-Body Problem," 245.

mental and emotional trauma also causes symptoms and diseases within the body.²³¹ It is, therefore, conclusive that Xenakis and Glannon are not arguing to dispose of the medical model, but to enhance and transcend the model's current practices in mitigating injuries and surpassing current solutions. A holistic approach is necessary to help put injuries, both seen and invisible, into a new perspective.

Glannon argues that the limitation of neurotransmitter modulation through antidepressants are in their inability to “determine [the] content” of a person's fundamental beliefs, thus he calls for a broader array of interventions that address the whole state of clients.²³² Abel, et al., have determined the significance of therapists' competence in case conceptualization as necessary for the proper application of Cognitive Behavioral Therapy in treatment-resistant depression.²³³ In working with veterans, this becomes a multicultural issue. It becomes the veterans themselves, who must not only be heard but understood, regarding these most pressing of issues. Moreover, it requires the practices of medicine and psychology to have the discipline to continuously measure the effect and outcomes of their services, as per the veteran being a self-authority.

The Veteran Administration's planned response to suicidality among veterans, which has increased by 32% since 2001, directly addresses issues derived from the Rand study on behalf of Wounded Warrior Project (WWP) Alumni.²³⁴ Survey participants were Post-9/11 veterans with a

²³¹ Masashi Nibuya, Shigeru Morinobu, and Ronald S. Duman, “Regulation of BDNF and trkB mRNA in Rat Brain by Chronic Electroconvulsive Seizure and Antidepressant Drug Treatments.” *Journal of Neuroscience* 15, no. 11 (1995): 7540.

²³² Glannon, “Depression as a Mind-Body Problem,” 246.

²³³ Anna Abel, et al., “Sudden Gains in Cognitive-Behavior Therapy for Treatment-Resistant Depression: Processes of Change.” *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* 84, no. 8 (2016): 734.

²³⁴ Tanielian and Jaycox, eds., “Invisible Wounds of War,” 128.

service-connected disability or service-connected eligible disability. According to the study, the primary barrier to providing mental health care to this population is logistical. VA's statement on veteran suicide demonstrates plans to increase engagement of veterans of highest concern, through improved outreach, expansion of the VA's Crisis Line, increased staffing of specialists in crisis intervention, improved training in the assessment of suicidal ideations, and discussion about same-day mental health services.²³⁵

The Rand study presents an additional challenge to the VA by identifying veterans' fears of "stigmatization by peers or family" as an "institutional and cultural" issue. The VA has proven that veterans engaged in VA health care are far less likely to complete suicide; however, it is the very issue of veterans receiving services that is the crux between suicidality and treatment. The Rand study identifies the importance of veterans choosing the correct types of treatment they receive.

Blending Approaches to Achieve Post-Traumatic Growth: An Application

Practitioners trained to identify moral injury through deep listening may be better suited to integrate Xenakis' application of "general systems theory." Proper resources, training, self-awareness, and cultural education are needed to address the ". . . the complex interplay between the psychological and physiological. Properly trained personnel will recognize the cumulative and synergistic effects of the psychiatric, neurological, metabolic, and pain problems, both clinical and subclinical, that contribute to treatment-resistant PTSD, depression, and anxiety."²³⁶

²³⁵ US Veterans Health Administration, "News Release" (Office of Public Affairs, August 29, 2016).

²³⁶ Xenakis, "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder," 236.

Analysis of behavior in this context drives case conceptualization in a purposeful way. However, it is not without complications; “Some researchers caution against viewing maladaptive behavior as related to trauma, yet [Linehan] notes that ignoring traumatic events in the client’s history can invalidate the client’s experience. Clinicians must consistently identify and observe the positive inner resources available in the client’s environment.”²³⁷

Should a variety of evidence-based practices provide a diversity of perspectives, then it may be possible that the implementation of the combinations of practices will provide a multivariate of evidence-based outcomes. For example, Schmuldt cites the use of Dialectical Behavioral Therapy (DBT), Eye Movement Desensitization and Reprocessing (EMDR), and Group Development Perspective in the context of utilizing the veteran’s perspective.²³⁸ He asserts that analysis of behavior as it relates to function rather than form, in the interest of the client, will be respected by veteran-clients when and if rapport can be established. It is essential for clinicians to remember that the warrior identity is an assured identity (to which veterans ascribe) with security and a sense of purpose and meaningfulness, in which individuals are exposed to new opportunities and exciting experiences while under the guidance of a stable structure, clear boundaries, and controlled decision-making.

Cultural stigma and career pressures to avoid diagnosis during military service can forge barriers to care for veterans after service. Veterans assisting other veterans can reduce the barriers to care. Robertson’s literature review²³⁹ identifies peer-based, narrative approaches for

²³⁷ Laura Schmuldt et al., “The War Within: One Soldier’s Experience, Several Clinician’s Perspectives,” *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 1, no. 1 (January-April 2013): 15.

²³⁸Ibid.

²³⁹ Robertson, “Narrative and Peer-to-Peer Approaches,” 72.

combat veterans that do not conflict with concurrent, cognitive-based treatments commonly used for PTSD.²⁴⁰ Moreover, Robertson discusses the blending of peer support and narrative support for veterans' ethnographic development of self-awareness in "areas of strength, spirituality, relationships, and appreciation," thereby assisting the veteran to reframe cognitive focus; "the soldier's growth highlights both the strengths and coping strategies within the soldier."²⁴¹

Moran, Burkner, and Schmidt demarcate the "critical life areas" that manifest growth from correlated traumatic experiences as "relationships, personality, self-efficacy, and spirituality."²⁴² Nelson defines posttraumatic growth (PTG) as "positive changes stemming from being victimized or encountering adversity [and]... ability to create meaning from the traumatic event."²⁴³ Bush, et. al., cite various theoretical models of PTG as having "drawn extensively from PTSD constructs" with measurable outcomes in "coping activities, rumination and meaning-making, cognitive appraisal and personality" with the use of the posttraumatic growth Inventory (PTGI).²⁴⁴ Their study of 5,302 service members returning from combat found that high scores of PTG, regardless of the intensity of PTSD, is positively correlated with lower levels of suicidal ideations. If this effect is confirmed by future studies to be robust over time and

²⁴⁰ Stephanie Nelson, "The Posttraumatic Growth Path: An Emerging Model for Prevention and Treatment of Trauma-Related Behavioral Health Conditions," *Journal of Psychotherapy Integration* 21, no. 1 (March 2011): 4.

²⁴¹ Robertson, "Narrative and Peer-to-Peer Approaches," 72.

²⁴² Sena Moran, Eileen Burkner, and Judy Schmidt, "Posttraumatic Growth and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder in Veterans." *Journal of Rehabilitation* 79, no. 2 (2013): 34.

²⁴³ Nelson, "Posttraumatic Growth Path," 6.

²⁴⁴ Nigel Bush, Nancy Skopp, Russell McCann, and David Luxton. "Posttraumatic Growth as Protection Against Suicidal Ideation After Deployment and Combat Exposure." *Military Medicine* 176, no. 11 (2011): 1220.

of clinical significance in wider samples of service members, it may empower clinicians to integrate positive as well as negative factors into their suicide risk assessments.²⁴⁵

Review

The medical model of treatment to those injured in combat is reflective of the warrior ethos to overcome barriers to survival by identifying and focusing on the discrepancy and treating it aggressively. The concomitant warrior ethos of the American military synergizes the medical model effect and is reflected by increasing survival rates in modern warfare.

The initiation of providing help is a great stride toward healing in a veteran's life, however, medical model is not sufficient to approach the mental health of veterans. If we only reduce symptoms of PTSD, depression, anxiety, and addictions, we do not necessarily reduce suicide because of a deeper fracture, on moral and spiritual levels. Posttraumatic growth may be a schematic that mental health and clergy can follow as veterans navigate their way through the healing process.²⁴⁶

Others can assist combat veterans to achieve posttraumatic growth by finding meaning in their present circumstances, and purpose for their future.²⁴⁷ Clinicians recognize Logotherapy²⁴⁸ and other meaning-centered therapies as stand-alone therapeutic modalities, augmentation to other therapies,²⁴⁹ or even a non-adversarial to a generally "sola Scriptura" approach.

²⁴⁵ Bush, et al., "Posttraumatic Growth as Protection," 1215-22.

²⁴⁶ Ibid.

²⁴⁷ Lawrence Calhoun and Richard G. Tedeschi, eds. *Handbook of Posttraumatic Growth: Research & Practice* (Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers, 2006), 6.

²⁴⁸ Frankl, *Will to Meaning*, 124.

²⁴⁹ Rachel Bolaji Asagba, "Logotherapeutic Management of Persons with Substance Abuse/Dependence," *IFE Psychology: An International Journal* 17, no. 1 (2009): 89.

Logotherapy may include, or inhibit spirituality based on the desire of the client.²⁵⁰ In other words, it is a modality that is both psychological and spiritual and does not conflict with a person's particular religion, be it Jewish or Christian.

The use of Abel's assertion that developing highly competent case-conceptualization in treatment-resistant depression (which is often concomitant with PTSD) instills hope and supports emotional processing, can be derived from the practice of deep listening.²⁵¹ Deeply listening to a veteran for the development of highly competent case-conceptualization may reveal treatment-resistant depression as an underlying moral injury. This, in turn, may serve to prevent suicide and spark posttraumatic growth.²⁵²

Nelson's critique regarding posttraumatic growth seems consistent with moral injury where a therapeutic environment must foster the ability to fully process grief and loss, particularly loss perceived as "unjust" while gleaning meaning from the process. Counselors, (whether clinical or clerical) must strive to understand military culture and veterans as individuals. A concentrated effort should be put forth to listen intently to grieving veterans. The intent is to process through the trauma of war toward acceptance and resilience. Veterans will graduate to self-reliance upon a re-evaluation of religious and spiritual beliefs in a way that assists in reorganizing perspective. In so doing, values and priorities will begin to manifest. Moreover, research across cultures and life stages supports these items leading to existential meaning and purpose.²⁵³ In this vein, is the overview of the usefulness of all facets of resources

²⁵⁰ Frankl, *Unheard Cry for Meaning*, 19.

²⁵¹ Abel, et al., "Sudden Gains," 731-32.

²⁵² Nelson, "Posttraumatic Growth Path," 4.

²⁵³ *Ibid.*, 5.

cited in this literature review; from medicine to psychology, from trauma to growth, from hopelessness to faith.

Finally, resilience alone does not form the entire solution to challenges of veterans success regarding transition from military to civilian life. Resilience must be properly applied to specific challenges with sniper precision, acquiring closely identified targets; vulnerable points in the bridge between veterans in distress and access to care, properly equipping and supporting veteran poised for outreach, equipping veterans to harness their resilience for culturally-informed (civilian) identification of their specific tasks toward meaning and purpose, professionals developing deep listening skills to seek an increased understanding of military culture and identify moral injury, and always ready to assist particular veterans who choose to pursue their faith.

CHAPTER 4

MIXED METHODS: PSYCHOSPIRITUAL EXAMINATION OF FAITH AND IDENTITY

Research Topic

An examination of ethnographic sources for successful transition from military to civilian life among members of the Messianic Jewish Community.

Introduction: Theology and Psychology

This study is theological and psychological in nature. It utilizes qualitative analysis by narrative interview and quantitative analysis by psychological instrument. The study seeks to examine the process of military transition as well as the relationship of identified variables between cognitive process and faith in military veterans of the Messianic Movement. This mixed method study, of concurrent nested design will examine the phenomenon of transition from military to civilian life, while making consideration for related issues such as religious identity, clinically relevant trauma through quantitative measurement.

It is important to note that there may be impactful information regarding those who strive to reverse the effects of moral injury and mental health challenges by deriving meaning from their relationship with their Creator. Though trauma is a prevalent military experience (not always in combat), not all veterans will display posttraumatic symptoms. In the transition from military to civilian life, many challenges exist, some of them happen to be mental and spiritual in

nature. To this end, development or enhancement toward faith helps people render meaning in their experiences, thereby overcoming major obstacles toward renewed purpose and facilitation for human growth.²⁵⁴

Research and dialogue among experts regarding the emphasis of religion, faith, or spirituality and their relationship to psychology have not been conclusive that either field should predominate. For example, Habenicht explained spirituality in mental health to be a sweeping term that is a paradigm shift in recent integrations of psychology;²⁵⁵ however, her overview of various approaches to biblical-psychological synthesis do not meet an exacting model. This study seeks to discover raw data identified in psychological and theological perspectives expressed in the veteran's own words, for the purpose of understanding the intrinsic values and strengths of the individual to succeed in their own transition. Thus, it attempts to avoid contextualizing itself through faith or psychology by emphasizing focus on research subjects' own words and expressions. All things will be considered as much as possible, giving the study an added component derived from grounded theory. While not entirely a grounded theory methodology of research, the mixing of data without it being dominated by psychology or spirituality, attempts to broaden both fields of data to analyze.

Research Design

This study is grounded in a derivation of an ethnographic study in Orthodox Judaism. The researcher advanced “a line of inquiry, grounded in previous hypotheses and studies of

²⁵⁴ Viktor Frankl, *The Unheard Cry for Meaning* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1978), 34.

²⁵⁵ Donna J. Habenicht, “The Bible and Psychology,” (Paper presented at the Symposium on the Bible and Adventist Scholarship, Dominican Republic, 2000).

factors that motivate altruism.”²⁵⁶ While Linenbager studied the impact of “empathy, unintended consequences of altruism, altruistic role modeling, collectivism, and principlism”²⁵⁷ on motivation of altruism, this study examines faith, identity, and obstacles to transition from military to civilian life in members of the Messianic Jewish Movement. The ethnographic component is two-pronged. First, the study seeks to highlight veteran participants intrinsic value systems and sense of identity is they relate to their military and religious experiences, as well as possible impact of trauma and sense of purpose. Secondly, research observations are derived from comparisons on patterns as participants activities involved in veteran and Messianic Jewish culture. The data derived from participants are evaluated by coresearchers immersed in Messianic or military culture, or both.

The coresearchers are among the ethnographic source for applying “a grounded theory ethnography methodology.”²⁵⁸ Also included in the ethnographic model are the semi-structured use of narrative interviewing. The theological and psychological evaluation of data will occur through synthesis of evaluating the interviews by a mental health professional with extensive, personal experience in military service, and Messianic theologically “comparing findings to the extant literature on altruism and calling.”²⁵⁹

This study is intended to derive substantial understanding of veteran’s sub-culture. It attempts to follow a similar pattern as the altruism study, explained as following: “In order to understand the myriad aspects and manifestations of altruism, this study used an ethnographic

²⁵⁶ Linenberger, Stephen. "Sources of Altruistic Calling in Orthodox Jewish Communities: A Grounded Theory Ethnography." (PhD diss., The University of Nebraska – Lincoln, 2010), 1.

²⁵⁷ Ibid., 1.

²⁵⁸ Ibid., 2.

²⁵⁹ Ibid.

grounded theory approach to generate a theoretical model in order to illustrate the ways in which specific cultural sources interact to promote altruism and calling in the Orthodox Jewish community.”²⁶⁰ Similarly, this study seeks to inform clergy to be equipped with knowledge regarding the manifest challenges of military transition, and how there are intrinsic values and strengths that coincide with the success of veterans around them, regardless of the exacting nature of each veteran’s personal challenges, including the presence or lack of mental health issues.

When veterans and their families seek existential or well-being support, they tend to contact clergy before other helping professions. This study adheres to that understanding, while also utilizing clinical knowledge and theories to evaluate, derive, and measure the significance of issues through current literature, psychological instruments, and narrative interviews. Therefore, the study is an ethnographic study with a mixed methods analysis of data collected from a grounded theory approach, regarding of veterans facing transition from military to civilian life within the Messianic Jewish Movement. It will include narrative interviews to derive veteran’s personal expressions of purpose and identity as it relates to their military transition. A baseline understanding to determine if there is a presence of trauma will be derived through administration of the Davidson Trauma Scale. They will also complete the Meaning in Life-Questionnaire, and the Religious Identity Measure.

Three interviews will be recorded, then analyzed by two co-researchers. The first is an ethnographic expert in military culture and mental health, with 30 years of service in the Army Reserve as a Licensed Clinical Social Worker. The second is an expert in biblical Hebrew and

²⁶⁰ Linenberger, “Sources of Altruistic Calling,” 13.

Judaism, as well as retired from 20 years of service in the U.S. Navy. They will individually seek out expressions of identity, meaning and purpose, as well as anything they find notable to their fields of expertise as well as military experience. Their analysis will be synthesized by the primary researcher for final analysis in chapter five.

The co-researchers will seek subjective expressions in the recordings regarding the interviewees' own transition experience. Furthermore, they will seek expressions of what the interviewees do to derive a sense of purpose in life after military service, and the importance of their own identity from religious perspective. Co-researcher will derive information based in the context of their own areas of expertise (mental health, theology, and culture). The primary researcher will validate findings with use of the psychological measurements, psychology, theology, and cultural insight. Questionnaires are given to the participants just before or just after the interview, depending on comfort of the subject, and analyzed by the primary researcher for trauma symptoms and expressions of religious identity. Two co-researchers will look for meaning making process including Messianic Jewish influence within the interviews. The qualitative and quantitative analysis will be concurrent and the meaning making process contrasted with the posttraumatic stress.

Population and sampling procedures

Previous chapters in this dissertation sought to establish that veterans are inherently oriented to living their lives with purpose. Many obstacles to shifting their sense of purpose from a military context to post-military context may cloud their perceptions to identify this inherent trait. This study intends to build insight for veterans, their families, and congregations to overcome such obstacles to the benefit of all. In some cases, residual effects of combat stress such as suicidality, depression, and substance use/abuse are factors affecting this population. It is

essential to be aware of such grave issues. However, these symptoms are not the focus of this research project because the solution of identifying purpose and cultivating identity are germane to civilian transition at large. In this project, individuals recount their own purpose and identity experiences in pursuit of a journey common to all people of faith: the pursuit of hope.

Three program participants (interviewees) will undergo the study. Participants may have experiences of combat related trauma, Military Sexual Trauma, grief and loss. However, these are not requisite factors in qualifying to interview. The requisite factors are, having served in the U.S. Military and involvement in the Messianic Jewish Movement. The primary researcher will attempt to determine how interviewees faith from a Messianic Jewish perspective has impacted their sense of post-military identity, and how those factors served as catalyst in their civilian transition.

While people self-actualize in many different ways, the purpose of this study is to present information that may be useful to clergy and pastoral care professionals who encounter veterans in their scope of ministry. The importance of transition is emphasized over any single issues that may occur in transition, because it is common to all. Other chapters of this dissertation, including theology and literature review attempt to be solution-oriented. Unless specifically trained, no clergy should attempt to diagnose and treat a singular issue such as posttraumatic stress (PTS), moral injury, or military sexual Trauma as a subject matter expert. What clergy does have at their disposal should not be underestimated. Their access to the investigation of biblical truth and to learn about the people around them is an opportunity to learn the importance of identity in military culture and to witness a veteran access their own faith in one of the greatest challenges servicemembers face—transition.

In perspective, living life successfully is a greater issue than coping with PTS. Yet it can be a stumbling block to living life successfully. In the same way that there is an order of precedence within faith, hope, and love, love is greater than faith and hope. Life is greater than PTS (or any other single challenge). A solution-focused way of life underscores identity as a solution to problems than simply identifying with the problems we face. We are not our problems. Military culture imbibes a permanent aspect of our identity, therefore its significance (with its own values and language, etc.) cannot be negated. But it is singular and not all encompassing. Clergy have an opportunity to understand its significance in the veterans around them, while being able to correlate a broader, biblical understanding of identity that synthesizes all aspects of a veteran in a way that helps to overcome one encompassing challenge- transition to civilian life.

Participant veterans will be identified by word of mouth in the Messianic community. Qualifying criteria will include a willingness to emphasize the importance of their faith and have substantial military experience (spent a minimum of ten years in military service, obtained significant rank and levels of responsibility, etc.). Additionally, they will have been discharged or retired from service for at least four years or be able to articulate an intentional investment in less than four years to a deliberate transition toward a post-military life. For example, if they were severely wounded in combat and therefore unable to continue their military service. Participants will demonstrate maturity in insight to their faith and the ability to contemplate the practical challenges of civilian transition and its impact on their faith. These things are able to be derived by informal interview.

Instrumentation

Establishing a baseline of understanding of interviewees will include three psychological instruments. One of these is the Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS). The Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS) is a simple instrument frequently used by Veteran Affairs to determine the clinical presence of a psychological traumatic injury. It is not intended to determine exacting details of the presence of trauma. It is administered to a person to aid them in self-reporting the presence of trauma and the relevance of some symptomology. Examples of such are to help a person identify a significant traumatic event in their past, and how frequent and to what level of severity they are troubled by the memory of that event.²⁶¹ The remaining two instruments are the Meaning in Life Questionnaire (MLQ) and the Bell Measurement of Religious Identity (BMRI). The MLQ will help researchers understand how much participants place value on existential meaning. Finally, the Religious Identity Measure will help researchers determine how much Messianic Jewish context impacts participants value systems.

As the previous section of this chapter stated, trauma may not define a person's identity, but the significance of its presence in interviewees is useful in order to consider its impact on interviewee perceptions. Clergy may not be equipped to use such a tool, nor is it necessarily appropriate in many pastoral settings; the DTS is a "self-report" instrument. In that vein, engaging a veteran in ministry setting is commensurate with any person where they will choose what to reveal and when, based on the efficacy of rapport-building and cultural understanding.

²⁶¹ Scott McDonald, Jean C. Beckham, Rajendra A. Morey, and Patrick S. Calhoun, "The Validity and Diagnostic Efficiency of the Davidson Trauma Scale in Military Veterans who have Served since September 11th," 2001. *Journal of Anxiety Disorders* 23, no. 2 (2009): 248.

If self-report reveals significant levels of posttraumatic stress, three safety factors are in place that have been approved by South University Institutional Review Board; First is the qualifying criteria of subjects whose time out of service is at least four years and demonstrates a history of self-responsibility, increasing the likelihood that they have developed a baseline of coping skills. Second is follow-up by the primary researcher after the interview, which is supported by the researcher's training and experience in mental health and ministry as well as the evidence-supported dynamic of ethnographic support. Finally, the primary researcher maintains the responsibility to refer and activate the local care system for veterans participants in crisis. Any person in a helping profession, including clergy should prioritize the skills of mobilizing a local crisis response system capable of managing veteran crisis.

The Meaning in Life Questionnaire (MLQ) is utilized as a correlation of military-imposed drive to have purpose, and how the nexus between purpose and identity impacts the veteran. While military life tends to supply service members with a strong sense of purpose and identity, transition out of military service can leave a person to explore a more personalized understanding of who they really are and what their new "mission" may be. Different people are motivated differently regarding how important meaningful purpose is for them. However, engaging in meaningful purpose for a veteran may have significant impact in the extent of success (defined by the veteran) is achieved in military transition. Understanding a veteran's extent of intrinsic motivation to pursue meaningful purpose can be valuable to the people around them if a transition struggle is evident.

Examples exist in psychology wherein the search for and the attainment of a construct are independent. Among these are theories of identity formation. In his influential articulation of identity formation, Marcia (1966) used concepts of exploration and commitment (adapted from

Erikson, 1968) as the axes of a two-dimensional space that describe the stages of identity development. In this model, individuals proceed from identity diffusion, in which they have neither explored nor committed to an identity, through identity foreclosure, in which they commit to an identity without exploring internally consonant alternatives, and identity moratorium, in which they are exploring possible identities without committing to any. Finally, individuals commit to some identity discerned through exploration, a stage called identity achievement. Models that predicate the necessity of an exploratory or searching stage have also been used in racial, ethnic, and sexual identity research. One might argue that the development of meaning in life runs parallel to the development of identity and that some people may be at a stage of meaning diffusion (low presence, low search), meaning foreclosure (high presence, low search), meaning moratorium (low presence, high search), or meaning achievement (high presence, high search). To be consistent with the identity formation literature, in the case of meaning achievement, the implication is that people have searched in the past, although they may or may not still be searching for meaning.²⁶²

The Bell Measurement of Religious Identity (BMRI) is a measurement provided in a dissertation by David Bell which “shows that religious identity often implicitly functions in individuals in a subconscious fashion.”²⁶³ Given that it was developed by Bell in his dissertation and therefore not likely been widely used, its topic is significant to this study and its use is based on the premise that dissertation research is designed for its structure to be duplicatable.

Moreover, Bell’s research is based on Erikson’s theory of human growth and development.²⁶⁴ He

²⁶² Michael Steger, P.Frazier, S. Oishi, M. Kaler. “The Meaning in Life Questionnaire: Assessing the Presence of and Search for Meaning in Life.” *Journal of Counseling Psychology* 53, no. 1. (2006): 89.

²⁶³ David Bell, “Religious Identity: Conceptualization and Measurement of the Religious Self,” (PhD diss., Emory university, 2009), 12-48.

discusses the subconscious nature of religious thought as well as its relevance to the cognitive sciences.”²⁶⁵ Finally, Bell draws strongly from “Marcia’s four identity statuses specific to religious identity functioning.”²⁶⁶

Erik Erickson’s psychosocial theory explains how personality develops according to a genetic plan and influenced by societal rules and expectations of individual conformity. There are eight stages of development from birth to death. Successful completion of presenting problems that Erikson calls psychosocial crisis, allow for a person to progress toward the next stage of development. Common tenets underlying each stage are trust, morality and self-understanding of identity.²⁶⁷ These concepts are likely to manifest in interview regarding military culture. For example, the issue of trust may indicate issues with moral injury.

One of the ways in which Bell ties religious identity to cognitive development is the descriptive experience of ontogeny. This is the “motion” of personality, or, the idea that personality is not static, but ever changing, whereby several theories of human development and identity are intertwined. For example, Robert Kegan’s description of ontogeny allows for the phenomenon of faith, or religion to enmesh with personality as a person turns to religion during time of crisis: “[A] lifelong process of evolution or adaptation is the master motion in personality, that the phenomena of several developmental theories are plausibly the consequence of this motion.”²⁶⁸ Kegan, thereby validates the process of integrating developmental theories for

²⁶⁴ Bell, “Religious Identity,” 12-48.

²⁶⁵ Ibid., 62-94.

²⁶⁶ Ibid., 96-108.

²⁶⁷ Erik Erikson, *Identity and the life cycle*, (New York: W.W. Norton, 1959).

²⁶⁸ Robert Kegan, *The Evolving Self*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard, 1983), 113.

a comprehensive and non-static conceptualization of a veteran in transition, as he or she presents in pastoral care.

A basic understanding of the Bell Measurement of Religious Identity being rooted in the intertwining of human growth and development, identity, and religion segues to the applied analysis of the measure based on three of four of Marica's identity statuses specific to religious identity formation. These are identity diffusion, foreclosure, and moratorium, and are widely used in the measure of religious identity formation, also based on Eriksonian thought, and applied in "semi-structured interview."²⁶⁹ Finally, the measure is intended to be administered to persons during "crisis" of faith and identity.²⁷⁰ In summary, the BMRI's roots in established psychosocial theory, integration of religious identity and fundamental analysis of persons seeking significance on crisis makes it suitable to assist in the evaluation of veterans seeking an understanding of their identity in faith as a useful measure in this study. Therefore, the questionnaires will help to collect PTS, religious identity and quality of life data as baseline to contrast in the interviews.

Narrative Interviews

The narrative portion (interviews) of the study are modeled after the structure of two studies that emphasize the importance of interviewees own linguistics as the means to obtain definition (e.g., identity) and existential meaning (e.g., how one reconciles their military service with who they are as a veteran). One is a study on bullying, the other evaluates the meaning of

²⁶⁹ Bell, "Religious Identity," 97.

²⁷⁰ Ibid., 97.

violent experiences among its participants with a hypothesis that they would be able to derive personal meanings to violent acts through the observation of films depicting significant violence.

Narrative interviews with participants will identify commonalities in language related to their sense of meaning related to military service. The subjectivity of their explanations is rooted in how human perception varies with individuals. The narrative style of interview allows for a broad range of expression by the interviewee. It is intended to be nuanced enough for the veterans to be able to express their self-perceptions in their transition and what it means to them. Just as military and Messianic faith each have their own linguistic usage (exemplifying culture and identity) they may present even more uniquely in singular expression through a single veteran. Collectively, each veteran may express similarities based in their common challenge examined in this study, which is military to civilian transition. Therefore, this study will seek commonalities in what the interviewees express in military identity and faith, as well as how these items impacts or impacted their transition to civilian life. This may result similar to an example explained in the bullying study:

The concept of ‘interpretive repertoire’ was used in the bullying study as a means to identify recurring terms by the interviewees in order to derive a definition for bullying. This design moved beyond evaluating isolated individuals’ perceptions of bullying and instead encompassed and “focus[ed] on the role of socially shared linguistic resources drawn upon to construct bullying” (Salmivalli, 2001, 135). This represents a novel approach to addressing cultural norms and similarities in thought systems among students. Research on bullying typically identifies conflicting information between attitudes and actual observed behavior of victims and bullies (Salmivalli, 2001).²⁷¹

²⁷¹ Heather Powell, Stephanie Mihalas, Anthony Onwuegbuzie, Shannon Suldo, and Christine Daley, “Mixed Methods Research in School Psychology: A Mixed Methods Investigation of Trends in the Literature” *Psychology in the Schools* 45, no.4 (2008): 300.

The Shaw study on bullying emphasizes the importance of participants defining their own meaning. In this veteran study, meaning will be derived from narrative interviewing, drawing commonalities through an ethnographic perspective.

In the second study, the researcher employed the “philosophy of narrative study” and underwent an analysis of narrative meaning by asking subjects to identify and describe movies at their own will, thereby allowing the subject to define violence in their own terms.²⁷² “Narrative structure” or the use of language was identified in the meaning-making process so that comparisons were drawn to the participants’ personal violent experiences or first-hand witnessing of violent acts and how they reconciled these experiences through observation of the violent films. By this means, participants defined subjective meaning for themselves, and the researchers observed commonalities among them. Similarly, this study will look for emerging themes in meaning making and identity formation as they relate to their faith.

Assumptions and limitations

Veteran health is a conundrum for society. There has been little reduction in the veteran suicide epidemic, in spite of increased federal funding and research. Community response is heartfelt and genuine. military culture is complex and challenging for civilians who desire to help in its difficulties. This study is intended to bridge the gap between veterans self-advocating and increasing community understanding, thus maximizing resources.

In relation to data collection and analysis in this study, such information only serves to inform clergy, but may not provide guidance on what to do with it. Messianic Jewish congregations are equipped with resources that can have a positive impact on servicemembers

²⁷² Rachel Shaw, “Making Sense of Violence: A Study of Narrative Meaning,” *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, no. 1 (2004): 131.

transitioning to a post-military life. A pastoral counselor can assist combat veterans in achieving posttraumatic growth (PTG).²⁷³ It can be addressed with effectively with a fundamental understanding of military culture, exploring meaning in their present circumstances and looking toward new purpose for their future.

Regarding culture in a ministry setting, a perspective is depicted in the work of Clifford Geertz.²⁷⁴ If the purpose and meaning of the Bible is the Messiah, then readers may also derive more specifically, how and why Yeshua presented himself to his father as an atoning blood sacrifice for the sin (1 Jo. 2:2; Ro. 3:25)- his personal meaning and purpose for his life. In this way, Yeshua's humanity serves as an example of how to live. In the Geertz model, the "local" is the Messiah and the "particular" of the Messiah is his personal mission. Such an emphasis is a helpful reminder for theologians seeking to operate consistently from an empirical view of culture in theological context.²⁷⁵

Concepts derived from meaning-centered therapies, such as Logotherapy, may be overlooked by clergy in pastoral care settings, without consideration for their biblical relevance. While they can be implemented as stand-alone therapeutic modalities,²⁷⁶ they frequently augment other counseling theories, and do not conflict with most biblical counseling applications. "In itself, Logotherapy is a secular approach to clinical problems. However, when a

²⁷³ Lawrence Calhoun and Richard Tedeschi, "The Foundations of Posttraumatic Growth: New Considerations," *Psychological Inquiry*, 5 (2004): 93.

²⁷⁴ Robin Koning, "Clifford Geertz's Account of Culture as a Resource for Theology." *Pacifica: Journal of the Melbourne College of Divinity* 23.1 (2010): 33.

²⁷⁵ *Ibid.*, 33.

²⁷⁶ Rachel Asagba, "Logotherapeutic Management of Persons with Substance Abuse/Dependence." *Psychologia: An International Journal* 17, no. 1 (2009): 90.

patient stands on firm ground of religious belief, there can be no objection to making use of the therapeutic effect of his religious convictions and thereby drawing upon his spiritual resources.”²⁷⁷

It has been demonstrated that the application of Victor Frankl’s theory, Logotherapy, reduced a suicide epidemic in Vienna, Austria, immediately after World War I to zero percent. Frankl himself reports his application and understanding of Logotherapy during his three years in Nazi concentration camps. In his book, *Man’s Search for Meaning*, Logotherapy’s underlying tenets make the distinction between those who survived Auschwitz and those who died from merely losing their sense of purpose and meaning in life.²⁷⁸

“[Logotherapy] could be translated as ‘healing through meaning,’ although this would bring in a religious overtone that is not necessarily present in Logotherapy.”²⁷⁹ Frankl contends Logotherapy to be in contradiction to what he claims is the fundamental tenet of traditional psychotherapy, where therapy is the meaning of traditional styles, Logotherapy facilitates a veteran to move beyond the counseling environment, and derive a tangible meaning from his or her experiences, and move toward a new purpose. A pastor or rabbi may find biblical correlations to Frankl’s words as he explains the dichotomy of a willingness to suffer for something worth living for: “It had been overlooked or forgotten that if a person has found meaning sought for, he is prepared to suffer, to offer sacrifices, even, if need be, to give his life

²⁷⁷ Victor Frankl, *The Will to Meaning*, Expanded Edition. (New York: Penguin Group, 2014), 93.

²⁷⁸ Victor Frankl, *Man's Search for Meaning* (Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 2006).

²⁷⁹ Victor Frankl, *The Unheard Cry for Meaning* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1978), 19.

for the sake of it. Contrariwise, if there is no meaning he is inclined to take his life, and he is prepared to do so even if all off his needs, to all appearances, have been satisfied.”²⁸⁰

A willingness to suffer for something worth living for draws striking comparison to military service. Frankl asserts that the process of meaning-making and a will towards purpose is spiritual, as well as encompasses all of a person’s being, and is therefore, superior to traditional forms of psychotherapy.²⁸¹ In this way of encountering a meaning-making approach to pastoral care that is biblically corroborated, other evidence-based techniques may prove useful supplements without usurping biblical principles: “Therefore it is perfectly legitimate for us to use the sound findings of both psychodynamically and behaviorally oriented research, and to adopt some of the techniques based on them.”²⁸²

As has been stated, not all veterans suffer from severe psychological symptoms. But all are or have been challenged with the substantial transition from active military culture to immersion in civilian society. The difference of cultural tenet, daily life and expectations, including the significance of purpose are vast. While the solution of finding purpose is significant to all veterans, many do suffer from serious issues that Frankl addresses, including unemployment, depression (and suicide), aggression, and addiction.

Frankl coined a term, “unemployment neurosis,” that doesn’t necessarily require a veteran to be unemployed for it to be useful in a pastoral care setting as it regards to a veteran realizing and attaining a tangible sense of purpose; “But again, upon closer investigation it turned out that the real cause was the confusion of one’s being unemployed with his being

²⁸⁰ Frankl, *Unheard Cry for Meaning*, 20.

²⁸¹ *Ibid.*, 20.

²⁸² *Ibid.*, 23.

useless, and, hence, his life's being meaningless. Financial compensation, or for that matter social security, is not enough. Man does not live by welfare alone."²⁸³

Regarding aggression, it needs not be argued that military culture leverages aggression to accomplish its mission. Many veterans struggle with aggression in post-military life. Veterans Affairs sponsors countless program in anger management, and Veteran Treatment Courts are populated with veterans who have a proven nexus between their legal charges and trauma-related violent behaviors. Frankl's perspective on aggression is that humankind requires tension. When tension is inadequate in a person's life, they create more. Therefore, a combat veteran may be faced with the challenge to reduce the volume of tension or aggression they acclimated to, so that the tension created in problem-solving situations leads them to default to aggressive behaviors. Frankl "proposes the following four theses: (1) Man not only does not primarily care for tension reduction- he even needs tensions. (2) Therefore, he is in search of tensions. (3) Today, however, he does not find enough tension. (4) That is why he sometimes creates tensions."²⁸⁴

Regarding addiction, Frankl argues that a significant contribution to addiction is a vacuum regarding meaning in a person's life. He cites several studies:²⁸⁵ In 1973, Betty Lou Padelford's study of 416 students discovered, "a significant relationship between drug involvement and purpose in life was found beyond reasonable doubt." Padelford's literature review included several studies with similar findings.

Logotherapy itself undertakes several techniques related to helping a person self-actualize. However, this is not for its sake alone. The purpose of self-actualization ultimately

²⁸³ Frankl, *Unheard Cry for Meaning*, 24.

²⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, 94.

²⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 26-27.

leads to purpose. Yet, in order to determine an effective purpose, one must know oneself. This study emphasizes the importance of identity because of the cultural aspect of military identity, therefore Logotherapy is inserted here to address the possible limitations of clergy being confronted with the knowledge of transition challenges revealed through this study. Even without the use of Logotherapy as a whole, meaning-making does not conflict with faith. As a veteran removes the military uniform forever, so goes a major expression in the fusion of identity and purpose. To discover new purpose, a veteran must also know who they are. “What is called self-actualization is, and must remain, the unintended effect of self-transcendence; it is ruinous and self-defeating to make it the target of intention. And what is true of self-actualization also holds true for identity and happiness.”²⁸⁶

The techniques spoken of include one that is relevant to this portion of the study- Socratic dialogue. The intent of Socratic dialogue is to help a person discover the purpose behind their suffering; For example, a veteran may only be aware that they are experiencing a void in their civilian life, and long for the past where their life in the service where life seemed satisfying. Facing the reality of transition that military life will never again manifest, Socratic dialogue in pastoral care may help the veteran discover that it is the purpose of a mission that they are truly missing- something that is attainable in civilian life. The use of Socratic dialogue in this pastoral care setting, “can use a series of investigative questions to increase the client’s perception of potentially meaningful pursuits, in accordance with information about him or her gained by the counselor during sessions.”²⁸⁷

²⁸⁶ Frankl, *Unheard Cry for Meaning*, 94.

²⁸⁷ Aaron Smith, “Logotherapy to Treat Substance Abuse as a Result of Military Related PTSD,” *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 61 No. 1 (2013): 68.

Veterans Affairs has recognized the significance of spirituality and clergy for healing aspects of veterans suffering with posttraumatic stress and moral injury.²⁸⁸ Consideration should also be made in treatment planning for spirituality and religion among veterans when they share such beliefs in secular treatment.²⁸⁹

Dresher and Foy describe posttraumatic stress disorder and moral injury in a pastoral context.²⁹⁰ In recognition of combat veterans struggling with mental health issues, they address spirituality as a catalyst to posttraumatic growth (PTG). “[Spirituality] may help combat veterans achieve posttraumatic growth that could lead to benefits, such as increased resilience in the face of future life challenges, increasing meaning or purpose in life, and strengthened capacity to utilize positive coping sources amid crises.”²⁹¹ Those charged with pastoral care have resources at their disposal that can address intrinsic motivations of military culture, such as meaning and purpose. It is perfectly suitable for a veteran’s new mission or purpose to be derived from the meaning of their faith.

Permissions Used in the Study

The study has been approved by the South University Institutional Review Board. Volunteers participating in this study will provide their free and informed consent. The research will be conducted in compliance with all applicable federal regulations governing the protection

²⁸⁸ Jason Nieuwsma, et. al., “Chaplaincy and Mental Health in the Department of Veterans Affairs and Department of Defense.” *Journal of Health Care Chaplaincy* 19, no. 1 (2013): 3.

²⁸⁹ Vickie Stander, et. al., “Spirituality, religion and family therapy: Competing or complementary worlds?” *The American Journal of Family Therapy* 22, (1994): 28.

²⁹⁰ Kent Dresher, and David. W. Foy, “When They Come Home: Posttraumatic Stress, Moral Injury, and Spiritual Consequences for Veterans.” *Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry* 28 (2009): 85.

²⁹¹ *Ibid.*, 87.

of human subjects in research. Subjects will be informed ahead of time of possible triggers due to recalling military service. Subjects will be asked to have personal support resources made available during interviews. The interviewer (primary researcher) is a trained mental health professional with specialization in veterans, including experience in crisis intervention, and training in Critical Incident Stress Management, Applied Suicide Intervention Skills, and assessment for Baker Act.

First contact with participants

Participants are identified by word of mouth, through typical congregational settings and being known for their military service. They are asked to participate in the study as a means to enhance the congregation's understanding the veterans among them.

Instructions and materials used in the study

The study includes use of the Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS), the Meaning in Life Questionnaire (MLQ), and the Religious Identity Measure (RIM). The Davidson Trauma Scale is a self-report instrument utilized to assess current distress in the primary areas of posttraumatic stress disorder clusters that includes perceptions and behaviour's in the areas of intrusion, avoidance, and hyperarousal. There are seventeen questions specifically related to specific experiences in the person's life.²⁹² The MLQ is intended to help in the evaluation of subject's their existential values. Correlated with the RIM, the MLQ is intended to inform the researcher. This is to determine the correlation of their values with how closely the interviewees identify with their religious identity. These instruments will be implemented immediately after narrative

²⁹² Scott McDonald, et. al., "The Validity and Diagnostic Efficiency of the Davidson Trauma Scale in Military Veterans who have Served Since September 11th, 2001." *Journal of Anxiety Disorders* 23, no. 2 (2009): 247.

interviews, to protect the context of the interviews from being influenced by instrument content. Settings are best determined by the subject, based on environments where they are most comfortable. For example, subjects may prefer to meet in their own home, or a quiet location that they are familiar with.

The narrative interviews are intentionally open-ended in order to allow the participant to guide discussion toward what they believe to be important. The interviewer, and co-researchers are well-versed in military culture through personal experience. Co-researchers also emphasize elements of the interviews based on what they believe to be important within their areas of expertise. The primary researcher must exercise objectivity in order to derive the most frequent or otherwise prominent expressions through the co-researcher's findings, thereby determining a repertoire of culturally relevant expressions and values among the subjects.

The essential purpose of the quantitative portion of the study is to determine the subjectivity of meaning in participant's lives. These evaluations will provide baseline understanding of individual participants' sense of meaning before narrative interview commencement, to enhance the synthesis of meaning from qualitative analysis as linguistic expressions are compared between interviews. Correlations will be sought between interviews. While the quantitative outcomes help to establish a measurable baseline on the importance of meaning and religious identity, culture-specific understanding will be expanded by the words of the participants themselves.

Narrative interviews will provide subjective data on how the participants understand and interpret their own situation, relationship with God, purpose, and identity. The co-researchers will provide feedback to the primary researcher, who will synthesize all information for final

outcomes. This mixed methods study may derive unique outcomes due to the quantitative and qualitative components.

CHAPTER 5

RESULTS OF THE PSYCHOSPIRITUAL EXAMINATION

Introduction

South University's Institutional Review Board (IRB) approved the mixed methods study in this dissertation as a study working with human subjects in the fields of theology and behavioral science with minimal risk. David Daugherty was the principle investigator. Ann Johnson and John Schutz were co-investigators. The consent forms can be found in the appendix. For recruitment, individuals were identified for voluntary participation by word of mouth through a local Messianic congregation. The sample was composed of three participants who completed the Narrative Interview, Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS), Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q), and Bell Religions Identity Measure (BRIM).

The Hypothesis Tested

The study examined ethnographic sources for successful transition from military to civilian life among members of a Messianic Jewish Community. In particular, how do the veterans interviewed integrate their Messianic faith with their transition? The study sought to examine the process of military transition as well as the relationship of identified variables between cognitive process and faith in military veterans of the Messianic Movement. There was an underlying intent to determine how purpose and meaning were derived in combat veterans who embraced a relationship with Yeshua as Messiah to overcome issues of posttraumatic stress

disorder (PTSD), depression, and moral injury. However, a number of factors caused deviations to take place. First, research during the literature review led to a much broader topic (and possibly more useful) of transition from military life. This is a topic that is relevant to most major veteran initiatives, and has the capacity to include PTSD, depression, and moral injury. Second, accessing veterans who had all participated in combat, and were willing to undergo the rigor of the interview was not successful. Therefore, inclusion expanded to all military veterans in Messianic communities. Third, there was a deviation in the original plan to guide interviews and derive specific information. Research in the planning stage of the study garnered information about the subjective styles of narrative interview (discussed in chapter 4). This allowed the interviewee's more freedom to express what was most meaningful to them, therefore providing a thicker²⁹³ environment of information to derive commonalities from and synthesis of the data. Finally, narrative interviews allowed freedom for veterans to self-direct expressions of perspective, values, problems, and solutions, as well as to provide empirical data for researchers to observe and report. Priority was placed on the veteran's narrative interviews, followed by self-report within the instruments.

The hypothesis focused on military veteran's in the Messianic Movement and whether integration of their faith enhanced their transition into civilian life. A greater understanding of the Messianic nature of their relationship with God could positively impact identity development, help overcome related trauma, and enhance veteran's pursuit of inherent purpose. The researcher's field of competence in military culture was helpful in the ethnographic approach of the mixed methods investigation.

²⁹³ See chapter 3 regarding Thicke description.

The benefit of this mixed method analysis was to broaden opportunity for empirical understanding of the issues and solutions in veterans' transition to civilian life. The intent was to increase ethnographic insight for those around the veteran population. The mixed-method analysis may also compensate for the time limitations of the study, while providing a baseline of understanding for future studies, such as a study following longitudinal trends in faith development during meaningful transition from active duty to full integrations into civilian life, regardless the duration reported by them. What the study lacked in longitudinal ways, it provided in complexity in combining qualitative and quantitative data as they relate to faith development during meaningful transitions from active duty to full integrations into civilian life.

Procedure

The process started with each participant agreeing to meet with the primary researcher in a setting they found comfortable. The data collection process was explained to them; they were informed of the risks and benefits; assured of confidentiality; and asked to sign releases to share the data without it being connected to their real persons. Next, the interview was conducted with the questionnaires as follow-up. As discussed in chapter 4, the narrative interview process was led by the participant as much as possible, so no script was followed. The interview recordings were then transferred securely to the custody of a clinician and a Messianic rabbi. The clinician examined the data based on a standard mental health intake and case conceptualization. The rabbi sought biblical correlations to participant's expressions. Each participant was analyzed separately. The main researcher merged the clinical and the theological analyses; contrasted the data and the analyses with the research questions; and wrote a final summary of the three participants.

Each participant is presented below as in individual case study format. There is an introduction to the participant's interview that includes general and contextual information about the environment and the disposition of the participant at the time of interview. Next are summaries reflecting the observations of each co-researcher based on their observations of the recordings within the scope of their expertise (clinical and theological). Then, are findings of the Meaning in Life Questionnaire, Davidson Trauma Scale, and Bell Religious Identity Measure. Finally, the synthesis of empirical observation by the primary researcher concludes each participant's case study. The overall discussion will occur in chapter 6.

Participants and Demographic Variables

Ages ranged from late 40's to late 60's. Two of the three participants were male, both Caucasian and of an overt Jewish descent, with one in his late forties and one in his mid-60's. The female was of Hispanic descent and claimed no Jewish familial heritage but was transitioning from a deep Messianic to an Orthodox offshoot (conversion process) at time of interview. All were educated at the graduate level, had obtained positions of leadership in their respective military specialties, served a minimum of ten years of military service, and had experienced several years of time since discharge or retirement.²⁹⁴ One had significant combat experience from military service, one was exposed to indirect hostile fire as a direct care provider to American casualties, and the third had not seen combat.

²⁹⁴ Integrated professional development training in military service is considered graduate-level standing in higher military echelons.

Consent and Risk Mitigation

This concurrent, mixed methods (quantitative and qualitative) analysis, adhered to The Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (Sixth Edition), the Belmont Report²⁹⁵ and APA Code of Conduct regarding ethical practices with vulnerable populations. The primary researcher holds a master's degree in counseling, has three years of professional mental health experience, has undertaken additional graduate-level training in clinical supervision and education, and is an ordained chaplain and a certified veteran peer mentor. Careful ethical considerations were made to constantly assess subjects for spiritual, emotional and psychological wounds. Such issues were prepared for during research, and effort was made to obtain an adequate level of closure of their memories after sharing their experience in interview. This was accomplished through a combination of primary researcher assistance, and encouragement for subjects to activate their integrated support systems. Moreover, interviews tended toward discussions of meaningfulness in adapting to civilian life, rather than reliving traumatic experiences. However, traumatic events in military service are often an integral part of the meaningful experience.

Participants who were willing and informed of the risks and benefits of the study participated in this study of their free and informed consent. The research was conducted in compliance with all applicable federal regulations governing the Protection of Human Subjects in Research. Active duty service members can be considered a semi-vulnerable population due to their institutionalization as well as the history of research on soldiers and the inception of the

Belmont Report.²⁹⁶ Therefore, inclusion criteria in participants included demonstration of years of effort in transition to civilian life. Only mature, seasoned participants were eligible to participate.

Requirement for human subject candidacy in the study included the ability of the individual to demonstrate self-awareness with the primary researcher, and their ability to understand consent. This corroborates the study because this level of understanding helped to produce greater clarity expressed in their own life experiences. This was also supported by participants education level, leadership experience, and time invested in personal transition. As a convenience to the researcher, the primary researcher sought to recruit and conduct research only with Florida residents, so that the protective rights of the participants were consistent, as were the credentials of all researchers.

Researchers were mindful of the possible presence of suicidality, depression, substance use, trauma, and moral injury. While participants may not be cited as a vulnerable population based on their status as former military members alone, possible mental health issues may be present. Efforts to recruit veterans for participation were identified as mature in their faith and their perspective regarding past military service. This was intended to mitigate risk of exploitation or inadvertent harm. Informed consent for deliberate recordings were obtained.

²⁹⁶ *Belmont Report*: Ethical principles and guidelines for the protection of human subjects of research, (National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research, 1979) Retrieved on April 27, 2018 from <https://www.hhs.gov/ohrp/regulations-and-policy/belmont-report/index.html>.

Protection of Participant's Personal Information

Materials involving measurable psychological instruments (DTS, ML-Q, BRIM), narrative interview material, and any other notes directly related to human subjects were handled in accordance with state and federal laws regarding Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA). This included temporary storage of pending materials to be kept under double lock. Further measures included coding direct materials to a master code list, kept separately, that correlated subjects' first names only, to an assigned number on direct materials. Additional protection of the identity of participants was included in this final writing, as only the first letter of their first or last name was used. This was not a stipulation by the Internal Review Board but was an additional measure due to the smallish size of Messianic Communities and the likelihood that some readers within those communities will know the participants.

Co-Researchers

In addition to the military, clinical, and theological experience of the primary researcher, the co-researchers created a triad of experience within the same fields. Ann Johnson is a Licensed Clinical Social Worker (LCSW) who has worked in the field of mental health in and out of military service. She retired from the U.S. Army Reserve at the rank of Colonel after 30 years of service and continues to work with veterans through a nationally syndicated non-profit organization as well as a private therapy practice. She holds a master's degree in social work. Her summaries are accomplished in a similar narrative format of a new client case presentation. John Schutz retired as a Chief Petty Officer and inspector in the U.S. Navy. He is an ordained Messianic Rabbi and congregational leader with a Master of Divinity from Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary. Schutz's summaries sought to determine how veterans saw themselves

through a Messianic theological lens, and how their self-perceptions correlated with Messianic Jewish values.

Interview One: J

J's interview was conducted at his home, by the primary researcher. It was a weekday, and J was home alone while his wife was at work and his children were at school. The interview lasted over three-and-a-half hours, started in the kitchen, and ended in the lanai behind the house. The instruments were implemented after the narrative interview was concluded. After the interview, a recording was furnished to the supporting researchers, without access to the instruments.

J was relaxed at the beginning of the interview and remained engaging throughout. During certain topics that the participant brought up, such as particular combat scenarios, he became highly anxious, but was never agitated. It was evident that he was familiar with the emotions he was experiencing and had developed coping skills to endure and mitigate the feelings without disruption. He was appropriately groomed, and clearly comfortable in his home.

Interview One: Clinical Social Worker Summary of J

Self-determination theory holds that human beings need three basic things in order to be content: they need to feel competent at what they do. They need to feel authentic in their lives. And they need to feel connected with others. These values are considered intrinsic to human happiness and far outweigh extrinsic values such as beauty, money and status. J's early life paints a very different picture of feeling connected or supported by significant figures in his life.

The key male figures in J's life died or abandoned him (positing the same effect). His maternal lineage is in question from the narrative interview. He experienced several Adverse Childhood Experiences which can come into play with adult health outcomes. Parental mental illness or substance abuse, witnessing domestic violence, and physical, sexual, and emotional child abuse, are constellations of exposure related to poor adulthood health.²⁹⁷

In his narrative, J tended to gloss over extended family support system. Formal support systems also appeared to fail both him and his siblings. After his mother was hospitalized when he was ten, there did not seem to be involvement from a child protective agency or caseworkers. He reports his family were welfare beneficiaries. He stated that his father joined the military to escape family responsibilities. There again seemed to be no involvement from family courts or disciplinary military action regarding child support demands.

J was born to a teenage mother. [Did his parents marry? Did they complete high school, and what was their income level? Did his mother have a history of mental or physical impairments?]²⁹⁸ J spoke about his religious formation from a history from his maternal great grandmother. The family emigrated from Poland to upstate Pennsylvania, which at the time was a strong coal region which attracted many new immigrants.

J stated the family was Jewish. According to his family history, word from Europe foretold of the impending war and the Jewish peril reached the United States. J's great grandfather saved money to return to Poland, trying to bring the remaining family to the States.

²⁹⁷ The clinician notes this to reveal that some of J's discussion gives her indicators to look for more signs related to childhood trauma.

²⁹⁸ It is important to emphasize again the participant-led nature of the interview. Here, the clinician is noting that there is important information that the participant did not divulge. Her observation is based on the premise that the participant may be avoiding certain information or topics.

He failed and died in a Nazi concentration camp. On hearing the death of her husband, his grandmother cursed her Jewish religion out of anger and loss. She turned to Catholic religion and had her children converted. He also talks of a similar history on his paternal side. He did not discuss formal religious education or rituals in his interview.

J describes himself as having to be responsible at a young age. He had a keen sense of trying to figure out how things worked and working until he could master the workings of machines and processes. He described himself as trying to remain invisible and enjoyed spending time alone and in nature. He described being angry at authority figures several times. Is that due to the failure of significant figures in his life? He did not describe any significant role models such as teachers or clergy. He stated he did well in school. He did not speak about playing sports or college aspirations. He spoke frequently about joining the United States Marine Corp at an early age.

J scored well on his military testing but wanted to join the Marines from war movie images. He stated he did not join for quality of life but the mission. He stated for the first time, his environmental needs were taken care of. He had “3 hots and a cot,” and felt he was able to concentrate on the skills he needed to complete the requirements of becoming a Marine. He felt the Marines had a high standard. He stated that he “kept his head down” and wanted to be more “out of the spot light.” He was not clear about how many years he spent in the Marines. He left after his initial enlistment and returned to Pennsylvania. He mentioned taking a menial factory job and was later observed by a manager who recognized his abilities to handle more complex

jobs. He was unclear how long this time period was. After that, he returned to the military as a soldier in the Army, again, with increasing responsibilities in both leadership and skills.²⁹⁹

Little was discussed on his marital status. He did not mention having more than one marriage (which is more common in military life than civilian counterparts) or how many children he had. It is interesting that he would marry a native German. What was the driving motivation from a family heritage stance and its significance to him?

J describes his Iraqi deployment history in two parts. Part One, he was assigned to Military Transition Team's (MITT) consisting of Iraqi and Kurdish military. He states he was stationed in the heart of the very historical area of Iraq that had Jewish religious significance. He also felt close to his Jewish forefathers during that time. He spoke about growing concern or paranoia of being signaled out as a Jew. He stated that he acted or preformed as a Christian. He spoke as if he was a lone soldier. He spoke little of his active duty battle buddies or leadership.

Part Two consisted of his assignment to a National Guard unit that he describes as untrained for military mission. He stated that he felt he brought the skills to assist this poorly trained unit. He cites a Colonel that he had many difficulties with during this deployment. Was it his difficulty with authority figures? This is the first time he addressed trauma and increasing and collateral stress. He stated that he was not sleeping and described hiding in and behind a wall locker with weapon "locked and loaded," due to an increase in hypervigilance and lack of trust of his assigned unit. He did not mention that anyone noticed his deteriorating condition. He

²⁹⁹ I was unsure if he was Special Forces or Field Artillery, how many deployments he was on, his age at time of deployments, or specialized skill sets. As a culturally informed therapist, this information would be important.

stated his father was the one thing that helped him the most during those dark days (“father” being a faith-based reference to God).

His narrative seemed peculiar not to mention whether he sought mental health treatment while on active duty. He was not clear as to whether he underwent a standard or medical retirement, or how many years he spent on active duty. He does, however, indicate the ability to have accomplished some higher education while on active duty. He did not indicate when he left active duty, or whether he had a transition plan, or any pursuit of mental health treatment post-military. He did mention the idea of suicide and credits his faith in saving his life. He respects that life is meant to be lived. He credits a higher power, his family and a purpose to serve his fellow man. His Posttraumatic Stress symptoms appear manageable at the present time.

Interview One: Rabbinic Summary of J

In some instances, J’s perceptions correlate with Messianic theology and its values, in other’s his perceptions counter them. His fundamental self-perception starts with the environment of his upbringing in a poor family from a small town in northeastern United States.

J seems to be a jokester as a means to cover emotional pain. Messianic Judaism considers knowing one’s heritage to be important, as seen in numerous genealogical listings that include the lineage of both Jacob/ Israel and Esau, as well as many nations. Regarding humor, laughter can conceal a heavy heart (Pr 14:13), but humor is also useful as a medicine (Pr 17:22).

In the interview, J refers to himself as abandoned when his parent’s divorced when he was 6, and his father absconded to the Army to avoid child support and without making any effort to be in J’s life. His expressions do not make any allusion to the theological construct of God (Avi) “adopting” him without ever abandoning him (Dt 31:6; He 13:5; Ep 1:5). These

experiences led to introspection and resolve to be different and break family patterns. As opposed to joining the Army like his father, he joined the United States Marines; no other service would do.³⁰⁰ While J seems to still feel the effects of paternal abandonment, his description of response in the interview is similar to God's position: God hates divorce (Mal 2:16), and no one is destined to commit the sins of their parents (Ezk 18:14).

J correlates his sense of identity to include his high intelligence as demonstrated through military service based upon his military entrance test score and the jobs he qualified for. In the interview, he did not express an acknowledgment to, "The fear of the LORD [as] the beginning of knowledge (Pr 1:7)." However, he did exemplify that, "those who find wisdom and understanding are blessed (Pr 3:13)." He sees himself as special, or even gifted, and good at his job (He is proud of his physical and intellectual capabilities, like marksmanship and math, because of the difficulty in joining the Marine Corps).

His inflections in the interview tend to indicate a sense of gratitude regarding some biblical principles as they affect him directly; "God has numbered every hair on his head (Lk 12:7; Mt 10:30), and he is fearfully and wonderfully made (Ps 139:14). Nevertheless, no one has any cause for pride; all good things are from God (Ja 1:17)." Despite all of that, he sees himself as rather unimportant, because of his heritage (for instance, he seems a bit ashamed of his mother, who was a poor, divorced, born-again, Methodist, superstitious, tarot card worshipper). His attitude of humility is admirable, proper, and wise (1 Pe 5:5-7). Regarding his mother, divination is a sin (Le 19:26), and yet one is to honor one's parents (Ex 20:12).

³⁰⁰ From an ethnographic perspective, this would be considered a "one up" over his father due to the comparative rigor between Army Basic Training and Marine Corp Boot Camp.

He sees himself as a descendent of crypto-Jews. His family hides the fact that they are ethnically Jewish (His Jewish great-grandparents came from Poland. One returned to rescue more family and wound up dying in Auschwitz. His wife, when she discovered that, disavowed Judaism. She converted to Roman Catholicism). Theologically, Israel is the people of God, and as a whole are seen as the tree of faith. Those with faith in the Messiah are the faithful remnant, and those without that faith are seen as broken branches (Ro 11). It is this people who have the covenants with God (Je 31; Ep 2:12; He 8). So, they are the most hated by the adversary (the serpent).

Despite much crass speech, J sees himself as a Christian (that's the term he used first), or possibly a Messianic Jew (mentioned later), but he rarely mentions his faith (in fact, it didn't come up at all until nearly an hour had passed). Theologically, Shaul (Apostle Paul) said that believers should not use vulgar speech, or foolish talk, or coarse jesting—all of which are out of character” (Ep 5:3-4). “Christian” is an English word, stemming from the Greek word “Chrestian” (from the earliest texts) which appeared in only two verses as derogatory toward believers. The motive for his not mentioning his faith for so long is not clear, but if in any way it stems from fear or shame then Luke 9:26 and Matthew 8:38 would apply. Believers are to share the truth, and teach others, in fact, these “rivers of living water” should be flowing out of them (Jo 7:38).

J sees himself as protected and having a purpose. He felt blessed, or lucky, in boot camp (for three meals a day) and said: “There is no question that God was keeping me alive” in Iraq. Yet, he prayed a lot, and wrote a lot in Iraq, because he was afraid he would die. He finds it difficult to believe that he lived. Theologically, the Angel of the LORD encamps around those who fear Him, and He delivers them. Though at times incredibly difficult, we are not to fear,

rather believers are to cast their cares on Yeshua (1 Pe 5:7). We cannot deny the reality of fear, but to battle against it. We are in a spiritual battle throughout our lives (Joshua 1; Is 41:10).

J sees himself as broken and weak (from his experiences) with recurring dreams about the past, and rage issues, but also as someone who should hang on. Theologically, in God, believers can know they are forgiven (Ro 5; Ep 1:7-10; 1 Jo 1:8-9) and know that they have a purpose (Ep 2:10; 5:15-16). They can approach the Creator with boldness, pouring out their hearts (He 4:14-16), knowing that nothing can separate them from His love (Ro 8:35-38). They know that despite the tribulations Yeshua can give them shalom (Jo 16:33).

J sees himself as a protector of people, particularly his own family. Theologically, one “who does not provide for their own household has denied the faith and is worse than an unbeliever” (1 Ti 5:8), and there is no greater love than that which causes one to lay down their own life for their friends (Jo 15:13). In fact, believers are told to “defend the weak and the fatherless,” and to “rescue the weak and needy; deliver them out of the hand of the wicked” (Ps 82:3).

J describes himself as faithful (but it’s not clear in what way, or to whom he considers himself faithful—to family, friends, country, God, or all of those). Theologically, faithfulness is an attribute of HaShem, and is a requirement for his followers as well. The proof-texts for this are numerous, from one end of the Bible to the other.

J’s current roles of service in post-military life are important to him. He serves others as an Attorney, and as a veteran. Theologically, lawyers in the Scriptures do not equate to the lawyers in our society today. That text is referring to those who dealt with the Torah. The field of expertise for lawyers today is not with the Bible, but with civil law. Soldiers were seen as

honorable, and a person's identification with their occupation was as well established in the first century as it is today. In fact, that identification is seen as far back as Genesis 4:2, where "Abel was a keeper of flocks," but his brother "Cain was a tiller of the ground." There is nothing wrong with that identification, as long as one understands that what they do for a living is not all that they are.

J: Narrative Synthesis by Primary Researcher

The Licensed Clinical Social Worker's (Johnson) noted the importance of J's description of a family pattern of abandonment by male authority figures and significantly less acknowledgement of women and children in his family of origin and the family he created. The rabbi (Schutz) noted the same. Johnson comprehensively described J's sense of duty to be responsible, protective, and competent. Concurrently, Schutz did the same, while taking it further by tying J's sense of purpose to theological principles of man began his calling as a warrior in defense of his family and the defenseless, in that order.

Johnson's observation of J's intrinsic sense of disconnect between the importance of his role relationships past and present, seems to correlate with the Schutz's observation regarding J's dichotomous presentation with occasional "crass" speech and deep sense of meaning. Moreover, the rabbi notes that his attitudes and behaviors both closely assimilate to and at other times, disregard theological principles in Messianic Jewish theology.

J: Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q)

Presence of meaning: 16/35

Search for meaning: 5/35

J scored below 24 in both presence and search for meaning, indicating a likelihood that he does not feel his life has a valued meaning and purpose, and is not actively exploring such. These ideas are not likely to be interesting to him. However, this also indicates a limited experience of love and joy, with an increased likelihood of emotions such as anxiety, nervousness, or sadness, depression, and general dissatisfaction with life. He is likely more cerebral with big decisions than emotional, which was probably rewarded in military service, especially during combat. There is synergy with the combat component in that he is more likely to enjoy highly stimulating experiences juxtaposed to a decreased pursuit of meaning and purpose, including love and intimacy.

J: Davidson Trauma Scale

1) ***Intrusive re-experiencing of a traumatic event:***

a. Frequency: 7

b. Severity: 6

• Total: 13

2) ***Avoidance and Numbing:***

a. Frequency: 8

b. Severity: 8

• Total: 16

3) ***Hyperarousal:***

a. Frequency: 10

b. Severity: 11

• Total: 21

• ***Overall Total: 43***

*Clinically significant for
diagnosis of Posttraumatic
Stress Disorder.*

J: Bell Religious Identity Measure

Religious Identity Salience (RISa)

Section I: Implicit (intrinsic) measure for Religious Identity Salience (iRISa) (Subjective)

When asked to use ten words to describe himself, J did not utilize words with direct or indirect connotation to religious salience. This is indicative of Bell's findings that age and higher education correlate with lesser expression of religious identity. When ranked between words with direct connotation to religious salience, indirect words with religious salience, direct words with religious moratorium and indirect words with religious moratorium, J ultimately did not rank religion as highly implicit.

Section II: Explicit (extrinsic) measure for Religious Identity Salience (eRISa)

The significance of J's order of importance with 6/10 elements prioritized with religious connotations placed a high ranking on extrinsic religious salience. This contrasts with his intrinsic religious salience, which was low. This correlates to a moderate level of Religious Salience.

Religious Identity Statuses (RISt)

This section evaluates the convergent validity of Identity Status with implicit and explicit salience from Sections I and II, while looking for differences in global and religious identity.

Section III: Religious Formation

1. Diffusion: 15/42- J feels slight disinterest in placing effort into religious identity.
2. Foreclosure: 15/42- J feels slight disinterest in religious tradition with its beliefs and practices.
3. Moratorium: 11/42- A moderate disagreement score in moratorium indicates a moderate resistance to halting religious identity.
4. Integration: 35/42- J has moderately integrated all aspects of his identity with a religious commitment.

- Overall: 19/42- Slight disinterest in commitment to religious formation.³⁰¹

J: Concluding Observation by Primary Researcher

The ethnographic application of sources (religious community, outward expression of religious identity, making meaning of his experiences) for successful transition from military to civilian status in J's life is reflected in his narrative. The narrative, as reflected by all three researchers indicate a self-reliance by J that is not uncommon among military members. In the narrative, J exemplified a resolve to survive and thrive that was present before he joined the military and something that helped him succeed professionally and survive in combat. Indeed, it is his combat experience where he integrated the expression of his faith.

At the time of the interview, he expressed little interest in making meaning of his experiences, possessing, or pursuing an existential purpose as indicated in the Meaning in Life Questionnaire. Such things are usually indicative within a person's religious life. The Bell Religious Identity Measure also indicates little interest in integration of faith within his sense of self. Hence, there is a dichotomy between the measurable reflection of disinterest in religious identity and expression, yet profound observations about his Jewish family heritage, and his confession that God is the reason that he survived war.

He did not indicate that his involvement in the Messianic Movement enhanced his transition into civilian life. Yet this does not seem to detract from the importance of faith and religion that is overall evident. He did not give specific indicators regarding the manifestation of Yeshua as Messiah in his life (such as Christian or Messianic linguistic expressions) but referred

³⁰¹ There are several factors to discuss regarding an overall "slight disinterest" in religious formation, including the overall importance of identity to veterans as well as the impact of trauma on religious formation. These things will be discussed in chapter 6.

to God in a general sense. Yet, his active involvement in Methodism and Messianic Judaism are concretely set on the backdrop of his Jewish family heritage. As Johnson indicated, there is much information that was not shared regarding J's story. All of the researchers took note of that's significance. However, further research would be required in order to determine omitted information's importance.

Interview Two: S

S' interview was conducted in his home by the primary researcher. S works from home and made accommodation in his work schedule for the primary researcher to arrive during work hours. It was a weekday, and S' wife was in the house recovering from surgery but not present during the interview. There was no contact with her by the researcher or the participant from the time the researcher arrived to the time he left. The interview lasted about an hour and was conducted in a dining area that had been converted to a workspace. Despite the time constraint, the participant was relaxed, engaging, and cooperative. He was appropriately groomed, and clearly in an atmosphere of comfort. The participant was intentional about avoiding distractions but was hurried toward the end of the interview in order to call into a conference call appointment. The instruments were implemented after the narrative interview concluded. After the interview, a recording was furnished to the supporting researchers, without access to the instruments.

Interview Two: Clinical Social Worker Summary of S

Few details were provided during the interview addressing S's developmental history or his family of origin. Was he raised in an intact family, did he have siblings and what is his birth order? We do know he was raised in the Northeast until the age of 14. The family moved to

Florida and by report on to Texas. When and where did he enlist in the Navy? What was his highest educational completion at time of enlistment? Were there issues regarding mental health and relationships in both his family and his formative years?

The participant's (S) age of marriage and his wife's background should be further explored. He has been in a long-term marriage, which suggests stability as well as commitment. During the interview he stated he had two living children suggesting the loss of child/children. That also should be explored in more depth and fleshed out in more significant detail. That would be beneficial in helping define S's view of life and his faith's development and evolution. He several times addresses his dedication to both his faith and family. S continues to demonstrate his commitment to family through desire to locate near family.

The participant's (S) military service provides insights into both his internal and external windows of his world. He describes an internal drive to improve and succeed in both his technical and leadership skills through education. External motivation can be seen in his upward movement through enlisted to officer's ranks shows a dedication to both his fellow Sailors and the Navy. S's ability to plan and adapt to the future is a strength he has demonstrated.

He had planned well for both his transition from the military and his second act (his civilian career). Unlike many military members who leave the service without a well thought plan, he prevented a difficult transition. He again positioned himself by actively seeking out needed training opportunities and long-range planning to succeed. It would have been helpful to know his age of military retirement.

As a self-described Geek he went into the newly developing field of computers and software. He increased his technical proficiency as he looked for new opportunities. As his

career progressed he was able to apply his leadership and managerial skills in developing a mission-driven team. As he winds down his working career we once again see S's goal orientation taking hold in addressing his retirement plan. He wants to make family and faith the center of his plan. He also strives to maintain flexibility as well as community involvement.

In this interview he hints at being involved in the Jewish faith during childhood. It can be inferred that he was raised in a mixed faith family, when he describes himself as Irish, Scottish and Jewish. That would prove interesting in developing a more complete childhood religious history.

Knowing his wife's religious training would also benefit in understanding his religious journey. From the interview his wife appears to have come from a fundamentalist Christian background. Was his newly married status and his limited religious orientation that led to his being "saved"? How was this influence played out in his religious growth and formation? When did his Jewish influence meet with his Christian faith? When did he find the Messianic Jewish faith? He continues to seek out his future and guide his family in his beliefs.

Interview Two: Rabbinic Summary of S

The participant sees himself as a man with roots. He has roots in New York, roots in his family, and roots in his faith. He sees himself as a husband but didn't spend much of his time talking about his wife, other than to discuss some of the impact she had on leading him to the Messiah (1 Pe 3:1). There was no mention of his being her spiritual head (1 Co 11:3). He sees himself as someone whose faith is extremely important to him. This is wise, because, biblically, there is nothing more important (Ma 16:26; He 11:6). He provides evidence for this by his faithfulness to congregational life, his membership in a Christian motorcycle chapter, and his

presence at the National Mall with the Promise Keepers. His faith is not compartmentalized. It dictates his associations, even in his free time.

He sees himself as a Messianic Jew. He acknowledges its influence on how to live, and clearly sees that Scriptures should be understood in a Jewish context to see what a faithful godly life really is. Nevertheless, he is not arrogant. In fact, he doesn't feel others (meaning Christians) are necessarily wrong, referring to: "in My House are many mansions (Jo 14:2)" to stress this point. He acknowledges that Messianic Judaism is not a panacea. People need to work through their issues wherever they are, he says. The defense of other views is a sign of humility and seems general in nature, indicating that he does not concern himself with tensional issues between Messianic Judaism and Christianity, such as Replacement Theology and many people's view that it is anti-Semitic in nature (Mt 25:45). S places more emphasis on his view that all people are somehow broken (Ro 3:23) and "have issues that need to be worked through," wherever they choose to worship.

He clearly sees himself as a father, and that seems to be the closest in importance to his faith. He states that family is important to him, and his stated actions provide evidence for that claim. He has moved, and even changed jobs, just in order to be closer to his grandchildren. Moreover, when asked about his legacy, he only talks about two things: a firm faith foundation in his children and his impact on the lives of others. This hierarchy is biblical (Mt 10:37). His lifestyle of caring for, and tending to, his family is reflective of Abraham's (Ge 14:1-17; 17:23-27), also indicating "favor" from God as such (Ge 18:19).

He sees his employment as a means to an end, not as an end. He sees his job as a blessing but does not list it as a priority at all, despite finding it very fulfilling. In fact, He sees himself as a well-trained, educated, "computer geek." For him, to have a stable life, not driven by a love of

money is satisfying (1 Ti 6:10) while providing for his family as he should (1 Ti 5:8). Nearing completion of a second career (post-military), he is “ready” to retire and speaks of passing responsibilities to the next generation (Nu 8:24-26).

His retired status as a Navy sailor is important to him, but he does not dwell on his military background as a substantial sense of identity. He does seem to exhibit some satisfaction with his performance and was quick to share his success, moving from the ranks of the enlisted to officer, with dedication to his duties on nuclear reactors on submarines. Moreover, despite his accomplishments, he had balance. He did not seem to be exhibiting hubris, just the satisfaction that comes from doing one’s best (Co 3:23).

He does see himself, and his faith, as impacted by his military experience. Being in a Messianic congregation helped him to bloom where he was planted, when required to move every three years. In short, the military helped him to grasp the importance of congregational life (He 10:25). Of course, the purpose includes mutual edification (1 Co 14:12; Ep 4:12).

He sees himself as a veteran who has worked hard, and eventually succeeded in his transition. He could not find work of equal pay upon his military requirement, and it has taken him many years to come to the point of leading 40 others, something he had already proven capable of while still in the military. In providing for his family, S has been an overcomer. So too was Yeshua an overcomer for His family. He overcame death itself for all His brothers and sisters (2 Ti 1:10). For S to fail in his familial responsibilities would imply a lack of faith in God, as well as a lack of wisdom (Pr 6:6; 1 Ti 5:8).

He sees himself as a manager of people who get things done. He is not prideful of that. He simply sees it as a natural progression for people in all fields. One should learn enough to be able to direct operations and make informed decisions. This acceptance is reflective of true

biblical humility. He is a leader like Moshe, who was the most humble man in his generation (Nu 12:3). He prefers not to “toot his own horn.” Such humility is also reflective of the Messiah (Ze 9:9; Ph 2:8).

He sees himself as a manager who gains satisfaction from “taking care of *his people*,” and meeting the goals of the company. He considers those under his care as “*his team*.” His attitude illustrates his faithfulness (Mt 25:21) and is a picture of biblical leadership. He is like a shepherd who cares for his sheep (1 Pe 5:2) and takes responsibility for them.

S sees himself as a man on a faith journey. He says that he has “been saved” since 1978, due in some large part to the influence of his wife but does not see one specific turning point. However, he does discuss several milestones in his “walk.” For instance, he spent 15 years as a Christian of mixed heritage, then became the token “Completed Jew” at a Church and was subsequently sent by his pastor to various Messianic events, before he himself moved into Messianic Judaism. He is not arrogant about that movement, saying it is not a panacea. People have baggage wherever they go, and they need to work through it, he says. He even sees that Messianic Judaism and Christianity have similar impacts on people’s lives. This concept of a faith journey is very Jewish, and very biblical. Those who believed in Yeshua, during the first century, were said to be part of a sect called *HaDerech* (“the Way” meaning the path, or road). Isaiah speaks of a “highway of holiness,” Yeshua speaks of all people on a road to their final destination as well, either a broad road, or a narrow way (Mt 7:13-14). Rabbinic Judaism is no different, using terms like *Halachah*, for example.

He sees himself as someone who is deficient in his spirituality (prayer life, for example). He feels like people think he’s ahead of others in his relationship with God, even seeing him as “someone who people look to,” but knows personally he needs a lot of work. So, he is

uncomfortable even saying that. This reflects great honesty and humility. He knows himself, and he knows that [when he will be judged for his life] no one's opinions will matter. Biblically, it is very clear that no one can fool God (Ga 6:7). In fact, passionate indignation with which Yeshua spoke out against hypocrisy in religious leaders is striking (Mt 23).

S sees himself as one with a balanced faith, having gone through several stages. He was once under Kenneth Hagin, in the "name it and claim it" movement, but that view has changed. He sees no problem praying for health but sees great gain in being content with what God gives to his people. Moreover, nowhere in the New Testament does he see "anyone praying for a new house, new car," etc. God takes care of our needs, he says. This is biblically sound. God is not a butler. He is the Master. While there are sound principles for prosperity in the Bible ("look to the ant," for example), they are not meant to lead people into a life of covetousness and greed. On the contrary, thou shall not covet (Ex 20:17). In fact, the attitude S currently exhibits reflects 1 Timothy 6:6 very well, "godliness with contentment is great gain."

Lastly, S sees himself as one who will always be busy, even after retirement, saying that he would like to be a substitute teacher, with enough free time to travel by RV or bike and to see his family. While retirement is biblical, all people do have a purpose, and S recognizes that. He wants to continue to contribute to society. That is both admirable and biblical (Ts 2:6-8).

Interview Two (S): Narrative Synthesis

Johnson and Schutz initiate their summaries with contrasting perspectives, though not contradictory. Johnson noted the obviousness of certain topics that S did not discuss. Schutz noted S's public reputation in his circle of faith. Both note his performance in valuing personal relationships, careful planning and decision-making, leadership, and considerate conduct in the workplace (in uniform and post-military). Where Johnson and Schutz do contrast is Johnson

expressed concern that all may not be completely well in S's world, while John consistently maintains a theme of biblical accolades regarding S's choices in character development and conduct. Both concluded on some level that S is purpose-driven and that this is a positive aspect of his being.

Interview Two (S): Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q)

Presence of meaning: 28/35

Search for meaning: 15/35

The participant scored above 24 in presence and below 24 in search for meaning. This indicates that he feels a high sense of valued meaning and purpose with resolve. He is likely to be satisfied with his understanding of what makes his life meaningful, why he is here, and what he wants to do. This was also very clear in his narrative interview. He tends to be optimistic, which also ties with his interview where he shared several opportunities to carefully plan for new stages in life and has experienced good outcomes as a result. He likely experiences feelings of love and joy, with limited engagements regarding fear, anger, shame or sadness. His narrative interview also upholds the likelihood of traditional values, and a worldview that supports structure and rules for society. He also tends to be conscientious, organized, friendly, easy to get along with, and socially outgoing while committed to religious pursuits.

Interview Two (S): Davidson Trauma Scale

1. *Intrusive re-experiencing of a traumatic event:*

- a. Frequency: 3
- b. Severity: 3
 - Total: 6

2. *Avoidance and Numbing:*

- a. Frequency: 4
- b. Severity: 4
 - Total: 8

3. *Hyperarousal:*

- a. Frequency: 3
- b. Severity: 3
 - Total: 6
 - **Overall Total: 17**
Not clinically significant.

J: Bell Religious Identity Measure

Religious Identity Saliency (RISa)

Section I: Implicit (intrinsic) measure for Religious Identity Saliency (iRISa) (Subjective)

When asked to use ten words to describe himself, S utilized several words with direct and indirect connotations to religious salience. When ranked between words with direct connotation to religious salience, indirect words with religious salience, direct words with religious moratorium and indirect words with religious moratorium, S ultimately ranked religion as highly implicit.

Section II: Explicit (extrinsic) measure for Religious Identity Saliency (eRISa)

The significance of S's order of importance with 6/10 elements prioritized religious connotations placing extrinsic salience high in rank. This correlates with his intrinsic religious salience, which was also high and therefore correlates to an overall high level of Religious Saliency.

Religious Identity Statuses (RISt)

This section evaluates convergent validity of Identity Status with implicit and explicit salience from Sections I and II, while looking for differences in global and religious identity.

Section III: Religious Formation

1. Diffusion: 20/42- S feels slight disinterest in placing effort into religious identity.

2. *Foreclosure*: 24/42- S feels slight interest in religious tradition with its beliefs and practices.
3. *Moratorium*: 20/42- A moderate disagreement score in moratorium indicates a moderate resistance to halting religious identity.
4. *Integration*: 38/42- S has highly integrated all aspects of his identity with a religious commitment.
 - *Overall*: 29/42- Moderate interest in commitment to religious formation.

S: Concluding Observation by Primary Researcher

The ethnographic application of sources (religious community, outward expression of religious identity, making meaning of his experiences) for successful transition from military to civilian status in S's life is reflected his narrative, as it was in J's. However, S displays a deeper sense of purpose and meaning as well religious formation and overall satisfaction in life. He also indicates no clinical presence of PTSD according to the DTS. The narrative, as reflected by all three researchers indicate a self-reliance similar to J. As was mentioned in J's case, this is not uncommon among military members. In the narrative, S exemplified careful planning throughout the stages of his life and careers, as well as a reliance upon congregations during the tumult of military life. In fact, he indicated a high degree of intrinsic and extrinsic religious salience. In other words, his use of religious connotations and the priority of his values indicate that religion is very important to him.

At the time of interview, he expressed little interest in the pursuit of making meaning in his life but seems overall satisfied with the importance of presence in meaning (relationships with God and family). His track record of planning and preparing for stages of life, as shared in his narrative, appear to be about security and the preservation of the meaning already present in his life (As indicated in the MLQ).

Such things are usually indicative within a person's religious life. The Bell Religious Identity Measure indicates that religion is well integrated to his life and identity, but he is only moderately motivated to preserve his religious identity. This may be due to the length of time he has applied religious traditions and values and preparing to retire. As he plans his retirement days, he has prioritized his activities around family, small contributions to community, and leisure. Religious practice and identity are things that are already integrated to his being and will support his sense of purpose and meaning according to what he considers practical in his next stage of life.

He did indicate that his involvement in the Messianic Movement enhanced his transition into civilian life. He provided explicit indicators to the manifestation of Yeshua as Messiah in his life but indicated that the Jewish context of Yeshua as God is secondary to the importance of His existence, and what he feels people must do to relate to God. His active involvement in and Messianic Judaism are concretely set on the backdrop of his Jewish family heritage, and add richness to his faith, but is not the foundation of it.

Interview Three: M

M chose a public setting for her interview. The meeting occurred in a coffee shop, at a table where she was able to see approaching customers to the store, but not distracted by main lines of traffic within the store. Distractions were minimized, though noise did increase significantly during the course of the interview. This did not seem to impede the content of discussion. The interview lasted about two hours, and the participants displayed a wide spectrum of emotion, from resolve, joy, grief and anxiety. She was appropriately groomed, relaxed, and engaging. The instruments were implemented after the narrative interview. Only one of three portions of the Davidson Trauma Scale were administered due to the maximum possible score

became evident during the first portion. It was apparent that the questionnaire was causing significant distress, and the researcher determined to discontinue.

Interview Three: Clinical Social Worker Summary of M

It is unclear where M grew up but from the interview it appears either Puerto Rico, Cuba or the Philippines. She spoke passionately about her maternal grandfather who embodies her strongly held beliefs. She describes a humble, respected and religious man who led by example. He was dependable, a natural leader and loved his family. M directly attributes her strong sense of self, and her respect for herself and her caring for all God's creatures back to her grandfather. She has a strong passion for caring for the planet and keeping her footprint light.

M describes herself as a loner and disconnected as well as strong, assertive and aggressive. It appears she confuses assertive and aggressive. It appears she sought and continues to seek connectedness through institutions and her religious pursuits.

Her father was a WWII vet, who she describes as remaining aloof from his feelings and demonstration of affection. She felt love from him without being shown or told. When dealing with her father's death she remained a dutiful daughter by fulfilling his last request. She later showed her patience in having him interred at Arlington National Cemetery.

She describes her mother as an independent woman who valued both education and independence. She states her mother supported her decision to enter the military after high school. Missing throughout her interview was a strong sense of connectedness with her family except for her younger brother. She states her younger brother was diagnosed with childhood cancer with an early expectation of death. He beat the odds and died at the age of 37. M uses words such as 'gregarious' and 'connected' with many members of the family.

Also, from her family of origin comes the importance of education. She had several uncles who were educators and principals. She states she completed at least a bachelor's degree as a more mature adult. Again, alluding to "her years in the world." Her love of the earth and animals can also be traced back to her family of origin. On both sides of her family is a long history of farming and dairy farmers.

She states she was born into the Catholic faith and raised in the fundamentalist church. Her family remains within the broad definition of Christianity. M describes herself as a woman of faith on journey toward a clearer path to God. There appears to be an underlying anger within her, which appeared throughout the interview. She states her anger and temper rise when she sees people not caring for each other or the planet. Is this a righteous anger?

She reports her own personal journey began with a crisis of faith. As she began to educate herself with religious teaching from both Christianity and Judaism her views began to change and shift. She began making the distinction between the Old and New Testaments. Her focus shifted from man written New Testament to her view of the direct word of God in the Old Testament. She began referring to God as the old Hebrew term Hashem.

She made several references to Catholicism. She referred to the start of man-made laws and the moving away from God in Christianity. She spoke with an anger directed to Catholicism and the recent priest scandal. It would be of interest to do more exploration with M regarding her beliefs in this area. Did she have a more personal experience?

She at some point describes a religious conversion to giving her life to God. She sought to live simply and have few possessions. She reports she began to tithe. It is unclear what or to whom she tithes. Did she tithe with a formalized religion or a charity? She speaks about moving

into a neighborhood that was less than desirable. She felt God had called her to clean it up and drive out the drug dealers and other unsavory people. She did reference the concept of evil but did not go into greater detail. Is her concept of the world black and white? Is there a space for the grey or ambiguity?

She continued to speak of herself as a loner. She briefly spoke about a divorce and the relationship remains in question from the interview. She states she left it up to God to find her a relationship if that was to happen. She later met her husband who she describes as a godly man. She states she is not subservient to him but respects him and will follow God's teaching. Was there domestic abuse in her first marriage?

Her military history is spotty at best. We know she joined the military at 18 or 19. Did she join the regular army at that time? She appears to have ended her military career as an army reservist. One can gather she deployed in support of Desert Shield/Desert Storm with a Combat Support Hospital. She spoke briefly about working in an administrative capacity within the Triage section of the hospital. That would have exposed her to medical casualties. She briefly described her strength in assisting other soldiers when faced with a difficult task. She also mentioned medical pain because of her military service. She did not go into a more detailed and full explanation. Did she face a traumatic event or events due to her military service?

Coming back around to her religious faith and her deep adherence to the commandments, how did she reconcile her faith and military service? Did the concept of evil play into her military service? Does "thou shalt not kill" and the concept of evil resolve the cognitive dissonance? M now identifies with Judaism but has not formally embraced a congregation. What is next for M on her religious journey?

Questions for further exploration

1. What was her significant trauma history? She was reporting significant stress symptoms at time of interview.
2. Did the recent visit to the Rabbi exacerbate symptoms?
3. What did she mean when she spoke about living in the world?
4. Was there a period that she considered sinful or living outside of her ethical beliefs and behaviors that she presently adheres to now?
5. Was she married before her present husband?
6. What was her military history? I can infer that she served in Desert Storm in support of a medical unit.

Interview Three: Rabbinic Summary of M

The participant sees herself as a person deserving of respect. She expresses close sense of identity with her former occupation as a civil servant, who was called up to active duty by the President. She almost seems to struggle with her veteran status, feels a need to prove herself, and longs for respect. This has a biblical foundation, since all people were made in the image of God (Ge 1:27), where all deserve respect. Likewise, leaders who do well are said to deserve double honor (1 Ti 5:17). The rest of her comments, throughout the interview, illustrate the same longing for respect, as a child of God, and for the things she has done.

She demonstrates kindness, while seeing herself as a servant. Her attempt to assist the interviewer demonstrates a desire to be a provider. Her actions noted throughout the interview illustrate that she is a person who cares about others, treating her neighbor as she would want to be treated. This aligns with Yeshua's teaching, commonly referred to as the Golden Rule (Mt 7:12). It also accords with what Yeshua called the second greatest commandment, which is taken from the Torah, namely: love your neighbor as yourself (Lv 19:18).

When asked who she is, M offers a theological response, saying she is a child of the living God. There are many ways to understand that phrase; one of those ways is to see it as her acknowledgement that God is the Creator of all mankind, including herself. She sees herself as a created being. That is valid (Col 1:16). However, in another sense, the B'rit Chadasha clearly states that those who enter the new covenant are the children of God (Ga 3:26), in contrast to those whose father is the evil one (Jo 8:44; 1 Jo 3:10). With her current state of disaffiliation with the theology that Yeshua is Messiah and divine, this status is not currently valid, despite her many good works.

When questioned about her heritage, it becomes evident again that she wants to be respected and associates herself with her Spanish culture in that regard with its use of titles. In this, she shows herself to be a person who values her heritage, but not in the extreme. This is a value seen repeatedly in Scripture. For example, Esau is shamed for despising his birthright. (Ge. 25:34), but which becomes a stumbling block when taken to the level of pride (Jo 8:33-39). It is one thing to value the godly leadership of Abraham, for example, but another thing to assume eternal life is assured simply because one is descended from him. Regarding the usage of titles, Yeshua spoke against their inappropriate usage, not against their usage altogether (Mt 23:8-12).

She states that she is a person who desires discipline in her life. Rules and structure help her to focus, she says. God too, sees this in all of us, providing us with His rulings given for our own good (Dt 10:12-13). They are even described as food, meaning they are essential for life (Is 55:1; Mt 4:4). She sees herself as a leader with integrity, who does right when she leads by example. She did not join the military primarily for the money, but out of her patriotism. That model lines up with Yeshua who taught, but also lived out the Torah and spoke against hypocrisy quite often (Mt 5:17; 1, 23:13, 14, 27; Pe 2:22).

She sees herself as one who values authority, and hierarchy (referencing Moses use of delegation) but with restraint. She does acknowledge that it is possible to be under too much discipline. She seems to have inferred that this was the case at home. She appreciated the discipline there, but it was too much. It may be an indication of past oppression (or abuse), which God of course stands up against numerous times in the Scriptures, in the Exodus for example (Ex 2:25, 3:7). M also sees herself as having been a provider for the soldiers she was responsible for in the military, as well as her younger brother. She sees herself as a fellow-worker but also a leader. She values family a great deal. Biblically, she sees herself as a good shepherd, who takes care of those for whom she has responsibility. The Bible agrees. As stewards, leaders should care for those under their care (Jo 10:11). Worthless leaders were described as shepherds who did not care for the sheep who were being destroyed. They did not look after the young, heal the injured or feed the sheep. Instead, they simply ate them. They were leaders who “lorded it over” their people, and this was one of the main reasons for the exile (Je 23:1; Ze 11:16).

She says God is the one who determines our longevity, not man. This is another acknowledgement of his sovereignty and is in perfect agreement with Scripture (Lk 12:20). M sees herself as a humble person, as illustrated when she is regarding her brother as a better person than she is, again showing great respect for her family unit. Again, this virtue stems from the Messianic Writings (Ep 4:12). M sees herself as an honest person who values truth and fidelity, and does illustrate that value by quoting Yeshua, that yes should be yes, and no should be no.

She sees herself a person who leads by example. Her respect for family has provided a foundation for her own values: she values humility in others; she admires those who love their families, and she admires other who lead by example. All of these values which she sees in

herself, she also saw first in her maternal grandfather. As a unit, these values developed from her honoring her “father” and “mother.” In fact, she talks about them as “things *we* believed in,” illustrating that her beliefs are tied to her family’s traditional beliefs.

She sees herself as a person who respects herself; indeed, she says that all people must respect themselves first. Yeshua agrees, saying love your neighbor *as yourself* (Mk 12:31). She sees herself as a person who understands that love is more important than money. Scripturally, the love of money is the root of all evil (1 Ti 6:10), but love is the most important thing in life (1 Co 13:12). M sees herself as a person who cares about the poor, citing several “mission trips.” Scripture says that pure and undefiled religion is caring “for orphans and widows in their distress (Ja 1:27).” In fact, Torah demands that the people of God not turn away from the poor (Dt 15:7-11). She sees herself as a person who cares about righteousness and acknowledges God’s authority. In accordance with that, M sees herself as a person who has great respect for all life. The Bible says that a righteous person cares about animals (Pr 12:10). Genesis uses the same word (*nefesh*) for the soul of man and of animals (Ge 1:30, 2:7), and the Bible tasks mankind with protecting (“keeping”) the earth (Ge 2:15). Many Christian scholars acknowledge that the role of man is to be stewards of the earth.

She sees herself as a person with great faith in the Bible. She sees herself as a person enlightened, but with bitterness against what she feels to be falsehoods in Christianity, which she claims all stem from the council of Nicea which (she says) produced Catholicism, and which led her astray for many years. While pagan practices have been assimilated into Christianity, the essential truths are still intact. Moreover, while such bitterness would not be an unreasonable response, it does not warrant a total condemnation of the Church. She sees herself as someone

needing God's guidance. She appreciates God's Word very much, acknowledging that it has guided her in life. Psalm 119:105 reflects the same understanding.

She sees herself as a person who respects integrity in others and speaks of looking only for the good in people. Biblically, as with ancient Israel (Dt 13:10), we cannot ignore the sins of others in the faith, because we are to reprove and correct others (1 Co 5:12-13; 2 Ti 3:16). She sees herself as a person being tested by God. She cites Abraham but adds the idea that by coming through her own pains and trials in life she will be better equipped to help others. This too is biblical and comes from the Messianic Writings (2 Co 1:4).

She sees herself as a person blessed by God with all that she has. She sees him as her provider. Thus, she says all her family income is dedicated to God and claims not to worry because if in need God will hear her prayers, as long as she puts him first. "Ask and you shall receive," she says, quoting Yeshua (Mt 7). The idea of putting God first is reflected in many biblical passages (Pr 3:6) but dedicating all of one's possessions reflects a Messianic Jewish theology, more than a Rabbinic one (Acts 4:32-37). She sees herself as a person who acknowledges that God is always in control, as evident in her mission story about her visa coming miraculously fast. Again, in this context, she quotes Yeshua, who directed people to put His kingdom first (Mt 6:33), and then she adds (from another verse) that He will give you the desire of your heart (Ps 37:4).

She sees herself as a person with a right faith. However, she is a person with a faith that is very mixed. She speaks using terms from Taoism and claims that God offered the chosen people status to all the nations. Biblically speaking, good and evil are not interdependent, and evil is to be shunned. Moreover, her belief regarding the chosen people stems from traditional teaching in Rabbinic Judaism, but it is certainly not biblical. God did not choose Israel only

because all of the other nations turned him down. He chose Israel in order to fulfill the promise He made to Abraham (Genesis 18:19). She sees herself as a person who believes in God, and in the power of prayer. She prays for forgiveness regularly, and believes that God answers her, and shows her what he is offended by, so that she can repent. Biblically, God does answer such prayers. He longs for people to repent (Is 1:18).

She sees herself as a generous person. In fact, she sees herself as a person with a duty to give back to society. Concerning her ideology in giving, she quotes Yeshua, “let your right hand not know what your left hand is doing.” She sees herself as a person being led by God. She even says that Yeshua led her to Judaism but questions his divinity. She says that his divinity is a fabrication by man. This claim ignores many Biblical references to the contrary, from the divine Son of Man in Daniel, to the Son seated on the throne in Revelation.

She sees herself as a person who values sports and hobbies only as a vehicle, which allows people to stay fit in order to serve God better, and perhaps longer. This reflects 1 Timothy 4:8, which contrasts physical training with godliness, but does so without denigrating the former. She sees herself as a person with strong morals. She sees that as important, and she attributes it in large part to her family, meaning both her upbringing and certain exemplars who taught her biblical values by the way they lived as well as by what they said. This evokes an image of Proverbs 22:6.

Though her theology developed a major departure from Messiah, she is a person who claims she knows what she can believe, has considered who she is, has questioned her religion, but has not developed her own individual lifestyle. Rather, she claims: “God has.” However, she acknowledges (thankfully) that she isn’t done yet. Biblically, one should be faithful to their beliefs (Je 2:10) as long as they are correct. The Calvinist would agree that God has shaped her

beliefs, despite her denial of the Messiah's divinity, simply because they would say all things are predestined (Ro 8:29). Those who believe in free will would suggest great arrogance in such a claim, particularly given the grave errors it contains. God would not lead someone to such conclusions, since He does not desire that anyone perish (2 Pe 3:9). Her admission that she is not done yet does leave the possibility that God is going to bring her through this stage, perhaps with greater understanding so that she might help others (2 Co 1:4).

She sees herself as someone with great integrity, and who is well educated in Judaism. However, she repeats the claim that the Torah was first Oral, and later was written down, as though it were fact. This claim for Oral Torah contradicts the Torah itself, where Moses clearly states that he wrote *everything* which God told him (Ex 24:4).³⁰² She sees herself as firmly committed to her religion, and who lives it out. This is in line with what Ya'akov said, regarding the reality of faith (Ja 2:18) as well as Yeshua's stance against hypocrisy.

She is a person who sees her faith as very important to her, and that is why it has changed over the years. She doesn't want to trust other people to feed her the truth; she only trusts God.³⁰³ This ideology has as sound a basis as the Psalmist, she desires to trust in God alone and depend on Him only (Ps 62:5). She sees herself as an introspective loner who values education a great deal, and has proven that with her own 16.5 years (just shy of a Master's degree) of formal education coupled with her studies of Christianity and Judaism. The Scriptures agree to this stance with regards to biblical education, saying we are to meditate on his word, and study it to show ourselves approved (Jo 1:8, 1 Ti 2:15).

³⁰² Schutz is expressing a view that the written Torah started with God writing the Ten Commandments for Moses to carry to the Hebrews.

³⁰³ There are indicators throughout the rest of M's case study of a faith in self, in addition to God.

Interview Three (M): Narrative Synthesis

Consistent with the previous two interviews, the clinical and rabbinic summaries of M are both varied in perspective and complementary. Johnson notes the significant points of interest in M's life story that are missing in order to complete a full clinical picture. Schutz notes the myriad Scriptural principles M expressed. These viewpoints do not conflict but help to present a fuller picture of the veteran placed before the reader. Concurrently, Johnson and Schutz both point to a dichotomous presentation of M (also consistent with the veterans that present with significant trauma). For example, Johnson notes M's contrasting expressions of Old and New Testament along with a historically Catholic upbringing, while John more indirectly observes a myriad of New Testament principles expressed by M in the interview (34 of 57 principles identified by John). Moreover, the depth of her spiritual search and the seriousness with which she takes her life journey is profound.

Interview Three (M): Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q)

Presence of meaning: 20 /35

Search for meaning: 18/35

M scored below 24 in both presence and search for meaning, indicating a likelihood that she does not feel her life has a valued meaning and purpose, and is not actively exploring such. Given that her score in "presence" is not far from the cutoff, and her score for "meaning" is below "presence," it is possible that she is satisfied with a certain amount of "presence." There is indication that her experiences of love and joy are limited, with an increased likelihood of emotions such as anxiety, nervousness, sadness, or depression. She is likely more cerebral than emotional, which may be indicative of her success as a female leader in the military, including

combat deployments, and in spite of historical pressures on female service members to outperform male counterparts.

Interview Three (M): Davidson Trauma Scale

1) ***Intrusive re-experiencing of a traumatic event:***

a. *Frequency:* 16

b. *Severity:* 16

• *Total:* 36

Clinically significant for intrusive re-experiencing of traumatic events. But not a complete evaluation for full diagnosis of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder.

The reporting by M during use of the Davidson Trauma Scale reached maximum scoring level in the first of 3 sections. Therefore, the interviewer determined to discontinue use of the scale out of concern for the discomfort of M. This is particularly due to the topic of the section that M responded to, and the maximum scoring of the severity of memories causing a re-experiencing of traumatic events.

Interview Three (M): Bell Religious Identity Measure

Religious Identity Saliency (RISa)

Section I: Implicit (intrinsic) measure for Religious Identity Saliency (iRISa) (Subjective)

When asked to use ten words to describe herself, M utilized mostly words with indirect connotation to religious saliency. This is indicative of Bell's findings that age and higher education correlate with lesser expression of religious identity. When ranked between words with direct connotation to religious saliency, indirect words with religious saliency, direct words with religious moratorium and indirect words with religious moratorium, M ultimately ranked religion highly implicit.

Section II: Explicit (extrinsic) measure for Religious Identity Saliency (eRISa)

The significance of M's order of importance with 3/10 elements prioritized with religious connotations places a low ranking on extrinsic religious saliency. This correlates with her intrinsic religious saliency. There is an overall low ranking of Religious Saliency.

Religious Identity Statuses (RISt)

This section evaluates the convergent validity of Identity Status with implicit and explicit saliency from Sections I and II, while looking for differences in global and religious identity.

Section III: Religious Formation

1. *Diffusion*: 17/42- M feels slight disinterest in placing effort into religious identity.
2. *Foreclosure*: 13/42- J feels moderately disinterested in religious tradition with its beliefs and practices.
3. *Moratorium*: 22/42- A moderate agreement score in moratorium indicates a moderate disinterest in religious identity.
4. *Integration*: 38/42- J has strongly integrated all aspects of her identity with a religious commitment.
 - *Overall*: 23/42- Slight interest in commitment to religious formation.

M: Concluding Observation by Primary Researcher

The ethnographic application of sources (religious community, outward expression of religious identity, making meaning of her experiences) for successful transition from military to civilian status in M's life is reflected her narrative, as it is with all three case studies. The narrative, as reflected by all three researchers indicates a combination of faith and self-reliance that has been consistent in this chapter as well.

At the time of interview, she did not feel significant presence of meaning in her life, nor interest in its pursuit as indicated in the Meaning in Life Questionnaire. The Bell Religious Identity Measure does not indicate a strong sense of intrinsic or extrinsic saliency. However, M

indicates some interest in the pursuit of religious formation. This is consistent with her current transition from Messianic Judaism to Chabad (a derivation of Orthodox Judaism).

M did not indicate that her involvement in the Messianic Movement enhanced her transition into civilian life, but that she has leaned heavily on a belief on God as Father (Avi) through crisis and transition. She also credits Messianic Judaism (the character of Yeshua in particular) with helping her on her journey to discover God for herself. As the theological summary indicated, she employs many perspectives drawn from B'rit Chadasha.

Conclusion

There is a summation of data to conclude similarities and differences among the participants. Many of the similarities are characteristics shared as veterans, such as drive and resolve. Yet there also seems to be similarities between attitudes toward religion and a correlation with trauma. S did not indicate signs of PTSD, he also indicated higher religious salience and overall religious integration. J and M did indicate presence of PTSD, but also gave low indications of religious salience and overall religious integration. There is another indicator of the presence of trauma and low level of interest in the presence or pursuit of meaning. Yet in spite of this low interest as well as low scoring in religious salience and integration, all three participants seem to live deeply religious lives. These things will be discussed further in chapter six.

CHAPTER 6

DISCUSSION OF EXAMINATION OUTCOMES

Chapter Review

Chapter two provides the theological underpinnings of this dissertation, based in Messianic Jewish understanding. Modern Messianic Jewish theology is developed by scholars who select and synthesize elements of Jewish and Christian thoughts, while also forming a unique approach different from each. The theological chapter frames the dissertation by considering the influence of Judaism and Christianity on veterans in Messianic communities. Specifically, the brokenness of nature as depicted in Genesis leads to such things as war, trauma and moral injury. This, in turn, lays the groundwork for the need of a Messiah. In turn, Yeshua as a divine Messiah, displays attributes that are also identifiable in veteran culture, such as warrior ethic and sacrificial attitude.

Chapter three is a literature review depicting the history of American psychology, rooted in the medical model and its expansion in the history of modern warfare. It examines the expansions of research, understanding and treatment since World War I, to solution-oriented approaches that address posttraumatic stress, depression, substance misuse, and the soul wounds of moral injury in the era of the War on Terror. The chapter ends with suggestions to clergy and counselors to gain increased understanding of military culture to derive excellence in their

efficacy working with veterans. The practice of deep listening validates respect and leads to comprehensive case conceptualization. This, in turn, leads to a more effective application of theology to which veterans can relate and an appropriate use of psychological tools to help veterans find, follow, and rebuild a meaningful purpose in life after military service.

Chapters four and five are an examination of ethnographic sources for successful transition from military to civilian life among members of the Messianic Jewish Community. It is theological and psychological in nature. Using narrative interview, a clinical social worker and a Messianic rabbi examine the expressions of three veterans in the Messianic community. Their observations are synthesized by the primary researcher (dissertation author) in chapter five. Additional information creates another level of triangulation by use of the Davidson Trauma Scale, Bell Religious Identity Measure and the Meaning in Life- Questionnaire, also synthesized deeper in chapter five.

Interview Discussions: J

The Licensed Clinical Social Worker, Ann Johnson, noted an intrinsic disconnect in J's relationships, while paradoxically pursuing authenticity and connection with them, possibly due to his expressions of paternal and maternal abandonment. Ethnographic impact seemed important to J, including his descent from working class, European immigrants to Northeastern United States, the Nazi pressure that led to their immigration, as well as the Holocaust atrocity that impacted both his sense of duty and abandonment by male family authority figures impacting his early formation years. J turned these tragedies into purpose, avoidance of authority, and a sense of value through being competent.

Rabbi Schutz noted a dichotomy in J's behaviors and attitudes, as well as their correlations to a value system within Messianic Jewish theology. In some ways, J's response to

life demonstrated a deep regard for justice and meaning that is closely related to Messianic Jewish perspective of values. In other ways, J does not seem to adopt or frame a perspective on his experiences that are made available to Messianic believers through theological understanding. For example, John noted that J does not express a sense of emotional or positional closeness to God in a father-son dynamic but does regard God as his protector. J continues to be reflective of his sense of responsibility, but less so in a personalized sense. He identifies with biblical principles where he implements his character traits for a greater purpose, such as use of his intelligence and hard work ethics that lead to blessing. He is mindful of his life-long hardships, but cautiously grateful for his blessings (as well as hardships that forged his development) that are meant to be resources for him to continue his purpose as a “protector of people, especially his own family.” While he presents to the rabbi as dichotomous “in speech,” he is ultimately principled, morally minded, and faithful in purpose and service to others.

The interview summaries and measurements created a meaningful picture of a man who is driven to survive and protect. J is resourceful, intelligent, astute, and open-minded to the needs and attributes that will advance his moral cause. He is also a man who carries his struggles “close to his chest.” As Johnson was keen to point out in all three of her summaries, it is important to note what does a veteran *not* say. J gave little indication as to why he felt he must carry his burden alone. There is also an ethnographic connection where military member “carry their own weight.” Moreover, J’s tendency to avoid these as indicated by his score of 16 in the “Avoidance and Numbing” cluster of the DTS, use of humor, and self-perception as “broken and weak” are indications of emotional, psychological, and spiritual distress.

A pastoral approach to J is one of careful consideration and respect. Astute clergy may note his unquestioning belief in God as depicted in Tanakh and B’rit Chadasha. The Meaning in

Life Questionnaire and Bell Religious Identity Measure clearly indicate a lack of interest in pursuit of a deeper spirituality. However, the Jewish aspect of his spirituality is very important to him based on several factors: his family heritage, being identified by Kurdish and Iraqi Moslems as a Jew. Equally important to him is his encounters in northern Iraq where Satan is believed to have first appeared on Earth (Ge 3:1-6). J recalls countless combat scenarios in that same area where, “There is no question that God was keeping me alive [in Iraq].” I would caution any clergy to not quickly write off a person like J in their congregation for an unwillingness to seek the deeper insights to their value system that is carefully guarded. J’s deliberate use of Messianic Jewish identity does not directly manifest in his narrative. However, the importance of his Jewish family heritage and his faith in Messiah are strongly indicated in the stories he shared. Being outwardly recognized as a Messianic Jew is not important to J. But he expresses deeply the intrinsic factors of his faith in Yeshua and the cost of being a Jew as he responds to the most difficult of challenges in his life.

Interview Discussions: S

Johnson noted several topics that S did not lead into during his interview, implying that perhaps he was not comfortable discussing them. In this case, the topic of identity remains important, however, there is a strong extrinsic trend involving his productivity, relationships and religion. For the purpose of this interview, this is not necessarily bad. In fact, it is useful as a case study to note the ways in which people establish boundaries. The case conceptualization here is that a clinical approach will note areas of avoidance by a congregant or client regarding difficult topics. However, should a person in crisis and clergy come together to address the crisis, the avoidance of certain facts by the person may call for further exploration in order to rule out whether the person is avoiding a particularly difficult area. Nonetheless, Johnson noted S’s

strong resolve for purpose, responsible planning and management of major life transitions, adherence of personal values, and the prioritizing of his primary relationships- things are often overlooked by transitioning service members.

Schutz's overall summary reflects a man who is valued and esteemed in Messianic Judaism. He drew many correlations to biblical principles regarding conduct and character as a faithful Messianic Jew. Schutz noted S's use of congregational life during the challenges of military service.³⁰⁴ All service members experience sacrifices in time, relationships, and many other aspects that distinguish them from others in congregational settings. Schutz also noted substantial challenges that S experienced in his post-military transition, including significant time spent working his way up to the level of responsibility he earned in the military. Finally, Schutz noted S's drive for purpose that is inherently conditioned into military servicemembers, even after retirement. S was careful to note that Messianic Judaism is not essential to all believers in Jesus, though it is an essential expression of his own identity in faith. He stated this as a priority in describing who he is while not allowing in-depth discussion regarding it. It was not derived by researchers through deep listening, save for the attempt to seek subtle expressions to the contrary, of which there were none.

Interview Discussions: M

Within the scope of the narrative interview, M kept control of the discussion. It is therefore evidential that M chose discretion over certain topics, also evidencing avoidance of uncomfortable topics. It should also be noted that the primary researcher was unable to complete the Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS) due to the difficulty M had in completing it.

³⁰⁴ It should be noted that combat is not the only delineation of stresses in military service.

Johnson's summary depicted some dichotomous presentation: anger and righteousness, Old and New Testament commensurate with a belief that HaShem wrote the Old Testament (Tanakh) and man fabricated the New Testament. Regarding ethnic identity, Johnson noted evasiveness within M's pride in her heritage, but also laced with loyalty to it. Johnson was unable to derive if M was from Puerto Rico or Cuba or the Philippines, while M also hesitated to share that she reports herself as Caucasian. These nuances that can be very important to understanding the depth of thought in a congregant, particularly someone such as M who is ultimately seeking connectedness through groups and institutions.

Schutz's detailed analysis depicted M's deep theological connections to her sense of responsibility as a loyal follower of her Creator and a provider and a leader. As a Messianic rabbi, Schutz underscored her spiritual journey, with historical connections from Catholicism to Messianic Judaism, to a departure from belief in Yeshua as a divine Messiah, to Orthodox Judaism. Nonetheless, Schutz articulated M's close connections to her ethical principles and theological roots as well as her passionate connection to God as she understands Him.

Accessing co-researchers and participants

As part of an ethnographic study, participant recruiting was based on rapport building. The military experience of the researcher, a veteran himself, as well as a common religious background, was intended to derive familiarity with the participants' values and experiences. The intent was for research to provide better understanding of the subculture of veterans with Messianic communities at large and make greatest use of the information. Participant selection was derived from the primary researcher's access to and involvement in Messianic Jewish culture. After an unsuccessful attempt to recruit participants through congregational leaders, personal canvassing became the method to find eligible participants.

Discussion of Narrative Interview Process

There seemed to be a dichotomy present in two of the three participants. They emphasized the importance of religious practice and identity in their lives, that was counter to some of the findings in the psychological instruments. All three researchers were convinced of the importance of religion as expressed in the interviews, including the participants' use of religious practice to cope with military transition, trauma and moral injury. Yet, the Bell Religious Identity Measure indicated lower scores in religious salience among the two participants who scored high on the Davidson Trauma Scale. Three participants is a small sampling, which limits the measurement of outcomes. However, further studies may investigate the fact that both participants who scored high in DTS (among other correlations) were exposed to combat.

The veteran participants expressed the depth of their primary experiences in how their values were impacted. For example, J shared how being identified as a Jew by Moslems he worked with in Iraq led to deep concerns for his safety. He also shared the importance of his Jewish identity, which was not indicated in religious salience, specific word usage, or outward expression of religious identity in the Bell Religious Identity Measure. Synthesizing this information with his family history of suffering during the Holocaust and his high score in the avoidance cluster of posttraumatic stress disorder, it is plausible that he has deeply internalized his religious identity, while remaining guarded against future pursuits of meaning and purpose that would lead to public exposure as a Jew.³⁰⁵

³⁰⁵ See other parts of his interview where he discusses his grandmothers' response to Nazi atrocities by suppressing the family Jewish identity.

These are examples of findings resulting from deep listening and comprehensive case conceptualization. They are derived from the subjective nature of expression in the narrative interview process that ascertained J's sense of meaning and religious identity that the individual instruments alone did not.

The narrative interviews of the veterans did identify commonalities in expression related to their sense of self regarding transition from military service as well as their faith. The commonality of expression was based in military language over religious language. For example, the importance of strategizing toward goals in various stages of life and expressing worldview through an attitude similar to sense of responsibility that is impressed on servicemembers was emphasized more than their roles and sense of self in their religious institutions. To be sure, when asked to self-identify religiously in the Bell Religious Identity Measure, choosing religious words as a means of self-expression was a struggle, particularly among those who scored high in the Davidson Trauma Scale. The more symptoms of trauma, the less they utilized religious wording in the measure. This is also a search for meaning: "To be consistent with the identity formation literature, in the case of meaning achievement, the implication is that people have searched in the past, although they may or may not still be searching for meaning."³⁰⁶ This was consistent with the interviews in this study. All of the participants displayed a stronger sense of identity from their past military experience than their religious experiences while still sustaining a strong sense of meaning from their religious practice. The following quote is an example:

J correlates his sense of identity to include his high intelligence as demonstrated through military service based upon his military entrance test score and the jobs he qualified for. In the interview, he did not express an acknowledgment to, "The fear of the LORD [as]

³⁰⁶ Michael Steger, Patricia Frazier, Shigehiro Oishi, and Matthew Kaler, "The Meaning in Life Questionnaire: Assessing the Presence of and Search for Meaning in Life," *Journal of Counseling Psychology* 53, no. 1 (2006): 90.

the beginning of knowledge (Pr 1:7).” However, he did exemplify that, “those who find wisdom and understanding are blessed (Pr 3:13).” He sees himself as special, or even gifted, and good at his job (He is proud of his physical and intellectual capabilities, like marksmanship and math, because of the difficulty in joining the Marine Corps).³⁰⁷

While current and intended future pursuit of meaning and purpose varied, there was also a consistent observation with the two veterans who had been exposed to combat and that of the narrative interview study referred to in earlier chapters in context of bullying.³⁰⁸ A notable point in that research was that each subject (a former victim of violence) developed a sense of meaning of the experience as a means of adjustment. The meanings themselves were unique to each person, while the process was similar. Powell, et al., explain:

This design moved beyond evaluating isolated individuals’ perceptions of bullying and instead encompassed and ‘focus[ed] on the role of socially shared linguistic resources drawn upon to construct bullying.’ This represents a novel approach to addressing cultural norms and similarities in thought systems among students. Research on bullying typically identifies conflicting information between attitudes and actual observed behavior of victims and bullies.³⁰⁹

In this study of veterans, the linguistic analysis comes from evaluating the ethnographic perspective of military culture and the usage of the Bell study on religious wording. Overall, the two veterans who talked significantly about exposure to violence in combat zones also manifested less outward expression of religious identity, while the veteran who did not indicate exposure to combat manifested more outward expression of religious identity.

The narrative interviews demonstrated where engagement of deep listening and comprehensive case conceptualization reveal deep religious beliefs and values of participants

³⁰⁷ See page 143.

³⁰⁸ Heather Powell, Stephanie Mihalas, Anthony Onwuegbuzie, Shannon Suldo, and Christine Daley, “Mixed Methods Research in School Psychology: A Mixed Methods Investigation of Trends in the Literature,” *Psychology in the Schools*, 45, no. 4 (2008): 291-309

³⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, 135.

that the instruments were not able to identify. The synthesis process revealed in part that the presence of trauma complicated expressions and interest of religious values and identity as opposed to negating them, such as sometimes indicated in the quantitative measurements. Such topics may be considered areas of vulnerability at times and participants may not be willing to share, or even guard against such transparency when undergoing surveys. While the primary researcher is attempting to build a case for addressing these dynamics (which may also include moral injury) through the environment of Messianic Judaism, the findings thus far indicate that spirituality in general is impactful.

While the research sought specific insights to the “middle way” of Messianic Judaism, the nature of the movement served as a catalyst in the transition journey of M, from Catholicism, to Messianic Judaism, to Orthodox Judaism. For J and S, Messianic Judaism did provide a basis of transition in which they have remained. Both of them have found Messianic Judaism as a reconciliation of their Jewish heritage and their faith in Yeshua. While this research tried to emphasize the theological benefits of a Jewish Messiah correlated to veterans as a warrior class of people, the real correlations appear more nuanced. Their affinity toward Messianic Judaism manifested in the narratives as more individualized. Their references to Yeshua were contemplations of a private and intimate nature rather than theological manifestations of a warrior archetype Messiah to relate with. J’s encounters with God in Iraq were expressed with an understanding that his responsibilities there carried additional burden of being a Jew in Muslim territory, and that God was keenly aware of the importance of that. S expressed a different perspective of the same thing, which is that being a Jew is a responsibility of being “set apart.” S’s circumstance in this regard was expressed when he stated during narrative interview that Messianic Judaism is “not for everybody” and “that’s okay.”

Discussion of Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q)

This study and further studies with veterans in religious circles may advance the study of meaning in general. The developers of the Meaning in Life Questionnaire contend, “Future research, using the MLQ as an index of meaning in life, should endeavor to identify the necessary constituents and precursors to developing meaning in life, and the bounds of its content space.”³¹⁰ This study attempted to do that by observation of value systems among veterans, and their involvement in Messianic religious identity, which is a structure similar to a mixed methods study in school psychology by Powell.³¹¹ Measuring outcomes for meaning in the participants required a definition of meaning as described by military culture. This was an underlying theme throughout the research process, hypothesizing that meaning among veterans is largely derived from a *sense* of purpose equal to their *significance* of purpose during their military service based on the following definition. Certainly, this is not different than non-veterans as validation studies for the ML-Q did not isolate veterans from non-veterans, “The definition of meaning in life varies throughout the field, ranging from coherence in one’s life to goal directedness or purposefulness to the ontological significance of life from the point of view of the experiencing individual.”³¹²

Awareness of purpose (or lack of it) did remain significant in the research among the participants while the application of it appeared to reflect on their scores in the ML-Q. A stronger interest in or future pursuit of meaning in their lives was commensurate with the coherence of their future goals. For example, S described a consistently coherent sense of

³¹⁰ Steger, Frazier, Oishi, and Kaler, “The Meaning in Life Questionnaire,” 90.

³¹¹ Ibid., 85.

³¹² Steger, Frazier, Oishi, and Kaler, “The Meaning in Life Questionnaire,” 80.

purpose through involvement with family and leading others in goal-directed teamwork (depicted in qualitative analysis) that was commensurate with high scores in presence and search for meaning (depicted in quantitative analysis). J and M scored low in presence and search for meaning along with more ambiguous expressions of their sense of purpose after military service.³¹³ While significant effort was placed in seeking a meaning within the interviews, the ambiguity of J and M regarding meaning may also correlate with high Davidson Trauma Survey scores as indicated throughout chapters four, five and six. Overall, there seemed to be significantly less interest in J and M's pursuits of meaning and purpose compared to S. Further study may increase understanding between the impact of trauma upon the pursuit of meaning and purpose. As indicated throughout this study, ethnographic understanding of purpose in military and veteran culture is substantial, therefore indicating the importance of it in spite of a veteran's lack of pursuit of it.

Despite these differences in definitions of, and routes to, meaning in life, theorists uniformly regard meaning as crucial. Meaningful living has been directly equated with authentic living, and in eudaimonic theories of well-being, which focus on personal growth and psychological strengths beyond pleasant affect, meaning is important, whether as a critical component or as a result of maximizing one's potentials.³¹⁴

The participant's sense of presence and pursuit of meaning (ML-Q), while providing some insight to the importance of meaning (narrative), were similar to each other. Comparing participants internal sense of identity (narrative) correlate with intrinsic and extrinsic religious identity in the Bell Religious Identity Measure.

³¹³ Ibid., 81.

³¹⁴ Ibid., 80-81.

Instrument outcomes were cross-checked with the interview analysis based on specific components of each. These would be sense of meaning in military and religious culture as derived from narrative analyses, ethnographic correlations between the three researchers, and the instruments. Among the three instruments, Synonymy also exists with the Bell Religious Identity Measure (BRIM) in comparing a participant's internal sense of religious identity with outward engagement in subject's religious traditions, belief and practices. In fact, Steger's validation studies on the Meaning in Life Questionnaire (ML-Q) corroborate directly with the basis of research that the BRIM is built upon, including that of Marica and Erikson.³¹⁵ The latter conclude, "Other examples exist in psychology wherein the search for and the attainment of an identity construct are independent. In his influential articulation of identity formation, Marcia used concepts of exploration and commitment as the axes of a two-dimensional space that describe the stages of identity development."³¹⁶ Arguably, meaning and identity are not the same. For example, traumatic experiences may counter a person's true sense of self. However, the process of identity formation may be impacted by traumatic events that spur a will towards growth.

Status Measure: The Davidson Trauma Survey³¹⁷

Of the three interviews, two gave ultimate indications for a strong presence of posttraumatic stress. Of the three domains of posttraumatic stress disorder (intrusive thoughts/re-experiencing traumatic memories, avoidance and numbing, hyper arousal), both indicated

³¹⁵ Bell, "Religious Identity," 117.

³¹⁶ In other words, the presence of trauma seems to impact every other area of the study. This will be discussed further in the BRIM section.

³¹⁷ Donald Davidson, "The Davidson Trauma Scale," Accessed May 1, 2017, <https://www.pearsonclinical.ca/en/products/product-master/item-172.html>.

strong aspects of “avoidance and numbing).” Further studies seeking to compare avoidance and numbing to veteran’s who affiliate themselves with things spiritual may be worthwhile, particularly given the small sample of participants in this study.

The Davidson Trauma Survey (DTS) appearance in Buro’s Mental Measurement Yearbook and its use as a brief assessment tool in U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs³¹⁸ made it a useful tool for cursory understanding of the presence of posttraumatic stress disorder. Moreover, it provided a strong basis of consideration to the level of impact of trauma within the interviews.³¹⁹ This impact has been commented on in chapter five. Essentially, the presence of trauma in J and M, including the nature of trauma’s manifestation, appears to consistently impact each area of observation among the interviews. High DTS scores are commensurate with low presence and pursuit of meaning, as well as low religious salience and formation, and high religious moratorium. All of these things were not consistent with S, who’s scores were higher in presence and pursuit of meaning, religious salience and formation, and lower in religious moratorium.

These findings call for in-depth consideration of the impact of trauma in veterans, not only within Messianic communities but everywhere. Once again, consideration should be made for the measured outcomes discussed in the paragraph above, and empirical observations made through deep listening and comprehensive case conceptualization. In other words, an observer

³¹⁸ Johnathan Davidson, S.W. Book, J.T. Colket, L.A. Tupler, S. Roth, D. David, M. Hertzberg, T. Mellman, J.C. Beckham, R. Smith, R.M. Davison, R. Katz, and M. Feldman, “Assessment of a New Self-Rating Scale for Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder,” *Psychological Medicine* 27, (1997): 153-160.

³¹⁹ J.R.T. Davidson, M.A. Malik, and J. Travers “The Structured Interview for PTSD: Psychometric Validation for Diagnostic and Statistical Manual- IV Criteria,” *Depression and Anxiety* 5 (1997): 127–129.

may find that considerations for the presence of trauma should be a major factor in the religious practices of the veterans.³²⁰

As observed in J and M, the meaningful (and possibly traumatic) experiences in their military service were more important in their sense of identity than outward expressions of religious identity. Yet, their religious experiences were profound and deeply important to them. Their low scores in religious salience and formation may not identify with corporate identity in a congregational setting.³²¹ Yet, the demonstrated involvement of J and M shows that they bring their deep religious and meaningful military experiences with them to the congregations they are involved with. For a pastor or rabbi attempting to work with a veteran struggling with faith and identity, affiliation with a Messiah who has a warrior mentality and a sacrificial purpose (as depicted in chapter two) may help to mitigate veterans sense of alienation from other congregational members who have not had the same experiences. A paradoxical example of this would be J's depiction of feeling forever close to God because of his life unquestioningly preserved by God in combat. His eye witness of biblical holy sites in Iraq, and encounters with allied Muslims who were certain of J's Jewishness required a conjuring of his defense against these accusations by insisting that he was Christian. Such an assertion was true in the sense that he believed in Messiah Yeshua. By J's account, Yeshua not only preserved his life in harrowing feats of combat, but "disguised" his Jewish identity for protection. Similar depictions are made in Scripture such as Paul's references to Messiah "clothing" his followers in righteousness.

³²⁰ Lars Weisaeth, "The Stressors and the Post-Traumatic Stress Syndrome After an Industrial Disaster, *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica* 355 (1989): 25-37.

³²¹ These expressions in the narratives do not indicate strong bonds with congregational members. Yet, there are indications of a sense of bonding with their Creator similar to the sense of military belonging.

Discussion of Avoidance, and the Nature of Trauma

Two more things regarding avoidance should be discussed. First is further discussion of the high measure of avoidance that is often prevalent in veterans carrying trauma. Second is the nature of trauma. It is suggested that clergy approach such issues with an open mind, in order to recognize the meaning of things as strengths along with the challenges they bring.

The avoidant nature of J manifested in developed coping skills with a high degree of compensation for the avoidance of trauma. For example, the clinician (Johnson) identified J's use of humor as a compensatory skill to suffering trauma. Observing such factors in a congregational setting may indicate presence of trauma but is also a means for interpersonal connection. The internal boundaries of congregational settings should not require the revelation of member's deeply personal challenges. In this case, the compensatory mechanism of humor may be engaged through paradoxical intent. While the veteran uses humor as a means of coping, it can be accepted as a useful and productive means of maintaining a level of congregational interaction that the veteran is comfortable with.

The nature of trauma is complex and should not be considered otherwise. This dissertation makes significant reference to moral injury (often misdiagnosed because of its overlap with PTSD), yet the instrument for measuring the presence of trauma is focused on posttraumatic stress disorder. The acknowledgment of the presence of moral injury is a recent phenomenon in clinical settings, while studies related to posttraumatic stress go back as far as World War I, as demonstrated in chapter three. This researcher suggests that identifying the presence of trauma in members of congregational settings does not mean it is a simple equation to "intellectualize." The presence of moral injury is profound.

Discussion of Bell Religious Identity Measure

The Bell Religious Identity Measure (BRIM) was simple to integrate with the individual case conceptualizations of the study participants and supported themes identified among the three participants, as indicated in previous sections of this chapter and elsewhere.³²² These things in addition to Bell's utilization of Marica's four identity statuses, as discussed in chapter four, in a semi-structured interview format seems to support the ease of use of its outcomes integrated with narrative interview as well as existential and psychological measures in this study.³²³

These practical concepts of BRIM help to ease the integration of its findings into the dissertation's contextual roots. Bell observed, "In Erikson's later writings, his description of the 'I' was one that was often seeking a spiritual identity resource and was hungry for existential purpose."³²⁴

A peculiarity with the outcomes of the BRIM includes participant's low scores of religious salience and formation in spite of significant integration identified. This leaves the study with more questions regarding the reason for this: Was low religious salience a personal preference (intrinsic motivation), result of trauma, or indifference related to military experience? It may also be the underrepresentation of Jewish identity in the measure, based on Bell's report that the original validation study indicated an overrepresentation of Evangelical Christianity.³²⁵

³²² Based on Erikson's theory of human growth and development as well as its basis in the cognitive sciences, the BRIM "shows that religious identity often implicitly functions in individuals in a subconscious fashion."

³²³ David M. Bell, "Religious Identity: Conceptualization and measurement of the religious self." PhD diss., Emory University, 2009.

³²⁴ *Ibid.*, 124.

³²⁵ Regarding construct validity toward Jewish identity, evangelicals Christians are overrepresented Bell's dissertational use of his measure. Subjects who self-reported as Jewish were 6.6%. Among the 43 participants who

Chapter two discusses some of the differences in Jewish and Christian thought and theology and this may play a part in salience scores among participants of this study: “As with existing identity measures, future research will be needed to address construct validity broadly defined, including convergent and discriminant aspects, as well as thorough reliability analysis.”³²⁶

Bell’s research in use of his measure does validate based on religious identity formation. This includes integration correlation where the participants demonstrated some level of inversed relation of diffusion, integration, foreclosure, as well as integration. For the most part, participants did not actively seek to suppress religious integration to their overall identity, which is different from indifference to its pursuit. This also reflected in the interviews where the topic of religious identity (and its values) were not avoided, just certain components of it were, which correlate more closely with the Davidson Trauma Scale cluster of “Avoidance and Numbing.” The possibility of this being a correlation requires further explanation. However, previous discussion citing J as an example of avoidance in relationships and Jewish identity have been discussed in detail elsewhere. This is not to say that avoiding religion strictly indicates the presence of trauma.

Additionally, Bell stated that his measure was well suited for large number studies as opposed to closer examination of individual cases. However, its validity for examining other measures besides demographic, within the context of identity is still valuable: “Although there is a bluntness to such objective measures, I do think that the measure for religious identity will be able to help in large number studies that are looking for statistical significance between

reported as Jewish it is possible that all or some of the 11 who reported as “other” were Messianic, which is not a significant representation of the Messianic Jewish worldview.

³²⁶ Bell, “Religious Identity,” 127-28.

demographics and other measures.”³²⁷ This dissertation is clearly not a “large number study.” Perhaps its more comprehensive approach to small numbers will still prove useful in construct validity of the BRIM.

Further Discussion: Application and conceptual use of BRIM with veterans

Religious identity foreclosure (RIF) in the BRIM is described as achieving a commitment to a religious tradition with its established beliefs and practices (behavior). A veteran-ethnographic perspective of this may be akin to someone who is committed in action to beliefs and practices but is still in an exploratory stage regarding its use of resolving life challenges, which may include identity growth or trauma resolution. While not exclusive to veterans, they may appear fully invested (explicit) but not fully convinced (implicit) of its ability to meet the demands for change in identity or trauma (ontogeny). Religious identity diffusion (RID) is based on recognition that a veteran may not be interested in a religious identity, regardless of a “vestiture” in its tradition and practice. This may be the case with J and M., where personal commitment to the religious community and its beliefs are not correlated with their reliance upon its resources during crisis. Religious identity moratorium (RIM) does not demonstrate a commitment to a religious tradition, and they may either feel some anxiety about their religious identity. These states are all possibilities when one considers the complexity of trauma, or the convoluted nature of sub-cultures in American society

Religious identity integration (RII) may be evident when a veteran integrates all aspects of their identity (e.g., mother, veteran, wife) with that of implicit and explicit expressions of a Messianic believer. For example, S has integrated his past-self, with military status of “veteran,” and a self-reported conclusiveness in the Religious Identity Statuses (RIS_t) domain. He has

³²⁷ Bell, “Religious Identity,” 126.

reflected on his personal use of Messianic Judaism's traditions, beliefs and practices to a point of self-definition. This is reflected in the demonstration of self-esteem, autonomy, and flexibility in his religious practices and beliefs.³²⁸ Bell defines RII further with use of the word transcendence: "Since identity is an integration and balance between self and other, a religious identity is peculiar in that its trajectory, in some religions, is towards transcending the self in some manner."³²⁹ This was fundamentally evident in S, where he acknowledged the impact that congregational involvement had on his management of the uncertainties of military life. It was also evident where his significant history of congregational involvement appeared less important in his planning processes to his next stage of life. When he retires, his faith remains permanently affixed to his sense of identity, but time with family will supersede congregational involvement. In other words, his outward expressions of faith are less important than the quality time with family in his last stage of life, while the importance of his faith remains his primary value.

Toward Conclusion

The mechanics of a culture's psychology is based in a core set of beliefs (a narrative) and in the interaction between those beliefs and the practices that share them and normalize the behaviors. The participant-led narratives created opportunities for "deep listening" as discussed in chapter three. Research in "biblical narrative" marks the difference in perception between people who believe in the Bible and those who do not.³³⁰ All three participants indicated a deep belief in the Bible, regardless of self-perceptions, motivations, and opinions regarding the

³²⁸ Bell, "Religious Identity," 134.

³²⁹ Bell, "Religious Identity," 123.

³³⁰ Kalman Kaplan, "Obedience and Disobedience/Rebellion in Biblical Versus Greek Narratives: Toward a Biblical Psychology," *Pastoral Psychology*, 60, no.5 (March 2011): 659-670.

personal identity of God. Additionally, all three participants indicated another set of beliefs that did not always conflict with biblical principles but seem to be derived from military service (such as having a deep sense of purpose) and were generally positive regarding their service.

An overarching definition of who or what is Jewish is a debate beyond the scope of this paper, but it is a silent undercurrent of it. Some difference between Christianity and Messianic Judaism is not the mutually equivalent importance of the B'rit Chadasha (New Testament) but an unequivocal recognition of the centrality of Torah. An arguably more complex sense of identity in Judaism than Christianity also includes believer's family roles in religious identity, traditions, language, and biblical context. All three of this study's participants acknowledged the important place of Christianity in their personal histories but adhere to a closer sense of identity and purpose related to Judaism, such as the "top down" biblical perspective (big picture first) converse to non-Jewish and evangelical inductive Bible study methods as discussed in chapter three. This is not intended by the primary researcher to decentralize the importance of the Messiah in participants lives but to recognize the systemization of worldview in the participants. Instead of recognizing Messiah first, and observing life through a "Messianic lens," the participations tend to observe the challenges of life first (perhaps a military strategic thought process), then identify the essential role of the Messiah in specific challenges that they are unable to manage alone. The topic of B'rit Chadashah and Yeshua was rarely a main topic of discussion to participants during interview. However, topics were reflected upon within the context of Messianic worldview, which clearly includes B'rit Chadashah and the Messiah. For example, Schutz frequently pointed out how often New Testament concepts were the undercurrent of discussion led by M.

The factor of Yeshua as Messiah (and divine) remained significant throughout the study. For example, M had been raised in a Catholic environment, joined Messianic Judaism due to her Jewish family roots and her quest for knowledge, and as of this writing had converted to a form of Orthodox Judaism. Many aspects of her Catholic background surfaced during her interview, including expressions of faith. M's participation in this study and her migration through Messianic Judaism to Orthodox Judaism may indicate a need for further study in the ethnic aspects of Judaism. It should be noted, however, that her migration out of Messianic Judaism is contrary to J and S, who are also ethnically Jewish.

The intensity of military experience often produces maladaptive behaviors related to trauma responses, suspicion, and pessimism. Thus, clergy can also become bogged down in the struggles and outlooks of fellow veterans and should be careful in balancing deep listening, comprehensive case conceptualization and concurrent professional boundaries. At times, views expressed by veterans may not reflect well on people and institutions around them, whereby other veterans undertake a broader perspective. For example, the historical struggles that veterans have with Veterans Affairs (VA) does not necessarily mean that VA is never a valid resource. Moreover, some veterans had highly traumatic military events exacerbated by problems within their chain-of-command. This is especially common among female veterans who experienced deep betrayal when members of their close-knit units sexually assaulted them, resulting in a diagnosis of Military Sexual Trauma (MST). These types of situations can cause clashes regarding opinions about the military among veterans. Sometimes, veterans "vent" frustrations on a level that will challenge a person's sensibilities. The professional must decide the nature of the venting and whether this is purely an emotional "off-gassing," or if a veteran's

perspective may actually lead to conflict within a congregation. That is not to say that this is the norm, but it does occur, particularly in the presence of trauma and internal struggles of identity.

Implications for Ministry Practice and Recommendations for Implementation

The maturity of faith and life experiences were built-in strengths to the research project for the purpose of mitigating risk. Veterans represent the entire span of well-being and functioning. Sometimes, veterans who gravitate to a congregational setting to meet a need will not be as well prepared to discuss their lives, and particularly traumatic experiences. Procedures were emplaced in this project as a redundant effort to ensure the well-being of the participants. There can also be a misconception that only males see combat, and that combat is the only potential life-altering stressor. Both indicate a bias and may undermine rapport without making the effort to practice “deep listening” as discussed in chapter three. Deep listening will help clergy understand military culture on a surprising level and may reveal unforeseen events in a veteran’s history. Finally, it is important for clergy to temporarily yield the expression of their particular theological bent until they are certain that they will benefit from the efforts of listening deeply. This is not to say that apologetics (or theological defense) is not warranted. However, many veterans have strong reservations about a God who allows the atrocities of war and accuse him of a twisted sense of justice. A veteran is more likely to be open to a “better” perspective after an attempt has been made to appreciate the experiences that make them feel isolated from mainstream society.

Overall Finding of Research Topic

Regarding examination of ethnographic sources for successful transition from military to civilian life among members of the Messianic Jewish Community, all three participants made

substantial use of their involvement in Messianic Judaism. However, it manifested in different ways. J experienced a reconciliation of his faith in Messiah through a Jewish context, based on the importance of his family heritage, and his understanding of God's protection in danger. S also reconciled his faith in Yeshua with Jewish family heritage, but in a more extrinsic formation of outward identity as depicted in the BRIM. M discovered a deeper connection to HaShem in Jewish context as a migration from Catholicism, through Messianic to Orthodox Judaism. The concept of whether these phenomena are beneficial is subjective. Corresponding clergy may or may not consider a migration away from belief in Yeshua as Messiah beneficial. But this does not distract from M's use of her experience in Messianic Judaism as a migration toward a perception of HaShem that she is comfortable with as part of her transition from military service.

The small number of participants was sufficient for preliminary examination of the mixed method analysis. However, further studies are necessary to understand the connection between posttraumatic symptoms, Messianic religious background, military trauma, and meaning making processes. Narrative interview superseded the ability of remaining methods to reveal the importance of religion overall in all three participants. Furthermore, it added definition and explanation to the intrinsic and extrinsic salience factors of religious formation in the BRIM. The BRIM places more significance of extrinsic expressions of religious identity formation as a means of overall religious salience than does the expressions of J and M. However, narrative interview manifested significant experiences in their military service, fused with deep expressions of their faith, about which they are both discrete.

The integration of narrative interview, Meaning in Life- Questionnaire (ML-Q), Davidson Trauma Scale (DTS) and Bell Religious Identity Measure (BRIM) was a complex design that led to information augmented by ethnographic knowledge. Undertones of values were conveyed by participants to the researchers, particularly related to participants faith systems. While BRIM clearly identified participants lacking interest in being recognized in accordance with their Jewish or Messianic Jewish identity, two possibilities exist.

First, the validation study of BRIM overrepresented evangelical Christians. It is possible that an evangelical definition of religious identity contains expressions of faith that do not correlate absent in Judaism. Simply put, “Church life” and “Jewish life” sound different, with different words and even different languages. Second, participants expressions of trust in God derived from life experiences such as combat, or their familial connection to Jewishness could be explored further. Both of these issues indicate possibilities of culture studies in context to faith and identity. However, this may also be related to participant’s experiences in military service deriving a less extrinsic religious salience due to the presence of trauma as indicated in DTS.

Indications for Further Research

The richness of complex data is counterbalanced by the small number of participants. Learning a lot about three participants does not allow for generalized findings. But it is hoped that there are now several more possibilities for further research. Present findings may serve to develop further studies in faith, trauma and identity in Messianic Jewish communities. They may also lead to correlation studies with other types of groups. Longer-term studies may validate or challenge findings in this short-term study in regard to how participants circumstances at the time of the study effect their sense of religious identity, pursuit of purpose and management of trauma.

This study attempted to preserve a significant level of qualitative rigor with a measure of quantitative data. Preservation of ethnographic information based in correlations of warrior culture to God were important to the researcher., In-depth literature review, triangulations of data and the personal experiences of the professionals involved in the research were also important. The study was an attempt to identify important information, but also to provide a system of knowledge that can either be duplicated or practiced with wider variance of rigor in the future. For example, three ethnographic experts may not be necessary for future studies so long as there is in-depth understanding of military culture and consistent practice of deep listening and comprehensive case conceptualization.

Longitudinal studies of religious identity formation could occur with the same participants, which is in line with the Bell study: “Since identity statuses have long been conceived as a developmental phenomenon, there should be a significant association with age in the cross-sectional data although, of course, future longitudinal research is needed to more adequately address the transition from foreclosure to integration.”³³¹

While all three participants demonstrated a deep need for purpose and faith, it seemed to take on a unique function in each of their lives. J was certain of God’s faithfulness to him based on his survival in combat as well as poignant experiences as an ethnic Jew in Iraq, which spurred his faith to seek preservation of life. S noted the stabilizing factor of involvement in Messianic congregations during the destabilizing and transient nature of a military career. Yet M’s distinct experience of moving away from a belief in Yeshua as divine seems to indicate the possibility that biblical principles (Old and New Testament) override a precise understanding of God’s

³³¹ Bell, “Religious Identity,” 128.

extrinsic identity. S also made reference to the decentralized importance of culture and precise context (Messianic Judaism versus Christianity) in regard to universal values (purpose, relationships, stability). This is not conclusive and may not be “good news” to clergy, but important information to know about the belief systems and values of the veterans among them. The participant-led narrative approach yielded these factors and helped to identify areas of avoidance by participants. However, future interviews may call for more structured interviews to seek specifically desired information, with recognition of where participants tend to avoid discussion.

There is a definitive gap in correlation to Messianic Jewish theology and psychology. Future research will benefit greatly from extensive research in correlations of Jewish and Christian theology as well as Jewish psychology and counseling in a pastoral setting. Messianic Jewish theology emphasizes Torah more than Christian theology. And mainstream Jewish theology does not recognize New Testament theology in any way, thus rejecting its Jewishness. Therefore, drawing all of these resources together will add greater detail to theological psychology in a Jewish context. It is hoped that this study helps to improve veterans transition into civilian life in Messianic communities, enhances Messianic life, and provides a basis for further study.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abel, Anna, Adele Hayes, William Henley, and William Kyuken. "Sudden Gains in Cognitive-Behavior Therapy for Treatment-Resistant Depression: Processes of Change." *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology* 84, no. 8 (2016): 726–37.
- Agelopoulos, Georgios. "You Are in the Army Now: An Ethnographic Account of Military Training," paper presented at the *6th Conference of the European Association for Social Anthropology*. Krakow 26 - 29 July 2000. Accessed on June 7, 2018. <https://www.academia.edu/3049702>.
- Ames, Elizabeth. "Messianic Jewish Liturgical Practices." PhD diss., Liberty University, 2014.
- Amos, Annie. "The Parting of the Ways." *Jewish-Christian Relations: Insights and Issues in the Ongoing Jewish-Christian Dialogue*. International Council of Christians and Jews, 2010.
- Armistead-Jehle, Patrick, Scott L. Johnston, Nathaniel G. Wade, and Christofer. J. Ecklund. "Posttraumatic Stress in U.S. Marines: The Role of Unit Cohesion and Combat Exposure." *Journal of Counseling and Development* 89, no. 1 (2011): 81–88.
- Asagba, Rachel Bolaji. "Logotherapeutic Management of Persons with Substance Abuse/Dependence." *Psychologia: An International Journal* 17, no. 1 (2009): 89–98.
- Aslan-Levy, Elyon. "Embracing Aristotle at Yom Kippur." *Tablet Magazine*, 7 (October 2016): Accessed on June 7, 2018. <http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-life-and-religion/213956/embracing-aristotle-at-yom-kippur>.
- Bandura, Albert. "Moral Disengagement in the Perpetration of Inhumanities." *Personality and Social Psychology Review* 3 (1999): 193–209.
- Beekley, A. C., and David M. Watts. "Combat Trauma Experience with the United States Army 102nd Forward Surgical Team in Afghanistan." *The American Journal of Surgery* 187, no. 5 (2004): 652–54.
- Bell, David, "Religious Identity: Conceptualization and Measurement of the Religious Self." PhD diss., Emory university, 2009
- Bell, Kathleen R., Jo Ann Brockway, Jesse R. Fann, Wesley Cole, Jeff St. De Lore, Nigel Bush, Ariel J. Lang, Tessa Hart, Michael Warren, Sureyya Dikmen, Nancy Temkin, Sonia Jain, Rema Raman, and Murray B. Stein. "Concussion Treatment After Combat Trauma: Development of a Telemedicine Based, Problem Solving Intervention for Servicemembers." *Contemporary Clinical Trials* 40 (2015): 54–62.
- Belmont Report: Ethical Principles and Guidelines for the Protection of Human Subjects of Research*. National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research, 1979.

- Belzberg, Howard. "R Adams Cowley, MD: Timing is Everything." *Prehospital and Disaster Medicine* 5, no. 03 (1990): 269–70.
- Bennett, David. "The Nicene Creed: Symbol of the Catholic Faith." *Ancient and Future Catholics Blog*. April 1, 2016. Accessed June 7, 2018. <http://www.ancient-future.net/nicene.html>
- Blackburn, Laura and Gina Owens. "The Effect of Self Efficacy and Meaning in Life on Posttraumatic Stress Disorder and Depression Severity Among Veterans." *Journal of Clinical Psychology* 71, no. 3 (2015): 219–28.
- Bons, Eberhard, Brucker, Ralph and Jan Joosten (eds.). *The Reception of Septuagint Words in Jewish-Hellenistic and Christian Literature*. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, (2014): viii/ 213.
- Boyarin, Daniel. "How Enoch Can Teach us About Jesus." *Early Christianity* 2, no. 1 (2011): 51-76.
- Brooks, Roger. *The Spirit of the Ten Commandments: Shattering the Myth of Rabbinic Legalism*. San Francisco: Harper and Row, 1990.
- Briggs, Charles, Archibald Hodge, Francis Landrey Patton, and Benjamin Breckinridge Warfield, (eds.). *The Presbyterian Review, Volume 4*. New York: Anson D.F. Randolph and Company, 1883.
- Brock, Rita Nagashima. *Moral Injury and Soul Repair*. Fort Worth, TX: The Soul Repair Center for Recovery from Moral Injury, 2013.
- Brock, Rita and Lettini, Gabriella. *Soul Repair: Recovering from Moral Injury after War*. Boston: Beacon Press, 2012.
- Brown, Michael. 1994. "The Issue of the Inspired Text: A Rejoinder to David Bivin." *Mishkan: A Forum on the Gospel and the Jewish People* 1, no. 20: 53- 61.
- Brown, William, Robert Stanilus, Bryan Theis, Jordan Farnsworth, and David Daniels. "The Perfect Storm: Veterans, Culture, and the Criminal Justice System." *Justice Policy Journal* 10, no. 2 (Fall 2013): 1-44.
- Burnet, Stephen. "Martin Luther and Christian Hebraism." in *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Religion*. (September 2016). Accessed June 22, 2018. <http://religion.oxfordre.com/view/10.1093/acrefore/9780199340378.001.0001/acrefore-9780199340378-e-274>.
- Burns, William. *The Scientific Revolution: An Encyclopedia*. Santa Barbara: ABC-CLIO, 2001.
- Bush, Nigel E., Nancy A. Skopp, Russell McCann, and David D. Luxton. "Posttraumatic Growth as Protection Against Suicidal Ideation After Deployment and Combat Exposure." *Military Medicine* 176, no. 11 (2011): 1215–22.

- Butler, Frank K., Jr, John B. Holcomb, Stephen D. Giebner, Norman E. McSwain, and James Bagian. "Tactical Combat Casualty Care 2007: Evolving Concepts and Battlefield Experience." *Military Medicine* 172, no. 11 (2007): 1–19.
- Calhoun, L. G., & Tedeschi, R. G. "The Foundations of Posttraumatic Growth: New Considerations." *Psychological Inquiry* 5, (2004): 93-102.
- Calhoun, Lawrence G., and Richard G. Tedeschi (eds.). *Handbook of Posttraumatic Growth: Research & Practice*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers, 2006.
- Carey, Gregory and Irving Gottesman. "Genes and Antisocial Behavior: Perceived Versus Real Threats to Jurisprudence." *Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics* (2006): 342-51
- Carrola, Paul, and Marilyn Corbin-Burdick. "Counseling Military Veterans: Advocating for Culturally Competent and Holistic Interventions." *Journal of Mental Health Counseling* 37, no. 1 (2015): 1–14.
- Cirillo, V. J. "Two Faces of Death: Fatalities from Disease and Combat in America's Principal Wars, 1775 to Present." *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 51, no. 1 (2008): 121–33.
- Clinton, Timothy, and Ohlschlager, George (Eds.). *Competent Christian Counseling: Foundations and Practice of Compassionate Soul Care, Volume I*. Colorado Springs: WaterBrook Press, 2002.
- Davidson Jonathan., S. Book, J. Colket, L. Tupler, S Roth, D. David, M. Hertzberg, T. Mellman , J.C. Beckham, R. Smith, R.M. Davison, R. Katz, M. Feldman. "Assessment of a New Self-Rating Scale for Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder." *Psychological Medicine* 27, (1997): 153–160.
- Davis, Paul. "'Scripture and Canon': Jewish Liturgy." Class lecture at Gratz College, Melrose Park, Pennsylvania. Winter 2012.
- Department, The. *Warfare Manual*. Department of the Navy. Washington, DC, 1996.
- Descartes, René. *The Correspondence Between Princess Elisabeth of Bohemia and René Descartes*. Translated by Lisa Shapiro. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007.
- Deutsch, Helene. "Ein Fall von Hysterischer Schicksalsneurose." *Psychoanalytische Bewegung*, 2 (1930): 273–84.
- Dillard, Joseph. N.d. *Integral Deep Listening*. Podcast accessed June 7, 2018. <https://www.counseling.org/knowledge-center/podcasts/docs/default-source/aca-podcasts/ht-054-integral-deep-listening>.
- Dresher, Kent D., and David. W. Foy. "When They Come Home: Posttraumatic Stress, Moral Injury, and Spiritual Consequences for Veterans." *Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry*, 28 (2009): 85–102.

- Durham, M., and S. S. N. Webb. "Historical Trauma: A Panoramic Perspective." *The Brown University Child and Adolescent Behavior Letter*, 30 no. 10 (2014): 1-5.
- Dunn, James. "The Messianic Secret in Mark." *Tyndale Bulletin* 21 (1970): 92-117.
- Eckard, Emma and Roxane Dufrene. "Barriers to Mental Health Treatment in the Military." *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 40 (3), No. 1 (2015): 40-55.
- Erikson, Erik, "Identity and the Life Cycle." New York: W.W. Norton, 1959.
- Esperandio, Mary Euto Gomes and Luciana Fernandes Marques. "The Psychology of Religion in Brazil." *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, 25 (2015): 255-271.
- Esposito, John. "Islam: The Straight Path." New York: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Epstein, S. "Unconscious Roots of Hitler's Anti-Semitism." *The Annual of Psychoanalysis* 31 (2003): 47-61.
- Farkash, Teli. "The Return to God During the Holocaust." *Ynetnews.com*, January 2, 2014. Accessed June 7, 2018. <https://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4483080,00.html>.
- Fiala, Brian, Adam Arico, and Shaun Nichols. "On the Psychological Origins of Dualism: Dual-Process Cognition and the Explanatory Gap." in *Creating Consilience: Issues and Case Studies in the Integration of the Sciences and Humanities*. Edited by E. Slingerland and Mark Collard. 88-109. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- Finkel, Asher. *Elijah in Light of Rabbinic and Early Christian Sources: Teshuva Institute Papers*. Seton Hall University: The Institute of Judaeo-Christian Studies, 2011.
- Fischer, John. "Abrahamic Covenant: *Jewish Roots of Christianity I*." Class lecture at St. Petersburg Theological Seminary, St. Petersburg, Florida, Spring 2010.
- Fischer, John. "Covenant, Fulfillment and Judaism in Hebrews." *Evangelical Review of Theology*, 13 (1989): Pages unknown
- Fischer, John. "Paul in his Jewish Context," *Evangelical Quarterly*, LVII no. 3 (July 1985): Pages unknown
- Edward Flannery, quoted in Dennis Prager and Joseph Telushkin, *Why the Jews? The Reason for Antisemitism*. New York: Touchstone, 2003.
- Frankel, Estelle. "Repentance, Psychotherapy, and Healing Through a Jewish Lens." *The American Behavioral Scientist*; 41, (March,1998): 6-42.
- Frankl, Victor. *Man's search for meaning*. Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 2006.
- Frankl, Viktor. *Man's Search for Ultimate Meaning*, New York: Basic Books, 2000.
- Frankl, Victor. *The Unconscious God*. New York: Pocket Books, 1985.

- Frankl, Victor. *The Unheard Cry for Meaning*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1978.
- Frankl, Victor. *The Will to Meaning, Expanded Edition*. New York: Penguin Group, 2014.
- Franklin, M., W. Hintze, M. Hornbostel, S. Smith, C. Manglitz, R. Noftsinger, J. Haider and M. Wilson. *Wounded Warrior Project Survey: Report of Findings*. Rockville, Maryland: Westat, 2013.
- Friedman, Edwin. *Generation to Generation: Family Process in Church and Synagogue*. New York: Guilford Press, 1985.
- Fruchtenbaum, Arnold. "The Quest for a Messianic Theology." *Mishkan: A Forum on the Gospel and the Jewish People*, 2 (1985): 67-68.
- Frydland, Rachmiel. *What the Rabbis Know About the Messiah*. Edited by Elliot Klayman. Columbus, Ohio: Messianic Publishing, 2011.
- Geertz, Clifford. "Thick Description: Toward an Interpretive Theory of Culture." in *The Interpretation of Cultures*. New York: Basic Books, 1973.
- Geller, Shari. "Therapeutic Presence as a Foundation for Relational Depth," In *Relational depth: New Perspectives and Developments*, edited by R. Knox, D. Murphy, S. Wiggins & M. Cooper. 175-184. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2013.
- Gifford, Sanford. "From the Second World War to Vietnam: Historical, Clinical, and Personal Reflections on Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder." *American Imago* 72, no. 1 (2015): 1-26.
- Glannon, Walter. "Depression as a Mind-Body Problem." *Philosophy, Psychiatry & Psychology* 9, no. 3 (2002): 243-54.
- Glover, Edward. *War, Sadism and Pacifism*. London: Allen & Unwinn, 1933.
- Golby, J., L. P. Cohn, and P. D. Feaver. "Thanks for Your Service: Civilian and Veteran Attitudes After Fifteen Years of War." In *Warriors and Citizens*, edited by K. Schake and J. Mattis, 99. Stanford: Hoover Institutional Press, 2016.
- Goldberg, Matthew, S. "Death and Injury Rate of U.S. Military Personnel in Iraq." *Military Medicine* 175, no. 4 (2010): 220-27.
- Gordon, Cyrus H. *Before the Bible: The Common Background of Greek and Hebrew Civilizations*. New York: Harper and Row, 1962.
- Habenicht, Donna J. "The Bible and Psychology." Paper presented at the Symposium on the Bible and Adventist Scholarship, Juan Dolio, Dominican Republic, March 19-26, 2000. Accessed on June 7, 2018. http://fae.adventist.org/essays/26Bcc_305-359.htm.

- Haggbloom, S., R. Warnick, J. Warnick, V. Jones, G. Yarbrough, T. Russell, C. Borecky, R. McGahhey, J. Powell, III, J. Beavers, and E. Mont. "The 100 Most Eminent Psychologists of the 20th Century." *Review of General Psychology* 6, no. 2, (2002): 139–152.
- Hall, Lynn K. *Counseling Military Families: What Mental Health Professionals Need to Know*. New York, NY: Routledge, 2008.
- Harpham, Geoffrey. "Chomsky and the rest of us." a review of *Noam Chomsky: A Life of Dissent*, by Robert F. Barsky. *Salmagundi* 121/122 (Winter 1999): 211-237.
- Harrington, Daniel. "The Old Testament Apocrypha in the Early Church and Today." In *The Canon Debate*, edited by Lee McDonald & James Sanders, 197. Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2002.
- Heinze, Andrew R. "The Americanization of Mussar: Abraham Twerski's Twelve Steps." *Judaism* 48, no. 4 (1999): 450-469.
- Hertz, Joseph (ed.). *The Pentateuch and Haftorahs: Hebrew Text English Translation and Commentary*. London: Soncino Press, 1937.
- Hertzl, Theodor. *The Jewish State*. Translated by Sylvie d'Avigdor. London: Nutt, 1896.
- Holtz, Barry. *Back to the Sources: Reading the Classic Jewish Texts*. Blue Ridge Summit, PA: Summit Books, 1986.
- Horesh, Anot Cohen-Zrihen, Tsachi Ein Dor, and Zahava Solomon. "Stressful Life Events Across the Life Span and Insecure Attachment Following Combat Trauma." *Clinical Social Work Journal* 42, no. 4 (December 2014): 375–84.
- Irving, David. *The War Path: Hitler's Germany, 1933-1939*. London: Papermac, 1983.
- Jackson, Joshua J., Felix Thoemmes, Kathrin Jonkmann, Oliver Lüdtke, and Ulrich Trautwein. "Military Training and Personality Trait Development: Does the Military Make the Man, or Does the Man Make the Military." *Psychology Science* 23, no. 3 (March 2012): 270–77.
- Jeffery, Grant. "Scrolls Mention 'Piercing' of a 'Messiah.'" *Jerusalem Post*, November 16, 1991.
- Jocz, Jacob. "The Jewish-Christian Dialogue: A Theological Assessment." *Mishkan*. Jerusalem: United Christian Council in Israel, 3, 1985.
- Juster, Daniel, and Peter Hocken. *The Messianic Jewish Movement: An Introduction*. Toward Jerusalem Council II, 2004. Accessed June 7, 2018. <http://www.stucom.nl/document/0122uk.pdf>.

- Kaplan, Kalman. "Obedience and Disobedience/Rebellion in Biblical Versus Greek Narratives: Toward a Biblical Psychology." *Pastoral Psychology*, 60, no.5, (March 2011): 659-670.
- Karveit, Magnar. *Rejoice, Dear Zion! Hebrew Construct Phrases with 'Daughter' and 'Virgin' as Nomen Regens*. Berlin/Boston: DeGruyter, 2013.
- Kegan, Robert, *The Evolving Self*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard, 1983.
- Kimelman, Reuven. "The Messiah of the Amidah: A Study in Comparative Messianism." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 116 no. 2 (1997): 313-20.
- Kim, Paul Y., Jeffrey L. Thomas, Joshua E. Wilk, Carl A. Castro, and Charles W. Hoge. "Stigma, Barriers to Care, and Use of Mental Health Services Among Active Duty and National Guard Soldiers After Combat." *Psychiatric Services* 61, no. 6 (June 2010): 582–88.
- Kister, Menahem. "Romans 5:12–21 Against the Background of Torah-Theology and Hebrew Usage." *Harvard Theological Review* 100 no.4 (2007): 391-424.
- Kok, Michael. "Marking a Difference: The Gospel of Mark and the 'Early High Christology' Paradigm." *Journal of the Jesus Movement in its Jewish Setting* 3 (2016): 102-24.
- Kraft, Heidi S. "Rehabilitation and Recovery After Combat Trauma: The New Normal." *Work: Journal of Prevention, Assessment & Rehabilitation* 50, no. 1 (2015): 5–7.
- Kruger, Lisa. "Is There More to the Experience of War Trauma? The Development of Moral Injury and its Impact on Soldiers." *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 2, no. 2 (2014): 136-43.
- Krichiver, Tami "Positive Psychology and the Jewish Holiday Calendar: A Resource Manual for Small Groups." PhD diss., Pepperdine University, 2010.
- Kroenke K., T.W. Strine, R.I. Spitzer, J.B. Williams, J.T. Berry and A.H. Mokdad. "The PHQ-8 as a measure of current depression in the general population." *Journal of Affective Disorders*, 114, no. 1-3 (April 2009): 163-173.
- Krull, Heather, and Oguz Mustafa. *Health and Economic Outcomes in the Alumni of the Wounded Warrior Project*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation, 2014.
- Laryea, Kerri. "A Pedagogy of Deep Listening in e-Learning." *Journal of Conscious Evolution* 1, no. 11 (2014). Accessed June 7, 2018. <http://cejournal.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/06/Deep.pdf>.
- Linehan, Marsha M. *Skills Training Manual for Treating Borderline Personality Disorder*. New York, NY: Guildford, 1993.
- Linenberger, Stephen. "Sources of Altruistic Calling in Orthodox Jewish Communities: A Grounded Theory Ethnography." PhD diss., The University of Nebraska – Lincoln, 2010.

- Litz, Brett T., Nathan Stein, Eileen Delaney, Leslie Lebowitz, William P. Nash, Caroline Silva, and Shira Maguen. "Moral Injury and Moral Repair in War Veterans: A Preliminary Model and Intervention Strategy." *Clinical Psychology Review* 29 (2009): 695–706.
- Lizorkin-Eyzenberg, Eli. *The Jewish Gospel of John: Discovering Jesus, King of All Israel*. Charleston: CreateSpace, 2015.
- Longenecker, Richard. *Paul, Apostle of Liberty*. New York: Harper and Row, 1964.
- Luzzatto, Shraga and Moshe Chaim Silverstein. *Mesillat Yesharim: The Path of the Just*. Nanuet, New York: Feldheim, 1990.
- Macarthur, John. "The Sufficiency of Scripture." *The Masters Seminary Journal*, 15. No. 2 (Fall 2014): 164-70.
- MacDonald, Marvin, Paul Wong, and Daniel Gingras. *Meaning in Life Measures and Development of a Brief Version of the Personal Meaning Profile*, 2010. Accessed June 7, 2018. <http://www.drpaulwong.com/documents/HQM2-chapter17.pdf>.
- MacNutt, Francis. *Healing*. Notre Dame: Ava Maria Press, 1999.
- Maffucci, Jacqueline, and Chantell Frazier. *7TH Annual IAVA Member Survey*. New York, NY: Iraq and Afghanistan Veterans of America, 2015.
- Maguen, Shira, and Brett Litz. "Moral Injury in Veterans of War." *PTSD Research Quarterly* 23, no. 1 (2012): 1–6.
- Maimonides, Moses. *The Book of Knowledge: From the Mishneh Torah of Maimonides*. Jersey City: Ktav Publishing, 1983.
- Mattis, James and Kori Schake. *Warriors and Citizens: American Views of Our Military*. Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 2016.
- Meyer, Jason. *The End of the Law*. Nashville, B&H Publishing, 2009.
- McCranie, W. Edward, and Leon A. Hyer. "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder Symptoms in Korean Conflict and World War II Combat Veterans Seeking Outpatient Treatment." *Journal of Trauma Stress* 13, no. 3 (July 2000): 427–39.
- McDonald, Scott D., Jean C. Beckham, Rajendra A. Morey, and Patrick S. Calhoun. "The validity and diagnostic efficiency of the Davidson Trauma Scale in Military Veterans who have Served Since September 11th, 2001." *Journal of Anxiety Disorders* 23, no. 2 (2009): 247-55.
- McGowan, Michael. "Trauma and Grace: Psychology and Theology in Conversation." *Pastoral Psychology* 58, no. 2 (April 2009): 167-180.
- Miller, Chaim. *Turning Judaism Outwards: A Biography of the Rebbe, Menachem Mendel Schneerson*. Brooklyn: KOL Menachem, 2014.

- Miller, Willa B. "Like an Elephant Pricked by a Thorn: Buddhist Meditation Instructions as a Door to Deep Listening." *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 35 (2015): 15–20.
- Moran, Sena, Eileen J. Burker, and Judy Schmidt. "Posttraumatic Growth and Posttraumatic Stress Disorder in Veterans." *Journal of Rehabilitation* 79, no. 2 (2013): 34–43.
- Nash, William P., Teresa L. Marino Carper, Mary Alice Mills, Teresa Au, Abigail Goldsmith, and Brett T. Litz. "Psychometric Evaluation of the Moral Injury Events Scale." *Military Medicine* 178, no. 6 (2013): 646–52.
- Nelson, Stephanie D. "The Posttraumatic Growth Path: An Emerging Model for Prevention and Treatment of Trauma-Related Behavioral Health Conditions." *Journal of Psychotherapy Integration* 21, no. 1 (March 2011): 1–42
- Nibuya, M., S. Morinobu, and R. Duman. "Regulation of BDNF and trkB mRNA in Rat Brain by Chronic Electroconvulsive Seizure and Antidepressant Drug Treatments." *Journal of Neuroscience* 15 (November 1995): 7539-47
- Nieuwsma, Jason A., Jeffrey E. Rhodes, George L. Jackson, William C. Cantrell, Marian E. Lane, Mark J. Bates, Mark DeKraai, Denise Bulling, Keith Ethridge, Kent D. Drescher, George Fitchett, Wendy N. Tenhula, Glen Milstein, Robert M. Bray, and Keith Meador. "Chaplaincy and Mental Health in the Department of Veterans Affairs and Department of Defense." *Journal of Health Care Chaplaincy* 19, no. 1 (2013): 3–21.
- O'Keefe, Theresa. "Relationships Across the Divide: An Instigator of Transformation." *Studies in Christian-Jewish Relations*, 5 (2010): 1-22. Accessed June 7, 2018. <https://ejournals.bc.edu/ojs/index.php/scjr/issue/view/131/showToc>.
- Office of Policy and Planning. *Department of Veterans Affairs FY 2014–2020 Strategic Plan*. Washington, DC: Department of Veterans Affairs, 2013.
- Office of Veterans Affairs. *Independent Budget Fiscal Year 2013*. Washington, DC: Department of Veterans Affairs, 2013.
- Powell, H., S. Mihalas, A. Onwuegbuzie, S. Suldo, C. Daley. "Mixed Methods Research in School Psychology: A Mixed Methods Investigation of Trends in the Literature." *Psychology in the Schools*. 45, no. 4 (2008): 291-309.
- Powers, Patricia. *Accounting for Judaism in the Study of American Messianic Judaism*. PhD diss., Arizona State University, 2015.
- Price, E., V. Stickley, and E. Prosek. "Fall in Line with Duty: Preparing Counseling Students to Serve the Military Population." *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 3, no. 2 (May-August 2015): 79–92.
- Pritz, Ray. "Joseph of Tiberias: The Legend of a 4th Century Jewish Christian." *Mishkan: A Forum on the Gospel and the Jewish People*, no. 2 (1985): 38-43.

- Privette, Gayle, Stephen Quackenbos, and Charles M. Bundrick. "Preferences for Religious and Nonreligious Counseling and Psychotherapy Psychological Reports." *Psychological Reports* 75 (1994): 539–46.
- Reiber, G. E., L. V. McFarland, S. Hubbard, C. Maynard, D. K. Blough, J. M. Gambel, and Douglas G. Smith. "Servicemembers and Veterans with Major Traumatic Limb Loss from Vietnam War and OIF/OEF Conflicts: Survey Methods, Participants, and Summary Findings." *Journal of Rehabilitation Research and Development* 47, no. 4 (2010): 275–97.
- Resnick, Robert and David Halliday. *Physics, Third Edition*. Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons. 1977.
- Resnick, Russ. "Defining Messianic Judaism - A Commentary." *Kesher: A Journal of Messianic Judaism* no. 17 (March 2004). Accessed June 7, 2018. http://www.kesherjournal.com/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=66&Itemid=
- Robertson, H.C. "Narrative and Peer-to-Peer Approaches in Counseling Military and Veterans: A Review of Current Literature and Practices." *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 3, no. 2 (May-August 2015): 66–78.
- Robertson, Heather C., and Pamela E. Brott. "Male Veterans' Perceptions of Midlife Career Transition and Life Satisfaction: A Study of Military Men Transitioning to the Teaching Profession." *Adulthoodspan* 12, no. 2 (2013): 66–79.
- Robinson, Richard. "Judaism: Current Issues." In *Handbook of Religion: A Christian Engagement with Traditions, Teachings, and Practices: A Christian Engagement with Traditions, Teachings, and Practices*, edited by Terry Muck, Harold Netland and Gerald McDermot, 142. Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2014.
- Rotenberg, Mordechai. "Psychology and Judaism." In *The International Encyclopedia of Judaism*, edited by Jacob Neusner. Leiden and Boston: Brill, 2000.
- Rotenberg, Mordechai. "Psychology and Judaism." In *The International Encyclopedia of Judaism*, edited by J. Neusner, 2002. Boston: Brill Leiden, 2005.
- Rozenfeld, Azriel. "The Heart, the Head, and the Halakah." *New York State Journal of Medicine* (October 1970): 2615.
- Samuels, David W., Louise Meintjes, Ana Maria Ochoa, and Thomas Porcello. "Soundscapes: Toward a Sounded Anthropology." *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 39 (2010): 329–45.
- Schake, Kori, and James Mattis. (eds.). *Warriors and Citizens: American Views of Our Military*. Stanford: Hoover Institutional Press, 2016.
- Schultz, D. and Schultz, S. *A History of Modern Psychology, 5th edition*. San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1992.

- Schmuldt, Laura M., Troyann I. Gentile, Jason S. Bluemlein, John C. Fitch, III, and William R. Sterner. "The War Within: One Soldier's Experience, Several Clinician's Perspectives." *Journal of Military and Government Counseling* 1, no. 1 (January-April 2013): 2–18.
- Schumm, Jeremiah. A., Ellen. M. Koucky, and Alisa Bartel. "Associations Between Perceived Social Reactions to Trauma-Related Experiences with PTSD and Depression Among Veterans Seeking PTSD Treatment." *Journal of Traumatic Stress* 27, no. 1 (2014): 50–57.
- Sieva, J. and A. B. Cohen. "Is Thought–Action Fusion Related to Religiosity: Differences Between Christians and Jews." *Behaviour Research and Therapy* 45 (2007): 829–837.
- Shapiro, Faydra. "Jesus for Jews: The Unique Problem of Messianic Judaism," *Journal of Religion & Society*, 14 (2012). Accessed June 7, 2018.
<http://moses.creighton.edu/jrs/2012/2012-15.pdf>.
- Shaw, Rachel. "Making Sense of Violence: A Study of Narrative Meaning." *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 1 (2004): 131 -151.
- Smith, Calvin L. (ed.) *The Jews, Modern Israel and the New Supersessionism*. Kent, UK: Kings Divinity Press, 2013.
- Smith, Aaron J. "Logotherapy to Treat Substance Abuse as a Result of Military Related PTSD." *Journal of Military and Government Counseling*, 61, no.1 (2013): 61-74.
- Soref, Erez. "Can a Believer Suffer a Psychological Disorder?" *Mishkan: A forum on the Gospel and the Jewish People* 40, no. 2 (2004): 6-13.
- Soref, Erez. "Everlasting Arms: Messianic Counseling." *Mishkan: A forum on the Gospel and the Jewish People* 40, no. 2 (2004): 42-44.
- Stander, V., F. Piercy, D. MacKinnon and K. Helmeke. "Spirituality, Religion and Family Therapy: Competing or Complementary Worlds?" *The American Journal of Family Therapy* 22 (1994): 27- 34.
- Stern, David. *Jewish New Testament Commentary*. Clarksville: Jewish New Testament Publications, 1992.
- Stern, David. *Messianic Jewish Manifesto*. Clarksville, MD: Jewish New Testament Publications, 1991.
- Steger, Michael, P. Frazier, S. Oishi and M. Kaler. "The Meaning in Life Questionnaire: Assessing the Presence of and Search for Meaning in Life." *Journal of Counseling Psychology* 53, no. 1 (2006): 80-93.
- Sun-tzu, and Samuel B. Griffith. *The Art of War*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964.

- Taylor, E. W. "Building Upon the Theoretical Debate: A Critical Review of the Empirical Studies of Mezirow Transformative Learning Theory." *Adult Education Quarterly* 48, no. 1 (1997): 34.
- Tanielian, Terri and Lisa H. Jaycox, (Eds.). *Invisible Wounds of War: Psychological and Cognitive Injuries, Their Consequences, and Services to Assist Recovery*. Santa Monica: Rand, 2008.
- Thomas, Antoine Léonard. *Eloge de Rene Descartes: Discours (1765)*. Whitefish, Montana: Kessinger Publishing, 2010.
- U.S. Department of Veterans Affairs. *Suicide Among Veterans and Other Americans 2001–2014*. Washington, DC: Office of Suicide Prevention, 2016.
- VanderKam, James. *From Revelation to Canon: Studies in the Hebrew Bible and Second Temple Literature*. Leiden: Brill, 1999.
- Viktor Frankl Institute of Logotherapy. *Nineteenth World Congress*. Dallas, TX, 2013. Itinerary accessed June 7, 2018. <http://logotherapyinstitute.org/WorldCongress19.pdf>.
- Weisaeth Lars. "The Stressors and the Post-Traumatic Stress Syndrome After an Industrial Disaster." *Acta Psychiatrica Scandinavica*, 355 (1989): 25-37.
- Whiteside, Derek. "The Prehistory of the Principia." *Notes and Records of the Royal Society of London*, 45, no. 1 (January 1991): 11-61.
- Wright, Nicholas T. "Two Radical Jews: A Review Article of Daniel Boyarin, A Radical Jew: Paul and the Politics of Identity." *Reviews in Religion and Theology* 3 (August 1995), 15–23.
- Xenakis, S. N. "Posttraumatic Stress Disorder: Beyond Best Practices." *Psychoanalytic Psychology* 31, no. 2 (2014): 236–44.
- Yangarber-Hicks, N. "Messianic Believers: Reflections on Identity of a Largely Misunderstood Group." *Journal of Psychology and Theology*, 33, No. 2 (2005): 127-139.
- Zinzow, Heidi M., Thomas W. Britt, Cynthia S. Pury, Mary Ann Raymond, Anna C. McFadden, and Crystal M. Burnette. "Barriers and Facilitators of Mental Health Treatment Seeking Among Active-Duty Army Personnel." *Military Psychology* 25, no. 5 (2013): 514–35.

Appendix



SELF CONSENT

I have been invited to take part in a research study titled: Transition to Civilian Life

This study is being conducted by David Daugherty, who can be contacted at:

904-910-2321/ 18medic@gmail.com

*I understand that **my participation is voluntary** and that I can refuse to participate or stop taking part at any time without giving any reason and without facing any penalty. Additionally, I have the right to request the return, removal, or destruction of any information relating to me or my participation.*

PURPOSE OF STUDY

I understand that the purpose of the study is to examine how a Messianic Jewish military veteran's understanding of his/her relationship with God helps him/her overcome transition to civilian life.

PROCEDURES

I understand that if I volunteer to take part in this study, I will be asked to: participate in three measurements: Davidson Trauma Scale, Meaning in Life Questionnaire, Religious Identity Measure. I will also participate in a narrative interview, deriving the essence of my experiences.

BENEFITS

I understand that the benefits I may gain from participation include a sense of accomplishment, improving the lives of other veterans, and increasing awareness of their communities.

RISKS

I understand that the risks, discomforts, or stresses I may face during participation are considered to be high, by South University Internal Review Board, due to the potential that human subjects may be experiencing psychological deficit.

I may experience intrusive memories of unpleasant past experiences, depression, and anxiety.

CONFIDENTIALITY

I understand that the only people who will know that I am a research subject are members of the research team. No individually-identifiable information about me, or provided by me during the study will be shared with others except when necessary to protect the rights and welfare of myself and others (for example if I am injured and need emergency care, if the provided information concerns suicide, homicide, or child abuse, or if revealing the information is required by law).

FURTHER QUESTIONS

I understand that any further questions that I have, now or during the course of the study, can be directed to the researcher (David Daugherty, M.A.).

Additionally, I understand that questions or problems regarding my rights as a research participant can be addressed to Dr. Jessica Hillyer, Institutional Review Board Director of Compliance and Training, South University, 7700 W. Parmer Ln., Austin, TX 78729; jhillyer@southuniversity.edu; 512-516-8779.

My signature below indicates that the researchers have satisfactorily answered all of my current questions about this study and that I understand the purpose, procedures, benefits, and risks described above. I have also been offered a copy of this form to keep for my own records.

Participant Printed Name

Signature of Participant

Date (mm/dd/yyyy)

Signature of Principal Investigator

Date (mm/dd/yyyy)

David Daugherty
Jacksonville, FL
904-567-6484
Tikkunchaplain@gmail.com

Employment History

- **2018: Executive Director and Chaplain at Tikkun Pastoral Foundation, Inc.**
 - Engaging individual veterans in civilian transition.
 - Research, investigation and development of best practices in service to veterans and families.
 - Program Developer (Veteran Legacy Project)- Coordinating programs and initiatives for systems-oriented, strategic and ethnographic engagement of veterans in pursuit of purpose.
- **2015 – 2017: Veteran and Juvenile Mental Health and Comprehensive Case Management**
 - Provider-Liaison to state justice system involving veterans and juveniles that included program design and management.
 - Advisor to treatment court teams that included judges, prosecution and defense counsel, court administration, Veterans Affairs and community supports.
 - Mental health treatment involving trauma, addiction, depression, traumatic brain injury, personality disorders and family.
 - Comprehensive case management including functional support, community advocacy, education and collaboration.
- **2013 – 2014: Spokesperson at Wounded Warrior Project**
 - Shared my personal story of courage and integrity with the public and describe how Wounded Warrior Project® aided in the recovery process and transition back to civilian life. Trained to organize thoughts, compose presentations and communicate successfully before public audiences such as media, civic organizations, social clubs, and business groups.
 - Workshops in continuing medical education, mental health conferences, law enforcement, colleges and universities.
- **2012 – 2013: Chaplain Resident at Baptist Health Systems**
 - Interfaith professional education for ministry (CPE).
 - Supervised encounters with persons in crisis.
 - Peer and teacher-led professional development.
- **2012: Fellow at The Mission Continues**
 - Internship and project developer in 360 bed homeless shelter including participation on Intake and Inter-Disciplinary Review Teams.
 - Adapted military skills and life experience as leadership potential in community service.
 - Involvement with Peer support groups, intensive outpatient substance use treatment, community college education, Boy Scouts of America, and employee wellness program.

- **2011 – 2012: Sexton at Anglican church**
 - Prepared church for weekly worship events.
 - Kept pace with church culture in support of ministry team.
- **2006 – 2010: Military Medical Instructor and Contractor**
 - Provided lectures and small group instruction for U.S. military and federal employees, first responders and allied forces.
 - Independent duty clinical practice in primary and urgent care, preventive health and medical evacuation.
 - Liaised, advised and trained members of allied governments and non-governmental organizations.
- **1991 – 2008: U.S. Army Special Forces and U.S. Air Force Search and Rescue (PJ)**
 - Experienced instructor, planner, and command briefer, with three combat deployments.
 - Liaised with medical professionals, political leaders, military and law enforcement of allied nations including civic crisis response.
 - Management of medical logistics valued up to \$1M including high-value electronics, and Schedule Controlled medications.
- **1998 – 2001: Paramedic**
- **1988 – 1997: Moving and Construction**

Education

- “Veterans in Messianic Judaism: An Examination of Transition from Military to Civilian Life.” Doctor of Ministry dissertation, South University, 2018
- Master of Arts in Marriage and Family Counseling, Webster University (2013)
- Bachelor of Health Science, Campbell University (2001)
- Applied Suicide Intervention Skills; Mental Health First Aid © Instructor; National Fire Prevention Association Level II Instructor; Current certifications in CPR, Advanced Cardiac Life Support and Prehospital Trauma Life Support.

Community Service

- Ordained Chaplain: International Fellowship of Chaplains (FL); Beth Israel Messianic Synagogue (Prison Ministry to death row inmates, Torah Reader); Kehilat Elohim Messianic Synagogue (Founding member/ Chaplain); Mighty Oaks Warrior Programs Instructor; Hopes and Dreams Riding Facility.
- Veterans Treatment Court Mentor (2013); Veterans Affairs Justice Outreach (2010-14); Homeless Veterans Task Force (2012); Wounded Warrior Project (National Campaign Team, Certified Peer Mentor (2010-12)